String Theory of the Regge Intercept

S. Hellerman*

Institute for the Physics and Mathematics of the Universe, The University of Tokyo, Kashiwa, Chiba 277-8582, Japan

I. Swanson†

(Received 20 August 2014; revised manuscript received 7 February 2015; published 17 March 2015)

Using the Polchinski-Strominger effective string theory in the covariant gauge, we compute the mass of a rotating string in D dimensions with large angular momenta J, in one or two planes, in fixed ratio, up to and including first subleading order in the large J expansion. This constitutes a first-principles calculation of the value for the order-J^0 contribution to the mass squared of a meson on the leading Regge trajectory in planar QCD with bosonic quarks. For open strings with Neumann boundary conditions, and for closed strings in $D \geq 5$, the order-J^0 term in the mass squared is exactly calculated by the semiclassical approximation. This term in the expansion is universal and independent of the details of the theory, assuming only D-dimensional Poincaré invariance and the absence of other infinite-range excitations on the string world volume, beyond the Nambu-Goldstone bosons.

DOI: 10.1103/PhysRevLett.114.111601 PACS numbers: 11.15.-q, 11.25.-w, 12.40.Nn, 14.40.-n

The dynamics of relativistic strings was first studied as a model to explain the observed spectra of hadronic resonances, which are organized in families according to the mass relation

$$M^2 \simeq \frac{J}{\alpha'} + M_0^2 = \frac{J - \alpha_0}{\alpha'}, \tag{1}$$

where J is the angular momentum, α' defines the Regge slope, and the Regge intercept $\alpha_0 = -\alpha' M_0^2$ depends on the family. In the string model, the Regge slope can be expressed in terms of the string tension $\mathbf{T}_{\text{string}}$, with $\alpha' = 1/(2\pi \mathbf{T}_{\text{string}})$. Empirically, the string tension takes the value $\mathbf{T}_{\text{string}} \simeq 0.17\ \text{GeV}^2$, as determined, for instance, from the spectra of quarkonia (see, e.g., [1–4]).

While the string model successfully describes the linear dependence of M^2 on J in terms of an underlying relativistic (classical) dynamics, it has long been unclear how to promote the string theory of quantum chromodynamics from a coarse phenomenology to a precision science. In particular, one would like to be able to view Eq. (1) as capturing the leading terms in an asymptotic expansion that holds at large angular momentum J.

In this Letter, we quantize the effective theory of a rotating relativistic string in D dimensions in conformal gauge, and we calculate the energy of a string with large angular momentum J, in one or two planes, in fixed ratio, up to and including the first subleading order in the $1/J$ expansion. That is, we calculate the order-$|J|^0$ term in the mass squared of a rotating string on the lowest-mass Regge trajectory at large J.

We perform our calculation in the spirit and in the formalism of Ref. [5], wherein Polchinski and Strominger proposed a unitary quantization of the relativistic string that preserves Lorentz invariance at the quantum level without introducing degrees of freedom beyond the motions of the string itself in D-dimensional space-time. This approach, known as "effective string theory," can be implemented in any dimension D and can describe the space-time kinematics of strings without any additional degrees of freedom. This is similar to the Polyakov approach [6], which couples a conformal field theory describing D free embedding coordinates X^μ to an intrinsic world sheet metric g_{ab} and treats world sheet reparameterizations and Weyl transformations of g_{ab} as gauge symmetries. The Polchinski-Strominger (PS) approach differs by introducing X^μ variables that are not free, such that the central charge is compensated by interaction terms. In particular, in addition to the free Lagrangian

$$\mathcal{L}_{\text{free}} = \frac{1}{\pi\alpha'} \partial_+ X \cdot \partial_- X, \tag{2}$$

the theory has an interaction term

$$\mathcal{L}_{\text{PS}} = \frac{\beta}{2\pi} \frac{(\partial_+^2 X \cdot \partial_- X)(\partial_+ X \cdot \partial_-^2 X)}{(\partial_+ X \cdot \partial_- X)^2}, \tag{3}$$

