# <span id="page-0-0"></span>**Composite subdiffusion equation that describes transient subdiffusion**

Tadeus[z](https://orcid.org/0000-0001-5710-2970) Kosztołowicz<sup>®\*</sup>

*Institute of Physics, Jan Kochanowski University, Uniwersytecka 7, 25-406 Kielce, Poland*

Aldona Dutkiewic[z](https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5171-4009) $\bullet^{\dagger}$ 

*Faculty of Mathematics and Computer Science, Adam Mickiewicz University, Uniwersytetu Pozna´nskiego 4, 61-614 Pozna´n, Poland*

(Received 25 May 2022; accepted 27 September 2022; published 13 October 2022)

A composite subdiffusion equation with fractional Caputo time derivative with respect to another function *g* is used to describe a process of a continuous transition from subdiffusion with parameters  $\alpha$  and  $D_\alpha$  to subdiffusion with parameters  $\beta$  and  $D_\beta$ . The parameters are defined by the time evolution of the mean square displacement of diffusing particle  $\sigma^2(t) = 2D_i t^i / \Gamma(1 + i)$ ,  $i = \alpha, \beta$ . The function *g* controls the process at intermediate times. The composite subdiffusion equation is more general than the ordinary fractional subdiffusion equation with constant parameters; it has potentially wide application in modeling diffusion processes with changing parameters.

DOI: [10.1103/PhysRevE.106.044119](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevE.106.044119)

### **I. INTRODUCTION**

Subdiffusion occurs in media, such as gels and bacterial biofilm, where the movement of molecules is very hindered due to a complex structure of a medium  $[1-14]$  $[1-14]$ . Within the continuous time random walk (CTRW) model, subdiffusion is defined as a process in which a time distribution between particle jumps  $\psi$  has a heavy tail which makes the average time infinite,  $\psi(t) \sim 1/t^{1+\alpha}$  when  $t \to \infty$ ,  $0 < \alpha < 1$ , and the jump length distribution has finite moments  $[2-5, 15-19]$  $[2-5, 15-19]$ ; the citation list on the above issues can be significantly extended. This model shows that subdiffusion with a constant subdiffusion parameter (exponent)  $\alpha$  in a one-dimensional homogeneous system can be described by an ordinary subdiffusion equation with a fractional time derivative of the order  $\alpha \in (0, 1)$ ,

$$
\frac{c_{\partial}^{a}C(x,t)}{\partial t^{a}} = D_{\alpha}\frac{\partial^{2}C(x,t)}{\partial x^{2}},
$$
\n(1)

where the Caputo fractional derivative is defined here as

$$
\frac{C_d\alpha f(t)}{dt^{\alpha}} = \frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\alpha)} \int_0^t (t-u)^{-\alpha} f'(u) du, \qquad (2)
$$

where  $D_{\alpha}$  is a generalized diffusion coefficient measured in the units of  $m^2/s^{\alpha}$ , *C* is a concentration of diffusing particles, and  $f'$  denotes the first-order derivative of function  $f$ . Equation (1) can be transformed to its equivalent form with the fractional Riemann-Liouville time derivative of the order  $1 - \alpha$ ; see, for example, Ref. [\[2\]](#page-3-0).

Subdiffusion parameters are often defined by a time evolution of the mean square displacement  $\sigma^2$  of a diffusing particle,

$$
\sigma^2(t) = \frac{2D_{\alpha}t^{\alpha}}{\Gamma(1+\alpha)}.
$$
\n(3)

