M. Abud and A. Bottino, Nuovo Cimento 51A, 473 (1979); Z. Hioke, Prog. Theor. Phys. 58, 1859 (1977).

⁵S. Weinberg and B.W. Lee, Phys. Rev. Lett. 38, 1237 (1977); Y. Achiman and B. Stech, Phys. Lett. 77B, 384 (1978). These models and those of Ref. 4 specify μ^+ - \overline{M}^0 couplings of Fermi strength with $m_{M^0} \approx 4-5$ GeV/c² and $\mathbf{B}(\overline{\widetilde{M}}^0 \to \mu^+ \mu^- \nu) \approx 0.1 - 0.2$.

 K . W. Rothe and A. M. Wolsky, Nucl. Phys. B10, 241 (1969).

- ⁷A. E. Asratyan et d ., Phys. Lett. 49B, 488 (1974).
- T. Eichten et al., Phys. Lett. $46B$, 281 (1973).
- B. C. Barish et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 32, 1387 (1974).

 10 D. S. Baranov et al., Phys. Lett. 81B, 261 (1979), and Yad. Fiz. 29, 1206 (1979) ISov. J. Nucl. Phys. 29, 622 (1979)l.

 $¹¹D$. Rein, L. M. Sehgal, and P. M. Zerwas, Nucl.</sup> Phys. B138, 85 (1978); Y. Abe and Y. Hoshino, Prog. Theor. Phys. 60, 513 (1978); G. G. Volkov et al., Yad. Fiz. 27, ¹⁶⁰⁸ (1978) [Sov. J. Nucl. Phys. 27, ⁴⁸⁶ (1978) ; A. Bottino and W. Kim, Phys. Rev. D 18, 3172

(1978).

 12 P. C. Bosetti et al., Phys. Lett. 73B, 380 (1978). 13 M. R. Krishnaswamy et al., Phys. Lett. 57B, 105 (1975).

 $¹⁴A$. DeRujula, H. Georgi, and S. L. Glashow, Phys.</sup> Rev. Lett. 35, 628 {1975).

¹⁵J. C. Armitage et al., Nucl. Phys. **B150**, 87 (1979); P. Bhat and P. Murty, Pramana $\overline{10}$, $\overline{115}$ (1978).

 ${}^6\text{B}$. C. Barish et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. 38, 577 (1977); A. Benvenuti et $d\cdot$, Phys. Rev. Lett. 38, 1110 (1977).

 $17R$. M. Barnett and L. N. Chang, Phys. Lett. 72B,

233 (1977); K. Ishikawa, S. Midorikawa, and M. Yoshimura, Prog. Theor. Phys. 59, 227 (1978); V. K. Cung

and C. W. Kim, Phys. Lett. $69B$, 359 (1977) ; C. Albright, J. Smith, and J. A. M. Vermaseren, Phys. Rev. Lett. 38, 1187 (1977); P. Langacker and G. Segre, Phys. Rev. Lett. 39, 259 (1977); C. K. Cung, C. W. Kim, and P. Sikivie, Phys. Rev. ^D 18, 3164 (1978); D. Horn and G. G. Ross, Phys. Lett. 69B, 364 (1977); F. N. Widili and G. C. Chukwumah, Phys. Rev. D 17, 1304 (1978).

 18 D. J. Bechis, C. Y. Chang, and K. H. Lau, Phys. Rev. D 20, 99 (1979); J. Smith, Phys. Lett. 85B, 124 (1979) ; T. Hansl et al., Phys. Lett. 77B, 114 (1978) ; A. Benvenuti et d ., Phys. Rev. Lett. 42, 1024 (1979); T. Hansl et d ., Nucl. Phys. $\underline{B142}$, 381 (1978); C. H. Albright, J. Smith, and J. A. M. Vermaseren, Phys. Rev. D 18, 108 (1978).

 19 W. R. Francis et al., Phys. Rev. Lett. $\underline{38}$, 633 (1977). 20 J. D. Bjorken and C. H. Llewellyn Smith, Phys. Rev. D 7, 887 (1973).

 ${}^{21}J.$ Ellis, in Proceedings of the SLAC Summer Institute on Particle Physics: Weak Interactions-Present and Future, Stanford, California, I978, edited by M. C. Zipf (Stanford Linear Accelerator Center, Stanford, Cal., 1978).

