SOME RIGOROUS INEQUALITIES SATISFIED BY THE FERROMAGNETIC ISING MODEL IN A MAGNETIC FIELD*

George A. Baker, Jr.

Applied Mathematics Department, Brookhaven National Laboratory, Upton, New York (Received 8 February 1968)

We show in this Letter that for the ferromagnetic Ising model, a function closely related to the magnetization, when considered as a function of the hyperbolic tangent of the magnetic field, has a very special structure. This structure enables us to prove two sorts of related inequalities. One type, Eq. (11), of interest to theorists, shows that the critical-index gap parameters, Δ_i , form a nondecreasing sequence. The other type, of interest to experimentalists, is that every difference (not derivative) of the function we introduce has a fixed sign as a function of magnetic field. We have also checked these relations on all the available data for the spin- $\frac{1}{2}$ Heisenberg model and find agreement.

Our starting point is a recent rearrangement¹ of the results of Yang and Lee² for the free energy F of the ferromagnetic Ising model:

$$F/kT = -mH/kT - \int_0^1 \ln[(1-\mu)^2 + 4\mu y] d\varphi(y), \quad (1)$$

where $d\varphi(y) \ge 0$, *m* is the magnetic moment per spin, *H* the magnetic field, *k* Boltzman's constant, *T* the absolute temperature, and

$$\mu = \exp(-2mH/kT). \tag{2}$$

We shall rewrite this expression in terms of

$$\tau = \tanh(mH/kT) \tag{3}$$

as

$$F/kT = \frac{1}{2} \ln[\frac{1}{4}(1-\tau^2)] - \int_0^1 \ln[\tau^2(1-y) + y] d\varphi(y), \quad (4)$$

where² use is made of

$$\int_0^1 d\varphi(y) = \frac{1}{2}.$$

Now, if we substitute $\omega = y^{-1} - 1$, we obtain

$$\frac{F}{kT} = \frac{1}{2} \ln[\frac{1}{4}(1-\tau^2)] - \int_0^1 \ln y d\varphi(y) - \int_0^\infty \ln(1+\tau^2\omega) d\varphi\left(\frac{1}{1+\omega}\right).$$
(5)

Hence, differentiating with respect to the magnetic field, we obtain the reduced magnetization per spin as

$$\frac{I}{mN} = \tau + \int_0^\infty \frac{2\tau(1-\tau^2)\omega}{1+\tau^2\omega} d\varphi\left(\frac{1}{1+\omega}\right),\tag{6}$$

or the function

$$G(\tau^2) = \frac{(I/mN) - \tau}{\tau(1 - \tau^2)} = \int_0^\infty \frac{d\psi(\omega)}{1 + \tau^2\omega},\tag{7}$$

where $d\psi \ge 0$. We remark that for $T > T_c$, the critical temperature, the upper limit of integration is less than infinity, but for $T \le T_c$ it is infinite. We note that $G(0) = \infty$ for $T \le T_c$.

The consequence of form (7) is that $G(\tau^2)$ is a series of Stieltjes.³ This fact means that if we expand

$$G(\tau^2) = G_0(T) - G_1(T)\tau^2 + G_2(T)\tau^4 - \cdots,$$
(8)

then

$$D(m,n) = \begin{vmatrix} G_{m} & G_{m+1} & \cdots & G_{m+n} \\ G_{m+1} & G_{m+2} & \vdots \\ \vdots & & \ddots \\ G_{m+n} & \cdots & G_{m+2n} \end{vmatrix} \ge 0.$$
(9)

It is easy to show that the divergence of the G_i at $T = T_c$ is the same as the corresponding (one power of τ or H higher) coefficients in the magnetization. Following the notation of Baker, Gilbert, Eve, and Rushbrooke⁴ ($\gamma_i - \gamma_{i-1} = 2\Delta$ in the notation of Fisher⁵),

$$G_m(\tau^2, T) \propto (T - T_c)^{-\gamma_m}, \quad T \to T_c^+.$$
 (10)

