

**Khare and Pradhan Respond:** In the preceding Comment, Michel<sup>1</sup> claims that our<sup>2</sup>  $q = -\int d^4x \vec{E} \cdot \vec{B}$  and  $s = \int d^4x (\vec{E}^2 - \vec{B}^2)$  are not Galilean invariant. However, on using the expression in Ref. 2 it is easily seen that  $q$  and  $s$  are invariant under the Galilean transformation  $t \rightarrow t + \tau$ . As an illustration, by following the steps of Ref. 2 we find that under this transformation

$$\begin{aligned} q &\rightarrow a^2 \int_0^\infty k^4 c_k^2 \sin(2k\tau + 2\alpha) dk \int_{-\infty}^\infty \cos(2kt) dt = \frac{1}{2} \pi a^2 [\sin(2k\tau + 2\alpha) k^4 c_k^2]_{k=0} \\ &= \frac{1}{2} \pi a^2 \sin(2\alpha) (k^4 c_k^2)|_{k=0} = q. \end{aligned}$$

In this connection it may be noted that the factor  $\alpha$  in our Letter cannot be transformed away by a time translation because different amounts of such translations would be required for different  $k$  contained in  $\vec{E}$  and  $\vec{B}$ .

With regard to time integration, let it be noted that  $\int_{-\infty}^\infty \sin(2kt) dt = 0$  follows merely from the odd property of the integrand. One can also perform the integration and get

$$\int_{-\infty}^\infty \sin(2kt) dt = \lim_{T \rightarrow \infty} \int_{-T}^{+T} \sin(2kt) dt = \lim_{T \rightarrow \infty} \left[ \frac{\cos(2kt)}{2k} \right]_{-T}^{+T} = 0.$$

Michel's point that nonzero  $\vec{E} \cdot \vec{B}$  is trivially obtained by superposing two propagating waves to form a standing wave is not new. In fact this point has already been noted by Chu and Ohkawa.<sup>3</sup>

Avinash Khare and Trilochan Pradhan  
Institute of Physics, Sachivalaya Marg  
Bhubaneswar-751005, India

Received 16 January 1984

PACS numbers: 03.50.De, 41.10.Hv

<sup>1</sup>F. C. Michel, preceding Comment [Phys. Rev. Lett. **52**, 1351 (1984)].

<sup>2</sup>Avinash Khare and Trilochan Pradhan, Phys. Rev. Lett. **49**, 1227, 1594(E) (1982), and **51**, 1108(E) (1983).

<sup>3</sup>C. Chu and T. Ohkawa, Phys. Rev. Lett. **48**, 837 (1982).