 $22C$. G. Callan and D. G. Gross, Phys. Rev. Lett. 21, 311 (1968).

²³B. A. Gordon et al., Phys. Rev. D 20, 2465 (1979), Table X.

 24 This approximation is an empirical fit to data in S. Stein et al., Phys. Rev. D 12, 1884 (1975).

²⁵The mass range used is approximately 0.34 $m_M \approx m$ $\leqslant m_{\mathbf{M}}^{\dagger}$ 0.

²⁶The contour outlines the region $\sqrt{Q^2} > 3.0$ and $p_{\perp} > 3.44$ $-0.11\sqrt{Q^2}$.

Glueball Spectrum in Extended Quantum Chromodynamics

Y. M. Cho

Max Planck Institut für Physik und Astrophysik, D-8000 Munich, Germany, and Laboratoire de Physique Theorique et Hautes Energies, Universite Paris VI, F-75230 Paris Cedex 5, France^(a) {Received 14 October 1980)

Extended quantum chromodynamics in which the magnetic structure of the color gauge symmetry plays the important role in the dynamics is proposed as a phenomenological theory of the strong interaction. In the one-loop approximation the masses of the scalar and the axial-vector magnetic glueballs are estimated to be around 2.² and 1.5 GeV, and the leading linear trajectory of the 2^{++} electric glueball is estimated to be $\alpha_x(s)$ $\simeq 0.48s(\rm{GeV}^{-2}) + 1.01$. The trajectory is proposed as the Pomeron.

PACS numbers: 14.80.Kx, 12.40.Cc

One of the most challenging problems in contemporary physics is to clarify the physical meaning of quantum chromodynamics (QCD), in particular to obtain the physical spectrum of the theory. To resolve this problem we have recently constructed the extended gauge theory, or the gauge theory in the large,¹ in which the magnetical gauge theory in the large,¹ in which the magnetic

structure of the underlying gauge symmetry plays the important role in the dynamics. Based on the group SU(2), the extended theory has been shown to exhibit a manifest confinement of the color. More importantly the theory could tell us how to construct the physical states, in particular the glueball states, and to calculate its mass spectrum. The purpose of this Letter is to discuss some characteristic features of the extended QCD based on the group $SU(3)$, and to present its glueball spectrum. Because of the limitation of the space, the presentation in this Letter will be short and brief. The detailed discussions on the subject will be published separately.²

One of the virtues of the extended QCD is its manifest confinement of the color. The confinement is obtained through the dual Meissner effect, as has been speculated by Nambu' and rect, as has been speculated by Nambu° and
Mandelstam,⁴ among others. Specifically, the confinement mechanism may be summed up by the following three characteristic features 1^2 : First, it allows color xeftection invariance, the 24-element subgroup of SU(3), as the residual symmetry which remains unbroken after the magnetic condensation of the vacuum and thus plays the crucial role for us to construct the actual physical states of the theory. Secondly, there must exist two *magnetic glueballs*, the scalar and the axial-vector collective modes of the vacuum, whose masses determine the scale at which the confinement sets in. Thirdly, any physical state made of the colored constituents should reproduce the string picture⁵ of hadrons in the highenergy limit when one of the constituents is hit with a large momentum.

Another virtue of the extended theory is the fac-'torization of the gauge potential into two parts,¹' the color-confining *binding gluons* and the gaugecovariant valence gluons. The factorization is achieved by the explicit introduction of the topological degrees of the gauge symmetry into the potential. As an immediate consequence one ob-

tains the electric glueballs, the color-singlet bound states of the valence gluons, in the physical spectrum of the theory. Unlike the magnetic glueballs, however, the electric ones form a very rich spectrum which consists of families of linear trajectories. With all these attractive features, the real advantage of the extended theory is that it may allow us to calculate the mass spectrum of the theory. With some simplifying technical assumptions^{1,2} the masses of the scalar and the axial-vector magnetic glueballs are estimated to be around 2.² and 1.⁵ GeV, respectively, in the one-loop approximation. For the electric glueballs, the universal slope α_x' is estimated to be $\alpha_X \simeq 0.54 \alpha'$ ($\alpha' \simeq 0.9$ GeV⁻² is the Regge slope of the $q\bar{q}$ meson trajectories). As for the ground states the mass of the 2^{++} ground state of the leading 5S_2 trajectory made of a valence gluon pair could be estimated to be around 1.4 GeV in a crude nonrelativistic approximation. Granting that, the leading 2^{++} trajectory $\alpha_x(s)$ of the gluon pair may be described by $\alpha_X(s) \approx 0.48s(\text{GeV}^{-2})$ +1.01, which we propose as the Pomeron of the theory.