It follows at once from (9) for n=1 that the critical exponents obey

$$\gamma_{i+1} - 2\gamma_i + \gamma_{i-1} \ge 0 \tag{11}$$

or that the γ_i increase at least linearly with *i*. These relations are obeyed in every known case within calculational error. See Fisher⁵ for a review. The linear relation

$$\gamma_i = \gamma_0 + 2\Delta i \tag{12}$$

required by the scaling laws⁶ is allowed by (11). We have also tested all available Heisenberg

n 0 1 2 Simple Cubic Lattice 1 3.0 0 0 2 6.0 16.5 0 3 11.0 93.5 109.5 4 20.625 364.5 1085.625 5 39.025 1201.75 6631.5 6 68.777083333 3575.7125 31861.49375 7 119.42976190 9860.1833333 131563.225 8 216.16227679 25661.864211 487668.51942 9 387.19383267 0 0 10 658.34153977 5 2661.864211 487668.51942 9 387.19383267 0 0 0 1 4.0 0 0 0 2 12.0 30.0 0 0 3 34.6666666667 250.0 274.0 4 4 95.833333333 1460.66666667 3970.5 5 5 262.7 7193.0 3	3 0 0 797.625 11514.75 96787.8125 615203.4375 3265575.2925 0 0 0 2759.5 58041.0 716544.91667 6716153.4833 52696392.526
Simple Cubic Lattice 1 3.0 0 0 2 6.0 16.5 0 3 11.0 93.5 109.5 4 20.625 364.5 1085.625 5 39.025 1201.75 6631.5 6 68.777083333 3575.7125 31861.49375 7 119.42976190 9860.1833333 131563.225 8 216.16227679 25661.864211 487668.51942 9 387.19383267 0 0 10 658.34153977 5 262.7 7193.0 0 1 4.0 0 0 0 2 12.0 30.0 0 0 3 34.666666667 250.0 274.0 4 95.833333333 1460.66666667 3970.5 5 262.7 7193.0 35853.0 6 708.04166667 31871.133333 255427.325 7 1893.2896825 131144.06111 1565813.8833 8 5012.1086310 510344.67827 8627298.6205	0 0 0 797.625 11514.75 96787.8125 615203.4375 3265575.2925 0 0 0 2759.5 58041.0 716544.91667 6716153.4833 52696392.526
1 3.0 0 0 2 6.0 16.5 0 3 11.0 93.5 109.5 4 20.625 364.5 1085.625 5 39.025 1201.75 6631.5 6 68.777083333 3575.7125 31861.49375 7 119.42976190 9860.1833333 131563.225 8 216.16227679 25661.864211 487668.51942 9 387.19383267 0 0 10 658.34153977 5602.0 274.0 4 95.83333333 1460.66666667 3970.5 5 262.7 7193.0 35853.0 6 708.04166667 31871.133333 255427.325 7 1893.2896825 131144.06111 1565813.8833 8 5012.1086310 510344.67827 8627298.6205 9 13235.513272 10 34737.965232 Face-Centered Cubic Lattice 1 6.0 0 0	0 0 797.625 11514.75 96787.8125 615203.4375 3265575.2925 0 0 2759.5 58041.0 716544.91667 6716153.4833 52696392.526
2 6.0 16.5 0 3 11.0 93.5 109.5 4 20.625 364.5 1085.625 5 39.025 1201.75 6631.5 6 68.777083333 3575.7125 31861.49375 7 119.42976190 9860.1833333 131563.225 8 216.16227679 25661.864211 487668.51942 9 387.19383267 10 658.34153977 Body-Centered Cubic Lattice 1 4.0 0 0 0 2 12.0 30.0 0 3 34.6666666667 250.0 274.0 4 95.8333333 1460.66666667 3970.5 5 262.7 7193.0 35853.0 6 708.04166667 31871.133333 255427.325 7 1893.2896825 131144.06111 1565813.8833 8 5012.1086310 510344.67827 8627298.6205 9 13235.513272 10 34737.965232 Face-Centered Cubic Lattice 1 6.0 0 0 0	0 0 797.625 11514.75 96787.8125 615203.4375 3265575.2925 0 0 2759.5 58041.0 716544.91667 6716153.4833 52696392.526