which controls the conformal anomaly by contributing $\Delta c = 12\beta$ to the central charge of the conformal dynamics of the X^μ coordinates. (In the above, we have used world sheet coordinates $\sigma^\pm \equiv \sigma^0 \pm \sigma^1$.) Though the Polyakov formalism is not the starting point, the resulting action and constraints are exactly the same as if we had coupled the theory $\mathcal{L} = \mathcal{L}_{\text{free}} + \mathcal{L}_{\text{PS}}$ to an intrinsic metric and then gauge fixed to a flat metric $g_{ab} = -\frac{1}{2}(\delta_{a+}\delta_{b-} + \delta_{a-}\delta_{b+})$, with β chosen so that the theory of the X^μ is an interacting conformal field theory with $c = 26$. This fixes the value

$$\beta = \frac{26 - D}{12}. \qquad (4)$$

The action may be supplemented with terms of order $|X|^{-2}$ or smaller, as consistent with (or required by) the condition that conformal invariance be maintained order by order in $|X|$. These terms contribute to amplitudes of the order of J^{-2} and smaller, relative to leading-order quantities, and therefore do not contribute to the asymptotic Regge intercept.

The interacting stress tensor of the X fields satisfies the operator product expansion of a conformal stress tensor with $c = 26$ [5]; its modes are Virasoro generators, defining physical states $|\Psi\rangle$ under the conditions

$$(L_0 - 1)|\Psi\rangle = (\tilde{L}_0 - 1)|\Psi\rangle = L_n|\Psi\rangle = \tilde{L}_n|\Psi\rangle = 0,$$

with $n \geq 1$. The resulting theory of the X^μ coordinates has the status of an effective theory only, in that it should be thought of as an expansion that is valid in the limit where the physical length of the string is much larger than $\sqrt{\alpha'}$.

We consider the special case of the leading Regge trajectory, composed of lowest-mass states for given values of the angular momentum. This simplifies the calculation in three ways.

First, the physical state conditions with $n \geq 1$ are all automatically satisfied for the lowest-energy state carrying a fixed set of Noether charges (here, Poincaré generators P^μ and $J^{\mu\nu}$, and $L_0 - \tilde{L}_0$), so long as the Noether generators are exactly conserved and the lowest state with those charges is unique. Then, the remaining physical state condition, specified by L_0, dictates the first-order shift in the mass squared of the string state. The calculation of ΔM^2 at the order of J^0 thus reduces to a first-order shift in the eigenvalue of the world sheet Hamiltonian. This shift in the world sheet energy E_{ws} reduces to an expectation value of the interaction Hamiltonian $\hat{H}_{\text{first-order}}$ in the free-field state with Noether charges P^μ and $J^{\mu\nu}$.

Second, the expectation value of an operator in an eigenstate of large angular momentum J is approximated at leading order by the classical value of that operator in a rotating solution with a helical symmetry. The corrections to the leading-order value are calculable and of the order of $1/J$ or smaller, relative to the classical value. These corrections can be computed in a straightforward manner (for instance, by representing definite-J states as contour integrals of coherent states and evaluating expectation values in a saddle point expansion at large J). The interaction Hamiltonian is of the order of $\beta|X|^0$ and therefore exhibits a classical value of order $\beta|J|^0$ in eigenstates of large J. The corrections to the classical value are of the order of $|J|^{-1}$ at most and therefore do not contribute to ΔM^2 at the order of J^0. Thus, the order-J^0 shift of the mass squared is proportional to the order-J^0 shift in the eigenvalue of the world sheet Hamiltonian, which is simply the classical value of the interaction Hamiltonian at that order.

The third simplification is that we need not use the explicit form of the interaction Hamiltonian, even for purposes of classical evaluation. By straightforward manipulations in classical mechanics, it is possible to show that the first-order shift in the energy of the lowest classical solution with fixed Noether charges is equal both to the value of the interaction Hamiltonian and, equivalently, to the negative of the value of the interaction Lagrangian, evaluated in the unperturbed (zeroth-order) helically symmetric solution with the appropriate Noether charges.

We start with closed string configurations in $D \geq 5$ by describing the lowest-energy state with the quantum numbers of interest in the free theory. Generally, the lowest-energy eigenstates of angular momentum in the $Z, \bar{Z}$ plane are those generated by acting J times with left- or right-moving creation operators, with one unit of L_0 or $\tilde{L}_0$ each. For the closed string, there is also the additional restriction of level matching, meaning that the number of left- and right-moving creation operators must be the same.