The extended QCD is different from the conventional one in that the gauge potential is chosen to include not only the local degrees but also the topological (i.e., the magnetic) degrees of the underlying gauge symmetry $explicitly$ into the dynamics. The magnetic structure of the color SU(3) may be described by two internal Killing vectors⁵ (of unit norm), a λ_3 -like octet \hat{m} and its symmetric product (the d product) \hat{m} ' = $\sqrt{3}\hat{m}*\hat{m}$ which is $\lambda_{\rm g}$ -like. With the explicit introduction of \hat{m} and \hat{m}' into the potential one may write the extended potential $\widetilde{\mathtt{B}}_{\mu}$ as 2

$$
\vec{\mathbf{B}}_{\mu} = A_{\mu} \hat{m} + A_{\mu}{}' \hat{m}{}' - (1/g) \hat{m} \times \partial_{\mu} \hat{m} - (1/g) \hat{m}{}' \times \partial_{\mu} \hat{m}{}' + \vec{\mathbf{X}}_{\mu}, \qquad (1)
$$

where $A_\mu = \hat{m} \cdot \overline{B}_\mu$ and $A_\mu' = \hat{m}' \cdot \overline{B}_\mu$ are the λ_3 -like and the λ_3 -like Abelian components of the potential In the magnetic gauge where \hat{m} and \hat{m}' become the space-time independent $\hat{\xi}_3$ and $\hat{\xi}_8$, one obtains²

$$
\vec{B}_{\mu} \to (A_{\mu} + \tilde{C}_{\mu})\hat{\xi}_{3} + (A_{\mu'} + \tilde{C}_{\mu'})\hat{\xi}_{8} + X_{\mu'}\hat{\xi}_{4}
$$
\n(2)

where $(i=1, 2, 4, 5, 6, \text{ and } 7)$, and where the singular "magnetic potentials" \tilde{C}_{μ} and \tilde{C}_{μ}' will now describe the magnetic fields of the colored monopoles,⁵ i.e., the topological singularities of the Killing vectors \hat{m} and \hat{m}' which violate the Bianchi identity. From the potential (1) one finds

$$
\widetilde{\mathbf{X}}_{\mu} = (1/g)(\hat{m} \times D_{\mu} \hat{m} + \hat{m}' \times D_{\mu} \hat{m}'), \tag{3}
$$

which shows that \bar{X}_{μ} is the gauge-covariant piece of the potential. For this reason we will call \bar{X}_{μ} the *valence gluons.* There are three of them (red, blue, and yellow) which may be written as

$$
R_{\mu} = (X_{\mu}^{\ 1} + iX_{\mu}^{\ 2})/\sqrt{2}, \quad B_{\mu} = (X_{\mu}^{\ 6} + iX_{\mu}^{\ 7})/\sqrt{2}, \quad Y_{\mu} = (X_{\mu}^{\ 4} - iX_{\mu}^{\ 5})/\sqrt{2}.
$$
 (4)

303

The rest of the potential will be called the binding gluons since they provide, together with the condensed vacuum, the color confining force as we will see in a moment.

The Lagrangian for the extended QCD may be obtained from the conventional one by replacing its potential with the extended one (1). Introducing the monopole field operators⁶ φ and φ' which create the topological singularities of \hat{m} and \hat{m}' , and its regular magnetic potentials C_u and C_u', one may obtain the following Lagrangian' for the extended QCD in the magnetic gauge