Equation (1) describes the subdiffusion process with constant parameters  $\alpha$  and  $D_{\alpha}$ . Such a process can occur in a homogeneous system in which the structure does not change with time. However, the structure of a medium may evolve over time, continuously changing the parameters. An example is antibiotic subdiffusion in a bacterial biofilm [\[12,13\]](#page-4-0). Bacteria have different defense mechanisms against the action of the antibiotic, which can slow down or even significantly accelerate the antibiotic transport [\[20,21\]](#page-4-0). Different models have been used to describe subdiffusion with variable parameters [\[22–24\]](#page-4-0). The examples are subdiffusion equations with parameters  $\alpha$  and  $D_{\alpha}$  dependent on the spatial variable [\[25,26\]](#page-4-0), transitions from anomalous to Gaussian diffusion [\[27,28\]](#page-4-0), and subdiffusion equations with linear combination of fractional time derivatives with different parameters  $\alpha$  [\[29–31\]](#page-4-0). The CTRW model describing anomalous diffusion with changing subdiffusion parameters [\[32\]](#page-4-0) and the ordinary CTRW model with a waiting time distribution that is a linear combination of two exponential distributions with different timescales [\[27\]](#page-4-0) have been used to model anomalous diffusion with evolving parameters. Modification of a timescale in a diffusion model can lead to changes in diffusion parameters as well as in the type of diffusion [\[33,34\]](#page-4-0). A timescale changing can be made by means of a subordinated method [\[4,](#page-3-0)[35–38\]](#page-4-0). Within this method, retarding and accelerating anomalous diffusions have been obtained [\[39,40\]](#page-4-0). Examples of processes that lead to a rescaling of diffusion are diffusing diffusivities where the diffusion coefficient evolves over time [\[37\]](#page-4-0), passages through the layered media [\[41\]](#page-4-0), and anomalous diffusion in an expanding medium [\[42\]](#page-4-0). We mention that a distributed order of fractional derivative in a subdiffusion equation can lead to delayed or accelerated subdiffusion [\[43–47\]](#page-5-0).

<sup>\*</sup>tadeusz.kosztolowicz@ujk.edu.pl

<sup>†</sup>szukala@amu.edu.pl

<span id="page-1-0"></span>We consider subdiffusion in a one-dimensional homogeneous system. Diffusive properties of a medium may change over time. At the initial moment the subdiffusion parameters are  $\alpha$  and  $D_{\alpha}$ , and after a long time (formally  $t \to \infty$ ) the parameters are  $\beta$  and  $D_\beta$ . In these cases subdiffusion is described by the ordinary subdiffusion equation. In the intermediate time interval there is a continuous transient subdiffusion process in which the subdiffusion parameters are not defined by Eq. [\(3\)](#page-0-0). We call the process transient subdiffusion, and it is symbolically written as  $(\alpha, D_{\alpha}) \rightarrow (\beta, D_{\beta})$ .

## **II. COMPOSITE SUBDIFFUSION EQUATION**

Recently, the composite subdiffusion process characterized by parameters  $\alpha$ ,  $D_{\alpha}$ , and by the function *g* has been considered in [\[34](#page-4-0)[,48,49\]](#page-5-0) (the process has been called *g* subdiffusion in the above cited papers). This process is related to ordinary subdiffusion with the same parameters in which the time variable has been rescaled by a deterministic function *g* which fulfils the conditions  $g(0) = 0$ ,  $g(\infty) = \infty$ , and  $g'(t) > 0$  for  $t > 0$ , and the values of the function *g* are given in a time unit. Composite subdiffusion is described by the following equation:

$$
\frac{C_{\partial_{g}^{\alpha}}C(x,t)}{\partial t^{\alpha}} = D_{\alpha}\frac{\partial^{2}C(x,t)}{\partial x^{2}},
$$
\n(4)

where

$$
\frac{C_{d_g^{\alpha}}f(t)}{dt^{\alpha}} = \frac{1}{\Gamma(1-\alpha)} \int_0^t (g(t) - g(u))^{-\alpha} f'(u) du \quad (5)
$$

is the *g*-Caputo fractional derivative of the order  $\alpha \in (0, 1)$ with respect to the function *g* [\[50\]](#page-5-0). When  $g(t) \equiv t$ , the *g*-Caputo fractional derivative takes the form of the ordinary Caputo derivative. We will show that transient subdiffusion can be treated as a special case of composite subdiffusion. We mention that equations with fractional time derivatives with respect to other functions have already been used to describe other diffusion processes [\[51,52\]](#page-5-0).