The states of interest are such that, in an appropriately chosen Cartan decomposition, the angular momenta are aligned with the "3" direction of the self-dual and anti-self-dual $SU(2)_\pm$ subgroups of the $SO(4) \subset SO(D-1)$ little group. For $D \geq 5$, we can consider general angular momenta in both planes, where the string states are chosen to be primaries of both $SU(2)_\pm$ subgroups, and the total angular momentum quantum numbers are $J_\pm \equiv \frac{1}{2}(J_1 \pm J_2)$ in $SU(2)_\pm$. In other words, by minimizing the energy over the highest-weight vectors of $SU(2)_+ \times SU(2)_-$, with total angular momenta $J_\pm$ and zero momentum in the σ^1 direction, the unique lowest-energy state in the free theory can be expressed as

$$|J_+, J_-; P\rangle_{\text{free}} = \frac{1}{\sqrt{\mathcal{N}^{(\mathbf{S}^1)}_{J_+,J_-}}} (\alpha^{Z_1}_{-1}\tilde{\alpha}^{Z_2}_{-1} - \alpha^{Z_2}_{-1}\tilde{\alpha}^{Z_1}_{-1})^{J_+ - J_-} \times (\alpha^{Z_1}_{-1}\tilde{\alpha}^{Z_1}_{-1})^{J_-}|0; P\rangle_{\text{free}}. \qquad (5)$$

The energy under the free-field Hamiltonian is

$$E^{(\text{free})}_{\mathrm{ws}} = \left(\frac{1}{2}\alpha' P^2 + 2J_+\right) - \frac{D}{12}, \qquad (6)$$

where the last term is the usual free-field Casimir energy. The normalization constants $(\mathcal{N}^{(\mathbf{S}^1)}_{J_+,J_-})$ can be chosen to render the nonzero modes of the Fock states unit-normalized. Furthermore, we can choose that $J_+ > J_-$, for instance, without loss of generality.

Expectation values of operators in $|(J, P)\rangle$ are given to leading order in J by the classical values of those operators in a particular helically symmetric solution, suitably averaged over rotations in the Z planes if the operator in question is not already symmetric.

A general helically symmetric classical solution is given by

$$\begin{aligned} X^0 &= \alpha' P^0 \sigma^0, \\ Z_i &= -i\sqrt{\frac{\alpha'}{2}}(\alpha_{-1}^{Z_i} e^{i\sigma^+} + \tilde{\alpha}_{-1}^{Z_i} e^{i\sigma^-}), \\ \bar{Z}_i &= i\sqrt{\frac{\alpha'}{2}}(\alpha_{1}^{\bar{Z}_i} e^{-i\sigma^+} + \tilde{\alpha}_{1}^{\bar{Z}_i} e^{-i\sigma^-}), \end{aligned} \quad (7)$$

with $i \in \{1, 2\}$ and with the mode amplitudes obeying $(\alpha_{-n}^{Z_i})^* = \alpha_n^{\bar{Z}_i}$. The free angular momentum generators are

$$\begin{aligned} J_i &= \frac{i}{4\pi\alpha'}\int d\sigma^1 (Z_i \dot{\bar{Z}}_i - \bar{Z}_i \dot{Z}_i) \\ &= \frac{1}{2}|\alpha_{-1}^{Z_i}|^2 + \frac{1}{2}|\tilde{\alpha}_{-1}^{Z_i}|^2. \end{aligned}$$

Fixing P^μ, $L_0 - \tilde{L}_0 = 0$, and the values of the angular momenta $J^{\mu\nu}$, and then choosing values of the Fourier coefficients that minimize $L_0 + \tilde{L}_0$, we find

$$\begin{aligned} \alpha_{-1}^{Z_1} &= \alpha_1^{\bar{Z}_1} = \tilde{\alpha}_{-1}^{Z_1} = \tilde{\alpha}_1^{\bar{Z}_1} = \sqrt{J_1}, \\ \alpha_{-1}^{Z_2} &= \alpha_1^{\bar{Z}_2} = -\tilde{\alpha}_{-1}^{Z_2} = -\tilde{\alpha}_1^{\bar{Z}_2} = \sqrt{J_2}. \end{aligned} \quad (8)$$