$$
\mathcal{L}_{E} = -\frac{1}{4}F_{\mu\nu}^{2} - \frac{1}{4}F_{\mu\nu}^{2} - \frac{1}{4}H_{\mu\nu}^{*2} - \frac{1}{4}H_{\mu\nu}^{*2} + \bar{r}\gamma^{\mu}[i\partial_{\mu} + \frac{1}{2}g(A_{\mu} + \bar{C}_{\mu}) + (g/2\sqrt{3})(A_{\mu}' + \bar{C}_{\mu}')]r
$$
\n
$$
+ \bar{b}\gamma^{\mu}[i\partial_{\mu} - \frac{1}{2}g(A_{\mu} + \bar{C}_{\mu}) + (g/2\sqrt{3})(A_{\mu}' + \bar{C}_{\mu}')]b + \bar{y}\gamma^{\mu}[i\partial_{\mu} - (g/\sqrt{3})(A_{\mu}' + \bar{C}_{\mu}')]y
$$
\n
$$
- \frac{1}{2}[\partial_{\mu} + i g(A_{\mu} + \bar{C}_{\mu})]R_{\nu} - [\partial_{\nu} + i g(A_{\nu} + \bar{C}_{\nu})]R_{\mu}|^{2}
$$
\n
$$
- \frac{1}{2}[(\partial_{\mu} - i \frac{1}{2}g(A_{\mu} + \bar{C}_{\mu}) + i(\sqrt{3}/2)g(A_{\mu}' + \bar{C}_{\mu}')]B_{\nu} - [\partial_{\nu} - i \frac{1}{2}g(A_{\nu} + \bar{C}_{\nu}) + i(\sqrt{3}/2)g(A_{\nu}' + \bar{C}_{\nu}')]B_{\mu}|^{2}
$$
\n
$$
- \frac{1}{2}[(\partial_{\mu} - i \frac{1}{2}g(A_{\mu} + \bar{C}_{\mu})] - i(\sqrt{3}/2)g(A_{\mu}' + \bar{C}_{\mu}')]Y_{\nu} - [\partial_{\nu} - i \frac{1}{2}g(A_{\nu} + \bar{C}_{\nu}) - i(\sqrt{3}/2)g(A_{\nu}' + \bar{C}_{\nu})]Y_{\mu}|^{2}
$$
\n
$$
+ |[\partial_{\mu} + i(4\pi/g)(\tilde{A}_{\mu} + C_{\mu})] \varphi |^{2} + |[\partial_{\mu} + i(4\pi/g)\sqrt{3}(\tilde{A}_{\mu}' + C_{\mu}')] \varphi' |^{2}
$$

+other interaction terms,

$$
(5)
$$

where ${F}_{\mu\nu}$, ${F}_{\mu\nu}$ ', ${H}_{\mu\nu}$ ', ${H}_{\mu\nu}$ '* are the Abelian field strengths corresponding to the potentials $A_\mu,~A_\mu'$ ', C_{μ} , C_{μ} , and \tilde{A}_{μ} , \tilde{A}_{μ} , \tilde{C}_{μ} , \tilde{C}_{μ} are the singular "dual potentials" of the dual fields $F_{\mu\nu}$, $F_{\mu\nu}$, $F_{\mu\nu}$, $H_{\mu\nu}$, C_{μ} , and H_{μ} , H_{μ} , C_{μ} , C_{μ} are the singular dual potentials of the dual fields $F_{\mu\nu}$, $F_{\mu\nu}$, $F_{\mu\nu}$, $H_{\mu\nu}$, $H_{\mu\nu}$, $F_{\mu\nu}$, $H_{\mu\nu}$, $H_{\mu\nu}$, $T_{\mu\nu}$ and the quar source the Lagrangian (5) is reduced to

$$
\mathfrak{L}(m) = -\frac{1}{4} H_{\mu\nu}^{*2} - \frac{1}{4} H_{\mu\nu}^{\prime*2} + \left[\left[\partial_{\mu} + i (4\pi/g) C_{\mu} \right] \varphi \right]^{2} + \left[\left[\partial_{\mu} + i (4\pi/g) \sqrt{3} C_{\mu}^{\prime} \right] \varphi' \right]^{2} . \tag{6}
$$

Then assuming that the Lagrangian is both ultraviolet finite and infrared unstable, one may obtain in the one-loop approximation the following Coleman-Weinberg-type effective potential

$$
V_{eff} = (24\pi^2/g^4) \left\{ \varphi_0^4 + (\varphi^*\varphi)^2 [2\ln(\varphi^*\varphi/\varphi_0^2) - 1] \right\} + (216\pi^2/g^4) \left\{ \varphi_0^{\prime 4} + (\varphi^{\prime *}\varphi^{\prime})^2 [2\ln(\varphi^{\prime *}\varphi^{\prime}/\varphi_0^{\prime 2}) - 1] \right\},
$$
 (7)

where φ_0 and φ_0' are the vacuum expectation values of the fields φ and φ' . This implies that the theory will create a dynamical condensation of the monopoles to cure its infrared divergences. Once the ry will create a dynamical condensation of the monopoles to cure its infrared divergences. Once the condensation is achieved the dual dynamics of the Lagrangian will ensure the confinement of any col-
ored flux in a finite ored flux in a finite region of space.^{1,2}