The composite subdiffusion equation can be solved by means of the *g*-Laplace transform method. The *g*-Laplace transform is defined as [\[53\]](#page-5-0)

$$
\mathcal{L}_g[f(t)](s) = \int_0^\infty e^{-sg(t)} f(t)g'(t)dt.
$$
 (6)

The *g*-Laplace transform is related to the ordinary Laplace transform  $\mathcal{L}[f(t)](s) = \int_0^\infty e^{-st} f(t) dt$  as follows:

$$
\mathcal{L}_g[f(t)](s) = \mathcal{L}[f(g^{-1}(t))](s).
$$
 (7)

Equation (7) provides the rule

$$
\mathcal{L}_g[f(t)](s) = \mathcal{L}[h(t)](s) \Leftrightarrow f(t) = h(g(t)).
$$
 (8)

The above formula is helpful in calculating the inverse *g*-Laplace transform if the inverse ordinary Laplace transform is known. The examples of inverse *g*-Laplace transforms are [\[48\]](#page-5-0)

$$
\mathcal{L}_g^{-1} \left[ \frac{1}{s^{1+\nu}} \right] (t) = \frac{g^{\nu}(t)}{\Gamma(1+\nu)}, \ \nu > -1, \tag{9}
$$

$$
\mathcal{L}_g^{-1}[s^{\nu}e^{-as^{\mu}}](t) \equiv f_{\nu,\mu}(g(t);a)
$$
  
= 
$$
\frac{1}{g^{1+\nu}(t)} \sum_{k=0}^{\infty} \frac{1}{k!\Gamma(-\nu-\mu k)} \left(-\frac{a}{g^{\mu}(t)}\right)^k,
$$
  
(10)

 $a, \mu > 0$ . The function  $f_{\nu,\mu}$  is a special case of the Wright function and the H-Fox function.

The calculations for solving Eq. (4) by means of the *g*-Laplace transform method are similar to those for solving Eq. [\(1\)](#page-0-0) using the ordinary Laplace transform. Due to the relation [\[53\]](#page-5-0)

$$
\mathcal{L}_g \left[ \frac{^C d_g^{\alpha} f(t)}{dt^{\alpha}} \right] (s) = s^{\alpha} \mathcal{L}_g[f(t)](s) - s^{\alpha - 1} f(0), \tag{11}
$$

where  $0 < \alpha \leq 1$ , the *g*-Laplace transform of Eq. (4), reads

$$
s^{\alpha} \mathcal{L}_g[C(x, t)](s) - s^{\alpha - 1} C(x, 0)
$$
  
= 
$$
D_{\alpha} \frac{\partial^2 \mathcal{L}_g[C(x, t)](s)}{\partial x^2}.
$$
 (12)

The Green's function  $P(x, t | x_0)$  is interpreted as a probability density of finding a diffusing particle, located initially at  $x_0$ , at point *x* at time *t*. The *g*-Laplace transform of the Green's function is the following solution to Eq.  $(12)$  for the initial condition  $P(x, 0|x_0) = \delta(x - x_0)$ , where  $\delta$  denotes the  $\delta$ -Dirac function, and the boundary conditions  $\mathcal{L}_g[P(\pm\infty, t|x_0)](s) =$ 0,

$$
\mathcal{L}_g[P(x,t|x_0)](s) = \frac{1}{2\sqrt{D_\alpha}s^{1-\alpha/2}} e^{-\frac{|x-x_0|}{\sqrt{D_\alpha}}s^{\alpha/2}}.
$$
 (13)

From Eqs.  $(10)$  and  $(13)$  we obtain

$$
P(x, t|x_0) = \frac{1}{2\sqrt{D_{\alpha}}} f_{-1+\alpha/2, \alpha/2} \bigg( g(t); \frac{|x - x_0|}{\sqrt{D_{\alpha}}} \bigg). \tag{14}
$$