With this solution, the contribution of the PS anomaly term, evaluated in the rotating ground state, takes the form

$$\mathcal{L}_{\substack{\text{PS} \\ \text{rotating solution}}} = -\frac{\beta J_-^2}{2\pi^2}\frac{\sin^2(2\sigma_1)}{[J_+ - J_- \cos(2\sigma_1)]^2}. \quad (9)$$

This Lagrangian density becomes singular at the end points $\sigma_1 = 0$ and π, in the limit $J_+ = J_-$. This limit is imposed automatically in $D = 4$, as the little group $SO(D-1)$ has rank one, and J_2 must vanish. The singularity corresponds to the development of a fold in the string, and we defer a careful treatment of these cases for future work.

However, the integral is finite for generic angular momenta in $D \geq 5$, and we do not need to regulate or renormalize. The resulting value of the mass squared, to the order of J^0, is

$$M_{\text{closed}}^2 = \frac{1}{\alpha'}\left\{2(J_1 + J_2) - \frac{D-2}{6} + \frac{26-D}{12}\left[\left(\frac{J_1}{J_2}\right)^{1/4} - \left(\frac{J_2}{J_1}\right)^{1/4}\right]^2\right\} + O(J^{-1}). \quad (10)$$

The contribution from the PS term is nonzero unless $J_1 = J_2$, or $D = 26$. There is also the Casimir term, which contributes one factor of $-1/(12\alpha')$ to M_{closed}^2 for each right- and left-moving transverse free boson. We omit the details of this calculation, except to note that one-loop vacuum diagrams are independent of the background solution at the order of $|X|^0$, so the Casimir contribution to the energy is identical to that of the static string.

A qualitatively new effect appears for open rotating strings with Neumann boundary conditions: The anomaly term (3) in the effective action becomes singular at the boundary, and the singularity is nonintegrable. This divergence is a short-distance singularity, however, which can be removed by regularization and renormalization. In particular, we can remove the divergence by adjusting the coefficient of a boundary operator—the unique marginal boundary operator with the correct X scaling to cancel the divergence.

In terms of $J_\pm$, the lowest-energy, highest-weight states in the free theory are specified by

$$\begin{aligned} |J_+, J_-; P\rangle_{\text{free}} &= \frac{1}{\sqrt{\mathcal{N}_{J_+,J_-}^{(\text{open})}}}(\alpha_{-1}^{Z_1}\alpha_{-2}^{Z_2} - \alpha_{-2}^{Z_1}\alpha_{-1}^{Z_2})^{J_+ - J_-} \\ &\quad \times (\alpha_{-1}^{Z_1})^{2J_-}|0; P\rangle_{\text{free}}, \end{aligned} \quad (11)$$

where $\mathcal{N}_{J_+,J_-}^{(\text{open})}$ is again a normalization constant. The energy under the free-field Hamiltonian now appears as

$$E_{\text{ws}}^{(\text{free})} = \alpha' P^2 + 3J_+ - J_- - \frac{D}{24}. \quad (12)$$

Analogous to the closed string, expectation values of rotationally symmetric operators in this state are given to leading order in J by the classical values of those operators in a particular helically symmetric classical solution, which minimizes the energy for its Noether charges and takes the form

$$\begin{aligned} X^0 &= 2\alpha' P^0 \sigma^0, \\ \bar{Z}_1 &= i\sqrt{\frac{\alpha'}{2}}\alpha_1^{\bar{Z}_1}(e^{-i\sigma^+} + e^{-i\sigma^-}), \\ \bar{Z}_2 &= i\sqrt{\frac{\alpha'}{2}}\frac{\alpha_2^{\bar{Z}_2}}{2}(e^{-2i\sigma^+} + e^{-2i\sigma^-}), \\ Z_1 &= -i\sqrt{\frac{\alpha'}{2}}\alpha_{-1}^{Z_1}(e^{i\sigma^+} + e^{i\sigma^-}), \\ Z_2 &= -i\sqrt{\frac{\alpha'}{2}}\frac{\alpha_{-2}^{Z_2}}{2}(e^{2i\sigma^+} + e^{2i\sigma^-}), \end{aligned} \quad (13)$$

with

$$\begin{aligned} \alpha_1^{\bar{Z}_1} &= \sqrt{2J_1}, \qquad \alpha_{-1}^{Z_1} = \sqrt{2J_1}, \\ \alpha_2^{\bar{Z}_2} &= 2\sqrt{J_2}, \qquad \alpha_{-2}^{Z_2} = 2\sqrt{J_2}. \end{aligned} \quad (14)$$