3 11.0 93.5 109.5 4 20.625 364.5 1085.625 5 39.025 1201.75 6631.5 6 68.777083333 3575.7125 31861.49375 7 119.42976190 9860.1833333 131563.225 8 216.16227679 25661.864211 487668.51942 9 387.19383267 0 0 10 658.34153977 658.34153977 0 Body-Centered Cubic Lattice 1 4.0 0 0 2 12.0 30.0 0 3 34.666666667 250.0 274.0 4 95.83333333 1460.66666667 3970.5 5 262.7 7193.0 35853.0 6 708.04166667 31871.133333 255427.325 7 1893.2896825 131144.06111 1565813.8833 8 5012.1086310 510344.67827 8627298.6205 9 13235.513272 10 34737.965232 Face-Centered Cubic Lattice 1 6.0	0 797.625 11514.75 96787.8125 615203.4375 3265575.2925 0 0 2759.5 58041.0 716544.91667 6716153.4833 52696392.526
4 20.625 364.5 1085.625 5 39.025 1201.75 6631.5 6 68.777083333 3575.7125 31861.49375 7 119.42976190 9860.1833333 131563.225 8 216.16227679 25661.864211 487668.51942 9 387.19383267 0 0 0 658.34153977 0 0 1 4.0 0 0 0 2 12.0 30.0 0 0 3 34.666666667 250.0 274.0 4 4 95.83333333 1460.66666667 3970.5 5 5 262.7 7193.0 35853.0 6 6 708.04166667 31871.133333 255427.325 13144.06111 1565813.8833 8 5012.1086310 510344.67827 8627298.6205 9 13235.513272 10 0 34737.965232 Face-Centered Cubic Lattice 1 6.0 0 0 0	797.625 11514.75 96787.8125 615203.4375 3265575.2925 0 0 2759.5 58041.0 716544.91667 6716153.4833 52696392.526
5 39.025 1201.75 6631.5 6 68.777083333 3575.7125 31861.49375 7 119.42976190 9860.1833333 131563.225 8 216.16227679 25661.864211 487668.51942 9 387.19383267 0 0 0 658.34153977 Body-Centered Cubic Lattice 1 4.0 0 0 2 12.0 30.0 0 3 34.6666666667 250.0 274.0 4 95.83333333 1460.66666667 3970.5 5 262.7 7193.0 35853.0 6 708.04166667 31871.133333 255427.325 7 1893.2896825 131144.06111 1565813.8833 8 5012.1086310 510344.67827 8627298.6205 9 13235.513272 10 34737.965232 Face-Centered Cubic Lattice 1 6.0 0 0	11514.75 96787.8125 615203.4375 3265575.2925 0 0 0 2759.5 58041.0 716544.91667 6716153.4833 52696392.526
6 68.777083333 3575.7125 31861.49375 7 119.42976190 9860.1833333 131563.225 8 216.16227679 25661.864211 487668.51942 9 387.19383267 10 658.34153977 Body-Centered Cubic Lattice 1 4.0 0 0 0 2 12.0 30.0 0 3 34.6666666667 250.0 274.0 4 95.83333333 1460.66666667 3970.5 5 262.7 7193.0 35853.0 6 708.04166667 31871.133333 255427.325 7 1893.2896825 131144.06111 1565813.8833 8 5012.1086310 510344.67827 8627298.6205 9 13235.513272 10 34737.965232 Face-Centered Cubic Lattice 1 6.0 0 0 0	96787.8125 615203.4375 3265575.2925 0 0 2759.5 58041.0 716544.91667 6716153.4833 52696392.526