Equations  $(9)$  and  $(13)$  provide

$$
\sigma^{2}(t) = \frac{2D_{\alpha}}{\Gamma(1+\alpha)} g^{\alpha}(t). \tag{15}
$$

Putting  $g(t) \equiv t$  in Eq. (14), we get the Green's function for the ordinary subdiffusion equation

$$
P(x, t|x_0) = \frac{1}{2\sqrt{D_{\alpha}}} f_{-1+\alpha/2, \alpha/2} \bigg( t; \frac{|x - x_0|}{\sqrt{D_{\alpha}}} \bigg). \tag{16}
$$

We mention that  $f_{-1+\alpha/2,\alpha/2}$  is called the Mainardi function [\[54\]](#page-5-0).

#### **III. TRANSIENT SUBDIFFUSION**

We assume that at the initial moment the subdiffusion parameters are  $\alpha$  and  $D_{\alpha}$ , and in the long time limit they are  $\beta$ and  $D_\beta$ ,  $\alpha \neq \beta$ . Then

$$
\sigma^{2}(t) = \begin{cases} \frac{2D_{\alpha}}{\Gamma(1+\alpha)}t^{\alpha}, \ t \to 0, \\ \frac{2D_{\beta}}{\Gamma(1+\beta)}t^{\beta}, \ t \to \infty. \end{cases}
$$
 (17)

Equation  $(17)$  coincides with Eq.  $(15)$  if

$$
g(t) = \begin{cases} t, & t \to 0, \\ At^{\beta/\alpha}, & t \to \infty, \end{cases}
$$
(18)

<span id="page-2-0"></span>where

$$
A = \left(\frac{D_{\beta}\Gamma(1+\alpha)}{D_{\alpha}\Gamma(1+\beta)}\right)^{\frac{1}{\alpha}}.\tag{19}
$$

Guided by Eq.  $(18)$ , we propose

$$
g(t) = a(t)t + [1 - a(t)]At^{\beta/\alpha},
$$
 (20)

where a non-negative function *a* controls the process in intermediate times, fulfils the conditions  $a(0) = 1$ ,  $a(\infty) = 0$ , and *a* generates an increasing function *g* in the time domain. Since  $g(t) \rightarrow At^{\beta/\alpha}$  when  $t \rightarrow \infty$ , Eq. (20) provides the additional condition

$$
t \to \infty, \ a(t)t \to 0. \tag{21}
$$

The function *a* can be assumed as

$$
a(t) = \frac{1}{1 + \xi(t)},
$$
\n(22)

where  $\xi$  fulfils the conditions  $\xi(0) = 0$  and  $\xi(\infty) = \infty$ . In the following we consider the process in which

$$
\xi(t) = Bt^{\nu},\tag{23}
$$

where *B* is a parameter measured in the units of  $1/s^{1/\nu}$ . The conditions  $g(t)$ ,  $g'(t) > 0$  for  $t > 0$  are met for any  $\alpha$  and  $\beta$ ,  $\alpha, \beta \in (0, 1)$ , when  $\nu > 1$ . From Eqs. (20), (22), and (23) we get

$$
g(t) = \frac{t + ABt^{\frac{\beta}{\alpha} + \nu}}{1 + Bt^{\nu}},
$$
\n(24)

 $v > 1$ . In this case the Green's function reads

 $P(x, t|x_0)$ 

$$
=\frac{1}{2\sqrt{D_{\alpha}}}f_{-1+\alpha/2,\alpha/2}\bigg(\frac{t+ABt^{\frac{\beta}{\alpha}+\nu}}{1+Br^{\nu}};\frac{|x-x_0|}{\sqrt{D_{\alpha}}}\bigg),\quad(25)
$$

with  $v > 1$  and *A* given by Eq. (19).