The condensation of the vacuum creates the magnetic glueballs, the massive collective modes of the vacuum. At first glance one would expect four such modes, two scalars μ , μ' , and two axial vectors m, m' . The potential (7) fixes their mass ratios as $(\alpha_s = g^2/4\pi)$

$$
\kappa^2 = \mu^2 / m^2 = 3/2\pi \alpha_s , \quad \kappa^{\prime 2} = \mu^{\prime 2} / m^{\prime 2} = 9/2\pi \alpha_s = 3\kappa^2 . \tag{8}
$$

On the other hand once the condensation is assured, one may take a more phenomenological point of view and try the familiar quartic potential'

$$
V_{\rm eff} = (48\pi^2/g^4)\lambda(\varphi^*\varphi - \varphi_0^2)^2 + (432\pi^2/g^4)\lambda'(\varphi^*\varphi' - \varphi_0'^2)^2, \qquad (9)
$$

from which one obtains

$$
\kappa^2 = \frac{\mu^2}{m^2} = \frac{3}{2\pi\alpha_s} \lambda
$$

$$
\kappa'^2 = \frac{\mu'^2}{m'^2} = \frac{9}{2\pi\alpha_s} \lambda' = 3\frac{\lambda'}{\lambda} \kappa^2.
$$
 (10)

Since the mass ratio (8) may be reliable only in the strong-coupling limit, 2,8 in the following we 12y
2,8 _j will use the potential (9) in our calculation of the mass spectrum. Now the masses of the magnetic glueballs can be estimated by evaluating the string ^l tension k_a of the $q\bar{q}$ mesons of the theory

$$
k_{q} = \frac{1}{2 \pi \alpha'} = \gamma_{q} \varphi_{0}^{2} = \frac{\alpha_{s}}{8 \pi} \gamma_{q} m^{2}, \qquad (11)
$$

where γ_a is a dimensionless parameter² which can be calculated from the string solution of the quark pair. Before one calculates the masses, however, it is important to realize that² within the framework of the extended QCD the color electric charge can uniquely be defined only up to the 24-element color-reflection degrees of free-

TABLE I. An estimate of the masses of the magnetic TABLE I glueballs.

cept $\alpha_{\mathbf{x}}(0)$ of the leading 2⁺⁺ glueball trajector An estimate of the slope α_{χ} ' and the inter-

dom, even after one has chosen one's own ma netic gauge. The color reflection invarianc netic gauge. The color reflection
which is obtained from the fact^{1,2} to the Weyl reflection tells us that the two modes Abelian magnetic charge is well defined only up μ and μ' (and also m and m') sh nd the same mode $\tilde{\mu}$ (and $\tilde{m,}\,$ res \log is the interest of ϵ is the same invariance ing² $\overline{\mu} = \mu = \mu'$ and $\overline{m} = m = m'$, or equivalently

$$
\varphi_0' = (1/\sqrt{3}) \varphi_0, \quad \lambda' = \frac{1}{3} \lambda. \tag{12}
$$

With this one can calculate γ_q (and consequently estimate the masses uniquely, of course<mark>,</mark> it is $\bar{\mu}$ and \bar{m}) as a function of α_s for a fixed λ . To necessary to know the magnitude⁹ of α_s . If we as sume that α_s may be fixed by the running couplin and \overline{m} . $\overline{\alpha}$ at $s = \overline{\mu m}$ we obtain¹⁰ Table I for the masses $\overline{\mu}$

The physical spectrum of the ext let bound states of the valence gluons There must exist (at least) three types of electric There must exist (at least) three types of elec
glueballs,¹¹ one made of the valence gluon pair and two others made of the symmetric produc (the d product) as well as the antisymmetric product (the f product) of three valent of which forms a family of linear trajectories of

FIG. 1. Ratio of string tensions, $R = k_q/k_x$, for fixed λ as a function of α_s .