7 119.42976190 9860.1833333 131563.225 8 216.16227679 25661.864211 487668.51942 9 387.19383267 25661.864211 487668.51942 10 658.34153977 Body-Centered Cubic Lattice 1 4.0 0 0 2 12.0 30.0 0 3 34.6666666667 250.0 274.0 4 95.83333333 1460.66666667 3970.5 5 262.7 7193.0 35853.0 6 708.04166667 31871.133333 255427.325 7 1893.2896825 131144.06111 1565813.8833 8 5012.1086310 510344.67827 8627298.6205 9 13235.513272 10 34737.965232 Face-Centered Cubic Lattice 1 6.0 0 0	615203.4375 3265575.2925 0 0 2759.5 58041.0 716544.91667 6716153.4833 52696392.526
8 216.16227679 25661.864211 487668.51942 9 387.19383267	0 0 0 2759.5 58041.0 716544.91667 6716153.4833 52696392.526
9 387.19383267 10 658.34153977 Body-Centered Cubic Lattice 1 4.0 0 0 2 12.0 30.0 0 3 34.6666666667 250.0 274.0 4 95.83333333 1460.66666667 3970.5 5 262.7 7193.0 35853.0 6 708.04166667 31871.133333 255427.325 7 1893.2896825 131144.06111 1565813.8833 8 5012.1086310 510344.67827 8627298.6205 9 13235.513272 10 34737.965232 Face-Centered Cubic Lattice 1 6.0 0 0	0 0 2759.5 58041.0 716544.91667 6716153.4833 52696392.526
10 658.34153977 Body-Centered Cubic Lattice 1 4.0 0 0 2 12.0 30.0 0 3 34.6666666667 250.0 274.0 4 95.83333333 1460.66666667 3970.5 5 262.7 7193.0 35853.0 6 708.04166667 31871.133333 255427.325 7 1893.2896825 131144.06111 1565813.8833 8 5012.1086310 510344.67827 8627298.6205 9 13235.513272 10 34737.965232 Face-Centered Cubic Lattice 1 6.0 0 0	0 0 2759.5 58041.0 716544.91667 6716153.4833 52696392.526
Body-Centered Cubic Lattice 1 4.0 0 0 2 12.0 30.0 0 3 34.6666666667 250.0 274.0 4 95.83333333 1460.66666667 3970.5 5 262.7 7193.0 35853.0 6 708.04166667 31871.133333 255427.325 7 1893.2896825 131144.06111 1565813.8833 8 5012.1086310 510344.67827 8627298.6205 9 13235.513272 10 34737.965232 Face-Centered Cubic Lattice 1 6.0 0 0	0 0 2759.5 58041.0 716544.91667 6716153.4833 52696392.526
1 4.0 0 0 2 12.0 30.0 0 3 34.6666666667 250.0 274.0 4 95.83333333 1460.66666667 3970.5 5 262.7 7193.0 35853.0 6 708.04166667 31871.133333 255427.325 7 1893.2896825 131144.06111 1565813.8833 8 5012.1086310 510344.67827 8627298.6205 9 13235.513272 10 34737.965232 Face-Centered Cubic Lattice 1 6.0 0 0	0 0 2759.5 58041.0 716544.91667 6716153.4833 52696392.526
1 4.0 0 0 2 12.0 30.0 0 3 34.6666666667 250.0 274.0 4 95.83333333 1460.66666667 3970.5 5 262.7 7193.0 35853.0 6 708.04166667 31871.133333 255427.325 7 1893.2896825 131144.06111 1565813.8833 8 5012.1086310 510344.67827 8627298.6205 9 13235.513272 10 34737.965232 Face-Centered Cubic Lattice 1 6.0 0 0	0 0 2759.5 58041.0 716544.91667 6716153.4833 52696392.526
2 12.0 30.0 0 3 34.666666667 250.0 274.0 4 95.83333333 1460.6666667 3970.5 5 262.7 7193.0 35853.0 6 708.04166667 31871.133333 255427.325 7 1893.2896825 131144.06111 1565813.8833 8 5012.1086310 510344.67827 8627298.6205 9 13235.513272 10 34737.965232 Face-Centered Cubic Lattice 1 6.0 0 0 0	0 0 2759.5 58041.0 716544.91667 6716153.4833 52696392.526