FIG. 1. The Green's functions of the composite subdiffusion equation Eq. (25) that describes the transition  $(0.6, 10) \rightarrow (0.9, 20)$ (half-full symbols) for  $v = 1.2$ . The Green's functions of ordinary subdiffusion equation Eq. [\(16\)](#page-1-0) are calculated for  $\alpha = 0.6$  and  $D_{\alpha} =$ 10 (empty symbols) and for  $\beta = 0.9$  and  $D_\beta = 20$  (full symbols). Time values are given in the legend, and all quantities are given in arbitrarily chosen units.



FIG. 2. The description is similar to that for Fig. 1 but for  $v = 3.0$ .

The plots of the Green's functions Eq. (25) describing the process  $(\alpha, D_{\alpha}) \rightarrow (\beta, D_{\beta})$  are compared with the Green's functions for ordinary subdiffusion with parameters  $(\alpha, D_{\alpha})$ and  $(\beta, D_\beta)$  in Figs. 1[–4.](#page-3-0) We consider accelerated subdiffusion  $(0.6, 10) \rightarrow (0.9, 20)$  (then  $A = 2.81$ ) and delayed subdiffusion  $(0.9, 20) \rightarrow (0.6, 10)$   $(A = 0.50)$ , both for  $B =$ 0.1 and  $x_0 = 0$ , and all quantities are given in arbitrarily chosen units. The plots show that for larger  $\nu$  composite subdiffusion goes to the final process faster. The convergence to the final process seems to be faster for the  $(0.6, 10) \rightarrow (0.9, 20)$ process than for the  $(0.9, 20) \rightarrow (0.6, 10)$  one.

## **IV. PROPOSALS FOR A DIFFERENT USE OF THE COMPOSITE SUBDIFFUSION EQUATION**

In Sec. [III](#page-1-0) we have considered the subdiffusion process explicitly defined at some initial and final time intervals. We define the process in intermediate times by choosing the function *a* and using Eq.  $(20)$ . However, the composite subdiffusion equation can be used to describe a process for which



FIG. 3. The Green's functions for the process  $(0.9, 20) \rightarrow$ (0.6, 10). The description is similar to that of Fig. 1 for  $\nu = 1.2$ .

<span id="page-3-0"></span>

FIG. 4. The description is similar to that for Fig. [3](#page-2-0) but for  $v = 3.0$ .

MSD is known in the entire time domain. Let us assume that

$$
\sigma^2(t) = \eta(t),\tag{26}
$$

where  $\eta$  fulfils the conditions  $\eta(0) = 0$ ,  $\eta(\infty) = \infty$ , and  $\eta'(t) > 0$  for  $t > 0$ . We limit our considerations to subdiffusion which is defined here as follows: a diffusion process is subdiffusion if there exist numbers  $E > 0$  and  $\gamma \in (0, 1)$ such that  $\eta(t) < Et^{\gamma}$  for  $t > 0$ . For ordinary subdiffusion  $\eta$  is a power function, and for slow subdiffusion (ultraslow diffusion) the function contains a combination of logarithm functions. The overviews of the functions  $\eta$  for different diffusion processes are presented in Refs. [\[55,56\]](#page-5-0). Comparing Eq.  $(26)$  with Eq.  $(15)$ , we find that the composite subdiffusion equation, Eq. [\(4\)](#page-1-0), with

$$
g(t) = \left[\frac{\Gamma(1+\alpha)\eta(t)}{2D_{\alpha}}\right]^{1/\alpha},\tag{27}
$$

 $\alpha \in (0, 1)$ , describes the process which generates Eq. (26). Similar to the model considered in Sec. [III,](#page-1-0) it can be assumed that parameters  $\alpha$  and  $D_{\alpha}$ , occurring in the composite subdiffusion equation, characterize the subdiffusion process in some initial time interval.