its own. All the three types, moreover, will have one and the same universal slope α_{x} . The string ension $k_{\textbf{\textit{x}}}$ of these glueballs may be written as

$$
k_{X} = \frac{1}{2\pi\alpha_{X}^{\prime}} = \gamma_{X} \varphi_{0}^{2} = \frac{\alpha_{s}}{8\pi} \gamma_{X} m^{2}.
$$
 (13)

Then with the assumption (12) the ratio between ing tensions $R = k_q/k_x$ m hown in Fig. 1. As for the ground states, the ed² as a function of α_s for a fixed λ , which is mass of the 2^{++} ground state of the $5S_2$ -glueball trajectory made of the gluon pair may be estimated to be 1.43 GeV (for $\lambda = 1$) in a simple-mind- $\frac{1}{2}$ and nonrelativistic approximation.¹ glueball trajectory $\alpha_X(s)$ may be described by ic approximation. If we take the
ation seriously, the leading 2^{++}

$$
\alpha_X(s) = \alpha_X's + \alpha_X(0),\tag{14}
$$

where α_{x}' and $\alpha_{x}(0)$ are given by² Table II.

e result strongly suggests that the 5S_2 trajectory could be identified as the Pomeron trajector of the theory. If so we may indee lid dynamical basis for the twobitd dynamical basis for the two-component data $lity^{12}$ of strong interaction in the extended QCD

Admittedly the extended QCD in its present form is far from complete. In fac unsettled problems of its $own^{1,2}$ Nonetheless the e viewed a step forward in our <mark>ef</mark>fort to understand the dynamical basis of strong interaction.

It is a great pleasure to thank H. Kühn, D. Maiiscussions, and S. Schlieder, W. Zimmerma son, R. Peccei, and E. Seiler for many critical and S. O. Ahn for the constant encouragement.

^(a)Present address: Laboratoire de Physique Theoret-Paris Cedex 5, France. ique et Hautes Energies, Université Paris VI, F-75230

¹Y. M. Cho, Phys. Rev. D 21, 1080 (1980); Max Planck Institut Report No. MPI-PAE/PTh 12/79, 1979 (unpublished) .

 $2Y$. M. Cho, Max Planck Institut Report No. MPI-PAE/ PTh $14/80$, 1980 (unpublished); Y. M. Cho and W. Weinzierl, Max Planck Institute Report No. MPI-PAE/PTh 15/80, 1980 (unpublished) .

 ${}^{3}Y$. Nambu, Phys. Rev. D 10, 4262 (1974); J. Kogut and L. Susskind, Phys. Rev. D 11, 395 (1975).

⁴S. Mandelstam, Phys. Rev. D₁₉, 2391 (1979);

G. 't Hooft, Nucl. Phys. 13138, 1 (1978).

 ${}^{5}Y.$ M. Cho, Phys. Rev. Lett. $44, 1115$ (1980).

 6 The monopole field operator was first considered by 't Hooft in $(2+1)$ -dimensional QCD and later by Mandelstam in $(3+1)$ -dimensional QCD. See Ref. 4.

 T For the precise meaning of the singular objects, see the discussions in Befs. 1 and 2. These objects, however, will become irrelevant in the following discussions.

 8 S. Coleman and E. Weinberg, Phys. Rev. D 7, 1880 (1973).

⁹Notice that after the creation of the mass gap, α_s becomes a fixed number which can, in principle, be obtained directly from the experiment by measuring the coupling strength between the magnetic glueballs. '

¹⁰Here we have used the charmonium data $\overline{\alpha} \approx 0.2$ at $s = 10 \text{ GeV}^2$. The recent TASSO data $\overline{\alpha} \approx 0.19$ at $s = 800$ GeV² yields similar results. See Ref. 2 for the details.

 11 The phenomenological aspects of these glueballs have been discussed before. See, e.g., H. Fritzsch and P. Minkowski, Nuovo Cimento 30A, 393 (1975); B. L. Jaffe and K. Johnson, Phys. Lett. 60B, 201 (1976); J. Coyne, P. Fishbane, and S. Meshkov, Phys. Lett. 91B, 258 (1980).

 $\overline{^{12}P}$. G. O. Freund, Phys. Rev. Lett. 20 , 235 (1968); H. Harari, Phys. Rev. Lett. 20, 1385 (1968).