As noted, the PS term for open strings exhibits a short-distance divergence near the boundaries, which can be canceled with an appropriate boundary counterterm, and an analysis of scale-invariant boundary operators consistent with Lorentz symmetry reveals that only one such independent operator is available to regulate the divergence. In particular, the short-distance divergence can be shown to take the form of a quark-mass boundary operator, with a coefficient that diverges as some short-distance regulator scale ϵ is taken to zero. The divergence can thus be canceled with a corresponding counterterm.

We now compute the value of the regulated classical action and renormalize it with a boundary counterterm to extract the finite piece that contributes to the Regge intercept. To regulate the divergence, we modify the form of the PS Lagrangian to cut off the singular behavior of the integrand:

$$\mathcal{L}_{\rm PS} = \frac{\beta}{2\pi}\frac{(\partial_+^2 X\cdot\partial_- X)(\partial_+ X\cdot\partial_-^2 X)}{(\partial_+ X\cdot\partial_- X)^2}$$
$$\to \mathcal{L}_{\rm PS,reg} \equiv \frac{\beta}{2\pi}\frac{(\partial_+^2 X\cdot\partial_- X)(\partial_+ X\cdot\partial_-^2 X)}{(\partial_+ X\cdot\partial_- X)^2 + \alpha'\epsilon^4(\partial_+^2 X\cdot\partial_-^2 X)},$$

where the coefficient $\alpha'\epsilon^4$ of the regulating term is chosen for later convenience. This form of the modification preserves D-dimensional Poincaré invariance and all other symmetries of the theory, including two-dimensional scale invariance. (These requirements drastically constrain the form of the available counterterms.)

Next, we must calculate the σ_1 integral of the classical value of $\mathcal{L}_{\rm PS}$, from 0 to π, up to and including the order of ϵ^0. Before extracting the finite term, we first consider the form of the divergence as we send $\epsilon \to 0$. To this end, we introduce a new integration variable u by rescaling σ_1:

$$\sigma^1 = \epsilon\langle\mathcal{O}_{(\rm quark)}\rangle u, \tag{15}$$

where $\mathcal{O}_{(\rm quark)}$ is the boundary operator

$$\mathcal{O}_{(\rm quark)} \equiv (\partial_{\sigma^1}^2 X\cdot\partial_{\sigma^1}^2 X)^{1/4} \tag{16}$$

and $\langle\mathcal{O}_{(\rm quark)}\rangle$ is its value in the classical rotating solution, proportional to $(J_1+8J_2)^{1/4}$. Expanding the integrand $d\sigma^1\mathcal{L}_{\rm PS,reg}$ in terms of u, we see that the ϵ^{-1} divergence is proportional, with a universal coefficient, to $\langle\mathcal{O}_{(\rm quark)}\rangle$. We conclude that the divergence of the PS action near a Neumann boundary can be renormalized with a boundary counterterm proportional to $\epsilon^{-1}\mathcal{O}_{(\rm quark)}$.

The operator $\mathcal{O}_{(\rm quark)}$ is the only independent Lorentz-invariant boundary operator in the theory with a marginal scaling dimension and non-negative X scaling. This fact depends crucially on the hypothesis of a certain "dressing rule" for boundary operators at Neumann boundaries: that the dressing of boundary operators comes only in powers of $\mathcal{O}_{(\rm quark)}$ itself. That is, only the combination $(\partial_{\sigma^1}^2 X\cdot\partial_{\sigma^1}^2 X)$, and no other invariant, can occur in negative or fractional powers in boundary operators for open strings with Neumann boundary conditions. This Neumann boundary dressing rule is not intuitively obvious but emerges automatically in the D-dimensional open effective string theory derived from a critical string theory when holographic or Liouville directions are integrated out [7]. With this dressing rule assumed, we find that all other linearly independent marginal boundary operators respecting D-dimensional Poincaré symmetry can be eliminated by field redefinitions, Virasoro constraints, and discarding total derivatives tangent to the boundary and operators with negative X scaling (and therefore negative J scaling).