It is interesting to use the composite subdiffusion equation to describe a subdiffusion process with a time-varying subdiffusion parameter  $\tilde{\alpha}(t) \in (0, 1)$ . This process can be de-scribed by the following equation [\[57,58\]](#page-5-0):

$$
\frac{c_{\partial} \tilde{\alpha}^{(t)} C(x,t)}{\partial t^{\tilde{\alpha}(t)}} = D_{\alpha} \frac{\partial^2 C(x,t)}{\partial x^2},\tag{28}
$$

with the Caputo-type fractional derivative <sup>*C*</sup><sub>∂</sub> $\tilde{a}^{(t)} f(t)/\partial t^{\tilde{\alpha}(t)} =$  $[1/\Gamma(1 - \tilde{\alpha}(t))] \int_0^t f'(\tau) (t - \tau)^{-\tilde{\alpha}(t)} d\tau$ . However, Eq. (28) is

- [1] J. P. Bouchaud and A. Georgies, Anomalous diffusion in disordered media: Statistical mechanisms, models [and physical applications,](https://doi.org/10.1016/0370-1573(90)90099-N) Phys. Rep. **195**, 127 (1990).
- [2] R. Metzler and J. Klafter, The random walk's guide to anoma[lous diffusion: A fractional dynamics approach,](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0370-1573(00)00070-3) Phys. Rep. **339**, 1 (2000).

difficult to solve; in practice it can be solved numerically [\[59\]](#page-5-0). For the process described by Eq.  $(28)$  there is [\[57\]](#page-5-0)

$$
\sigma^{2}(t) = \frac{2D_{\alpha}t^{\tilde{\alpha}(t)}}{\Gamma(1+\tilde{\alpha}(t))}.
$$
\n(29)

Assuming  $\tilde{\alpha}(0) = \alpha$ , from Eqs. (26), (27), and (29) we get

$$
g(t) = \left(\frac{\Gamma(1+\alpha)}{\Gamma(1+\tilde{\alpha}(t))}\right)^{1/\alpha} t^{\tilde{\alpha}(t)/\alpha}.
$$
 (30)

The composite subdiffusion equation with the function *g* Eq. (30) describes the subdiffusion process generating the relation (29). Then the Green's function is Eq. [\(14\)](#page-1-0) with *g* Eq. (30). The application of the composite subdiffusion equation to modeling processes with a time-varying subdiffusion parameter will be considered in more detail elsewhere.

### **V. FINAL REMARKS**

The aim of this paper is to present the composite subdiffusion equation and its application to describe transient subdiffusion from subdiffusion with parameters  $\alpha$  and  $D_{\alpha}$  to subdiffusion with parameters  $\beta$  and  $D_\beta$ . In intermediate times the subdiffusive parameters, defined by Eq.  $(3)$ , can remain unknown. However, by choosing the function *a* and using Eq. [\(20\)](#page-2-0), we define the process in intermediate times. The model uses the composite subdiffusion equation with a Caputo fractional time derivative with respect to another function *g*, Eq. [\(4\)](#page-1-0). We have considered a special case of the function *g*, Eq. [\(24\)](#page-2-0), which describes accelerating subdiffusion when  $\alpha < \beta$  and slowing subdiffusion when  $\alpha > \beta$ .

We have also shown that the process for which the time evolution of MSD  $\sigma^2(t)$  is defined in the entire time domain can be described by the composite subdiffusion equation with the function given by Eq.  $(27)$ . This equation is solvable by means of the *g*-Laplace transform method and can be used to model diffusion processes, e.g., in a membrane system, assuming appropriate boundary conditions at the membrane. Of course,  $\sigma^2(t)$  do not always define the diffusion process unambiguously. An example of this is the combination of ordinary subdiffusion and superdiffusion, which leads to the relation  $\sigma^2(t) \sim t$  characteristic of normal diffusion [\[60\]](#page-5-0). In this paper we consider subdiffusion processes, the parameters of which may change over time; normal diffusion is treated here as a special case of subdiffusion for  $\alpha = 1$ . When the initial process is ordinary subdiffusion, the stochastic interpretation of this process can be found using the modified continuous time random walk model, see Ref. [\[48\]](#page-5-0). However, for other processes described by the composite subdiffusion equation, there is no stochastic model so far.