3 34.666666667 274.0 4 95.83333333 1460.66666667 3970.5 5 262.7 7193.0 35853.0 6 708.04166667 31871.133333 255427.325 7 1893.2896825 131144.06111 1565813.8833 8 5012.1086310 510344.67827 8627298.6205 9 13235.513272 10 34737.965232 Face-Centered Cubic Lattice 1 6.0 0 0	U 2759.5 58041.0 716544.91667 6716153.4833 52696392.526
4 95.833333333 1460.6666667 3970.5 5 262.7 7193.0 35853.0 6 708.04166667 31871.133333 255427.325 7 1893.2896825 131144.06111 1565813.8833 8 5012.1086310 510344.67827 8627298.6205 9 13235.513272 10 34737.965232 Face-Centered Cubic Lattice 1 6.0 0 0	2759.5 58041.0 716544.91667 6716153.4833 52696392.526
5 262.7 7193.0 35853.0 6 708.04166667 31871.133333 255427.325 7 1893.2896825 131144.06111 1565813.8833 8 5012.1086310 510344.67827 8627298.6205 9 13235.513272 10 34737.965232 Face-Centered Cubic Lattice 1 6.0 0 0	58041.0 716544.91667 6716153.4833 52696392.526
6 708.04166667 31871.133333 255427.325 7 1893.2896825 131144.06111 1565813.8833 8 5012.1086310 510344.67827 8627298.6205 9 13235.513272 10 34737.965232 Face-Centered Cubic Lattice 1 6.0 0 0	716544.91667 6716153.4833 52696392.526
7 1893.2896825 131144.06111 1565813.8833 8 5012.1086310 510344.67827 8627298.6205 9 13235.513272 10 34737.965232 Face-Centered Cubic Lattice 1 6.0 0 0	6716153.4833 52696392.526
8 5012.1086310 510344.67827 8627298.6205 9 13235.513272 10 34737.965232 Face-Centered Cubic Lattice 1 6.0 0 0	52696392.526
9 13235.513272 10 34737.965232 Face-Centered Cubic Lattice 1 6.0 0 0	
10 34737.965232 Face-Centered Cubic Lattice 1 6.0 0 0	
Face-Centered Cubic Lattice16.00	
1 6.0 0 0	
	Ö
2 30.0 69.0 0	0
3 138.0 931.0 969.0	0
4 611.25 8736.0 22529.25	15015.75
5 2658.55 68948.5 325798.5	504508.5
6 11432.5125 488853.18333 3714828.2375	9949385.625
7 48726 726190 3215606.1083 36427972.0	148992174.07
8 206142 36741 19994641 556 320929521 10	1867849644.0
9 866895.50635	
Square Lattice	
	0
	0
	0
	120 25
	1007 5
5 1.183333333 57.5 408.5	1007.5
5 0.509/2222222 1/.544444444 10/4.9125	4318.041000/
	13500.325
8 0.40/3908/302 97.90530/540 3509.22901/9	343/3.30//94
9 1.06/2839506	
10 -0.69281883818	
Triangular Lattice	
1 3.0 0 0	0
2 6.0 16.5 0	
3 8 5 90.5 108.0	0
	0
4 9 375 312_0 1020_375 7	0 0 767,625
4 9.375 312.0 1020.375 7 5 11.025 839.25 5638.5 1	0 0 767.625 .0455.75
4 9.375 312.0 1020.375 7 5 11.025 839.25 5638.5 1 6 16.964583333 1934.5 23391.21875 5	0 0 767.625 .0455.75 30023.9375
4 9.375 312.0 1020.375 7 5 11.025 839.25 5638.5 1 6 16.964583333 1934.5 23391.21875 8 7 21 152678571 4022 1625 80285 9625 4	0 0 767.625 .0455.75 30023.9375 148375.7625
4 9.375 312.0 1020.375 7 5 11.025 839.25 5638.5 1 6 16.964583333 1934.5 23391.21875 8 7 21.152678571 4022.1625 80285.9625 4 8 8.058779762 7701 2694196 239966 59621 2	0 0 767.625 .0455.75 30023.9375 148375.7625 2039001.7915