We now demonstrate the renormalizability of the divergence directly and extract the finite term by performing the integral. One way to carry this through is to perform a change of variables $w \equiv \exp(2i\sigma_1)$, taking the contour on the unit circle $|w| = 1$. The integrand is a rational function of w, and we can evaluate the integral by taking residues. The divergent terms come from four poles which approach $w = 1$, with two from each side of the unit circle, which give rise to the ϵ^{-1} behavior of the integral in the $\epsilon \to 0$ limit. In terms of σ^1, these are boundary contributions, corresponding to the end points of the string. Together, they contribute

$$\Delta M_{\rm open}^2 = \frac{1}{\epsilon}\frac{26-D}{24\alpha'}(J_1+8J_2)^{1/4} + (\text{finite}). \tag{17}$$

In addition, there are contributions from poles in the interior of the unit circle in the w plane. These are finite in the $\epsilon \to 0$ limit. After renormalizing the ϵ^{-1} divergence by adding our counterterm to the boundary Lagrangian proportional to $\mathcal{O}_{(\rm quark)}$, we obtain

$$M_{\rm open}^2 = \frac{1}{\alpha'}\left[J_1 + 2J_2 - \frac{D-2}{24} + \frac{26-D}{24}\left(-4 + \frac{3J_1+4J_2}{J_1^{1/2}\sqrt{J_1+8J_2}}\right)\right] + O(J^{-1}). \tag{18}$$

For angular momenta lying in a single plane (i.e., when $J_2 = 0$), the mass squared equals $M_{\rm open}^2 = (J_1-1)/\alpha'$, independent of D. Of course, when $D = 26$, we obtain $M_{\rm open}^2 = (J_1+2J_2-1)/\alpha'$. This is the case in which the bosonic string theory is well defined microscopically, and the singular PS anomaly term is absent.

At large J, the leading contribution of the quark-mass term to the spectrum and boundary condition are of the relative order of $J^{-3/4}$. The quark-mass operator also has an indirect effect on the spectrum through its modification of the Casimir energy, but this is of the relative order of $J^{-7/4}$ at most: The frequency of each mode shifts at the absolute order of $J^{-3/4}$, and so the correction to the renormalized sum over frequencies is of the same order. These effects leave the asymptotic intercept unchanged.

It is indeed worth emphasizing that in the mass-squared formula (18) we have fine-tuned the finite part of the coefficient of the quark-mass operator $\mathcal{O}_{(\rm quark)}$ so that there is no term of the order of $J^{1/4}$. A generic value of the quark mass would contribute to the open-string mass squared at this order; an $\mathcal{O}_{(\rm quark)}$ term with a flavor-dependent coefficient at each boundary must therefore be included in any fit to real-world data. (See, for example, Ref. [8].)

The results above [in particular, Eq. (18)] constitute the first step toward using the covariant formalism to connect the higher-resolution predictions of effective string theory with experiments. To be sure, the theory still lacks several features of realistic QCD, though the corrections we have computed above stand as universal contributions to the Regge intercept for massless bosonic quarks. Unsurprisingly, this simplified model—noninteracting strings with bosonic, flavorless end points—has an intercept differing from that of the best-fit trajectory to data in the actual hadron spectrum (see, e.g., [3], or [4] for the latest underlying data). Where we find an asymptotic Regge intercept for the open string of $\alpha_0 = -M_0^2\alpha' = 1$ on the leading trajectory (for $J_2 = 0$ and $D = 4$), the data indicate an asymptotic intercept in real QCD that is roughly half this value for the trajectory of the ρ meson. While the sign and order of magnitude are correct, it is an important problem to understand what contributions, other than the quark-mass effects discussed above, might be needed to eliminate the remaining difference.

Estimates of corrections from $O(|X|)^{-2}$ terms in the action and electromagnetic corrections appear to be too small. Regarding the latter, for instance, we note that electromagnetic interactions between quarks must scale as $\Delta P^0 \propto \alpha_{em}/L = \alpha_{em}/\sqrt{J\alpha'}$, where L is the physical length of the string. These effects contribute to the intercept but are suppressed by the fine-structure constant α_{em}.