<sup>[3]</sup> R. Metzler and J. Klafter, The restaurant at the end of the random walk: Recent developments in the description of [anomalous transport by fractional dynamics,](https://doi.org/10.1088/0305-4470/37/31/R01) J. Phys. A: Math. Gen. **37**, R161 (2004).

<sup>[4]</sup> J. Klafter and I. M. Sokolov, *First Step in Random Walks. From Tools to Applications* (Oxford University Press, New York, 2011).

- <span id="page-4-0"></span>[5] B. Hughes, *Random Walks and Random Environments* (Clarendon Press, Oxford, 1995), Vol. 1.
- [6] J. H. Jeon, N. Leijnse, L. B. Oddershede, and R. Metzler, Anomalous diffusion and power-law relaxation of the time averaged mean squared displacement in worm-like micellar solutions, New J. Phys. **15**[, 045011 \(2013\).](https://doi.org/10.1088/1367-2630/15/4/045011)
- [7] A. Godec, M. Bauer, and R. Metzler, Collective dynamics effect transient subdiffusion of inert tracers in flexible gel networks, New J. Phys. **16**[, 092002 \(2014\).](https://doi.org/10.1088/1367-2630/16/9/092002)
- [8] N. Alcázar–Cano and R. Delgado–Buscalioni, A general phenomenological relation for the subdiffusive exponent of [anomalous diffusion in disordered media,](https://doi.org/10.1039/C8SM01961D) Soft Matter **14**, 9937 (2018).
- [9] A. G. Cherstvy, S. Thapa, C. E. Wagner, and R. Metzler, Non-Gaussian, non-ergodic, and non-Fickian diffusion of tracers in mucin hydrogels, Soft Matter **15**[, 2526 \(2019\).](https://doi.org/10.1039/C8SM02096E)
- [10] O. Lieleg, I. Vladescu, and K. Ribbeck, Characterization of [particle translocation through mucin hydrogels,](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bpj.2010.01.012) Biophys. J. **98**, 1782 (2010).
- [11] I. Y. Wong, M. L. Gardel, D. R. Reichman, E. R. Weeks, M. T. Valentine, A. R. Bausch, and D. A. Weitz, Anomalous Diffusion Probes Microstructure Dynamics of Entangled F-Actin Networks, Phys. Rev. Lett. **92**[, 178101 \(2004\).](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevLett.92.178101)
- [12] T. Kosztołowicz and R. Metzler, Diffusion of antibiotics through a biofilm in the presence of diffusion and absorption barriers, Phys. Rev. E **102**[, 032408 \(2020\).](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevE.102.032408)
- [13] T. Kosztołowicz, R. Metzler, S. Wąsik, and M. Arabski, Modelling experimentally measured of ciprofloxacin antibiotic diffusion in *Pseudomonas aeruginosa* biofilm formed in artificial sputum medium, PLoS One **15**[, e0243003 \(2020\).](https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0243003)
- [14] T. Kosztołowicz, K. Dworecki, and S. Mrówczyński, How to [Measure Subdiffusion Parameters,](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevLett.94.170602) Phys. Rev. Lett. **94**, 170602 (2005).
- [15] R. Metzler, J. Klafter, and I. M. Sokolov, Anomalous transport in external fields: Continuous time random walks and [fractional diffusion equations extended,](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevE.58.1621) Phys. Rev. E **58**, 1621 (1998).
- [16] I. M. Sokolov, J. Klafter, and A. Blumen, Fractional kinetics, Phys. Today **55**[\(11\), 48 \(2002\).](https://doi.org/10.1063/1.1535007)
- [17] I. M. Sokolov and J. Klafter, From diffusion to anomalous [diffusion: A century after Einstein's Brownian motion,](https://doi.org/10.1063/1.1860472) Chaos **15**, 026103 (2005).