-

model data^{4,7} to see if they seem valid there also. To this end we have computed the following (Table I):

$$G(\tau^{2}, T) = \sum_{m=0}^{\infty} \sum_{n=m+1}^{\infty} g_{m,n} (-\tau^{2})^{m} K^{n}, \quad (13)$$

where K = J/kT (with J the exchange integral) for square, triangular, simple cubic, bcc, and fcc lattices, to order τ^6 and K^9 or K^{10} for closeor loose-packed lattices, respectively, and (τ^0) and K^8 otherwise. Where comparison is possible, our results agree with those (as corrected) of Opechowski.⁸ Except for the coefficient of τ^{0} for the two-dimensional lattices, all the coefficients had the expected signs. All the coefficients of the determinants D(0,1) and D(1,1)were positive. Since the coefficient of τ^0 is reduced magnetic susceptibility minus unity and has been extensively studied,⁹ there is little doubt that it is positive over the range $T > T_c$ (if any). Consequently, the inequalities which we have proved rigorously for the ferromagnetic Ising model appear to be valid for the ferromagnetic Heisenberg model as well.

Hence we propose that it may be worthwhile to test them experimentally. This test can be made by noting that form (7) implies that

$$(-1)^n \Delta^n G(\tau^2) \ge 0, \tag{14}$$

where Δ is the difference operator with respect to τ^2 . That a difference is involved instead of a derivative allows the direct use of experimental data without the difficulty of trying to extract a derivative.

*Work performed under the auspices of the U.S. Atomic Energy Commission.

¹G. A. Baker, Jr., Phys. Rev. 161, 434 (1967).

²C. N. Yang and T. D. Lee, Phys. Rev. <u>87</u>, 404, 410 (1952).

³See, for example, G. A. Baker, Jr., Advan. Theoret. Phys. $\underline{1}$, 1 (1965).

⁴G. A. Baker, Jr., H. E. Gilbert, J. Eve, and G. S. Rushbrooke, Phys. Rev. <u>164</u>, 800 (1967).

⁵M. E. Fisher, Rept. Progr. Phys. <u>30</u>, 615 (1967). ⁶L. P. Kadanoff, W. Götze, D. Hamblen, R. Hecht,

E. A. S. Lewis, V. V. Palciauskas, M. Rayl, J. Swift, D. Aspnes, and J. Kane, Rev. Mod. Phys. <u>39</u>, 395 (1967).

⁷G. A. Baker, Jr., H. E. Gilbert, J. Eve, and G. S. Rushbrooke, Phys. Letters <u>25A</u>, 207 (1967).

⁸W. Opechowski, Physica <u>4</u>, 181 (1937); V. Zehler, Z. Naturforsch. <u>5a</u>, 1936 (1950), and private communication.

⁹G. S. Rushbrooke and P. J. Wood, Mol. Phys. <u>1</u>, 257 (1958); H. E. Stanley and T. A. Kaplan, Phys. Rev. Letters <u>17</u>, 913 (1966).

INTRINSIC SURFACE STATES IN SEMICONDUCTORS*

R. O. Jones

Cavendish Laboratory, Cambridge, England, and Laboratory of Atomic and Solid State Physics, Cornell University, Ithaca, New York (Reveived 26 February 1968)

Experimentally well established features of semiconductor surface-state distributions

are explained in terms of a realistic model calculation.

Calculations reported here for a model crystal surface provide a consistent explanation of the surface-state distributions observed in silicon and germanium, and a simple extension suggests reasons for trends observed in the distributions for III-V and II-VI compounds. These are believed to be the first detailed calculations based on a realistic potential.

A recent survey¹ of measurements on semiconductor-vacuum interfaces indicated two distinct types of behavior. In covalent semiconductors, such as silicon, the densities of surface states and surface atoms are comparable and the Fermi level lies in the lower part of the band gap. Markedly different are more ionic crystals, which exhibit much lower densities of states. A similar situation appears to exist at semiconductor-metal contacts,² though in this case the surface states must be interpreted as tails on the metal wave functions.^{3,4}

Calculations of localized states for the (110) face of silicon are reported here. The model is similar to that also suggested by Chaves, Majlis, and Cardona⁵ and is described elsewhere.⁶ The bulk crystal potential is unaltered up to the surface plane, where it changes abruptly to the vacuum level, determined by work-function measurements. For this model, the calculation sep-