Nonplanar effects include self-interactions of each boundary and also nonlocal effects such as pion exchange between boundaries. The former may be absorbed into a renormalized world sheet action, while the latter are exponentially suppressed. Neither can affect the intercept in the strictly asymptotic regime but may be at the threshold of contributing nontrivially for attainable values of J. For instance, we can estimate the leading nonlocal nonplanar effect by the Yukawa potential, $V = g^2 e^{-m_\pi L}/L$, giving a contribution to the meson dispersion relation of $\Delta M^2 \sim 2g^2 e^{-0.4\sqrt{J}}$, where g^2 scales as $1/N_{\rm colors}$. Local nonplanar effects at the boundary will also be enhanced by negative powers of m_π.

Other nonplanar effects can exhibit leading-order J scaling with a positive exponent. The amplitude for decay by splitting, for instance, is extensive along the length of the string and scales as $\sqrt{J}/N_{\rm colors}$. These effects are unimportant in the strictly planar regime $N_{\rm colors} \gg \sqrt{J} \gg 1$. The strict $N_{\rm colors} = \infty$ limit is a good approximation to many observables in real QCD, possibly due to suppression of nonplanar effects by small numerical coefficients, and we anticipate this may be so for the form of the asymptotic Regge spectrum.

Finally, we note that the inclusion of fermionic quarks carrying quantum numbers of chiral flavor symmetry may generate contributions at the order of interest and bring the predictions of the effective string calculation closer to the observed value of the intercept. Including chiral symmetry may also make it possible to use current algebra to estimate the size of nonplanar interactions, such as the coefficient g of the Yukawa potential above.

Since the late 1960s, the physical significance of the Regge behavior of the hadronic spectrum has been recognized as key to the physics of the strong interactions. This phenomenon lies at the heart of the connection between confining gauge theory and string theory. In the intervening decades, however, very few concrete contributions have been made to advance the goal of matching the detailed predictions of confining, non-Abelian gauge theory to observation, via string theory or otherwise.

The results presented here solve the outstanding problem of computing the first subleading corrections to the Regge spectrum for massless bosonic quarks in the planar limit at large J. In particular, the absence of operators scaling as $|X|^0$ in the boundary operator spectrum means that the order-J^0 term in the dispersion relation is universal, even in the presence of quark masses. Thus, while the analysis leaves out some elements of realistic QCD, the terms computed above stand as a necessary component of any attempt to further connect the predictions of confining QCD in this regime with empirical observation.

The authors are grateful to many people for valuable discussions, including Ofer Aharony, Raphael Flauger, Jacob Sonnenschein, and Taizan Watari. We are particularly grateful to Shunsuke Maeda and Jonathan Maltz for collaboration on related work, including an analysis of the scheme dependence of the effective string action in various noncovariant gauges, and assistance in reconciling the details of existing calculations in the literature with the results calculated here. The work of S. H. was supported by the World Premier International Research Center Initiative, MEXT, Japan, and also by Grants-in-Aid for Scientific Research (22740153) and (26400242) from the Japan Society for Promotion of Science (JSPS). S. H. is also grateful to the theory group at Caltech for hospitality while this work was in progress.

*simeon.hellerman.1@gmail.com
†ianswanson.physics@gmail.com

[1] W. Buchmuller, G. Grunberg, and S. H. H. Tye, Phys. Rev. Lett. **45**, 103 (1980); **45**, 587(E) (1980).
[2] W. Buchmuller and S. H. H. Tye, Phys. Rev. D **24**, 132 (1981).
[3] S. V. Chekanov and B. B. Levchenko, Phys. Rev. D **75**, 014007 (2007).
[4] Particle Data Group, http://pdg.lbl.gov.
[5] J. Polchinski and A. Strominger, Phys. Rev. Lett. **67**, 1681 (1991).
[6] A. M. Polyakov, Phys. Lett. B **103**, 207 (1981).
[7] S. Hellerman and I. Swanson (to be published).
[8] J. Sonnenschein and D. Weissman, J. High Energy Phys. 08 (2014) 013; arXiv:1408.0763.