- [18] E. Barkai, R. Metzler, and J. Klafter, From continuous time [random walks to the fractional Fokker-Planck equation,](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevE.61.132) Phys. Rev. E **61**, 132 (2000).
- [19] A. Compte, Stochastic foundations of fractional dynamics, Phys. Rev. E **53**[, 4191 \(1996\).](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevE.53.4191)
- [20] G. G. Anderson and G. A. O'Toole, *Bacterial Biofilms*, Current Topics in Microbiology and Immunology, Vol. 322 (Springer, Berlin, 2008), p. 85.
- [21] T. F. C. Mah and G. A. O'Toole, Mechanisms of biofilm [resistance to antimicrobial agents,](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0966-842X(00)01913-2) Trends Microbiol. **9**, 34 (2001).
- [22] R. D. L. Hanes, M. Schmiedeberg, and S. U. Egelhaaf, Brownian particles on rough substrates: Relation between intermediate [subdiffusion and asymptotic long-time diffusion,](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevE.88.062133) Phys. Rev. E **88**, 062133 (2013).
- [23] P. Roth and I. M. Sokolov, Inhomogeneous parametric scaling [and variable-order fractional diffusion equations,](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevE.102.012133) Phys. Rev. E **102**, 012133 (2020).
- [24] W. Chen, J. Zhang, and J. Zhang, A variable-order timefractional derivative model for chloride ions sub-diffusion in concrete structure, [Fract. Calc. Appl. Analys.](https://doi.org/10.2478/s13540-013-0006-y) **16**, 76 (2013).
- [25] S. Fedotov and D. Han, Asymptotic Behavior of the Solution of the Space Dependent Variable Order Fractional Diffusion [Equation: Ultraslow Anomalous Aggregation,](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevLett.123.050602) Phys. Rev. Lett. **123**, 050602 (2019).
- [26] A. V. Chechkin, R. Gorenflo, and I. M. Sokolov, Fractional [diffusion in inhomogeneous media,](https://doi.org/10.1088/0305-4470/38/42/L03) J. Phys. A: Math. Gen. **38**, L679 (2005).
- [27] S. Vitali, P. Paradisi, and G. Pagnini, Anomalous diffusion orig[inated by two Markovian hopping–traps mechanisms,](https://doi.org/10.1088/1751-8121/ac677f) J. Phys. A: Math. Theor. **55**, 224012 (2022).
- [28] A. I. Saichev and S. G. Utkin, Random walks with intermediate [anomalous–diffusion asymptotics,](https://doi.org/10.1134/1.1800201) J. Exp. Theor. Phys. **99**, 443 (2004).
- [29] T. Sandev, W. Deng, and P. Xu, Models for characterizing the transition among anomalous diffusion with different diffusion exponents, [J. Phys. A: Math. Theor.](https://doi.org/10.1088/1751-8121/aad8c9) **51**, 405002 (2018).
- [30] T. Sandev, R. Metzler, and A. Chechkin, From continuous ran[dom walks to the generalized diffusion equation,](https://doi.org/10.1515/fca-2018-0002) Frac. Calc. Appl. Analys. **21**, 10 (2018).
- [31] E. Awad, T. Sandev, R. Metzler, and A. Chechkin, Closed-form multi-dimensional solutions and asymptotic behaviors for sub[diffusive processes with crossovers: I. Retarding case,](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chaos.2021.111357) Chaos Solit. Fract. **152**, 111357 (2021).
- [32] C. Angstmann and B. I. Henry, Continuous-time random walks [that alter environmental transport properties,](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevE.84.061146) Phys. Rev. E **84**, 061146 (2011).
- [33] R. Hilfer and L. Anton, Fractional master equations [and fractal time random walks,](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevE.51.R848) Phys. Rev. E **51**, R848 (1995).
- [34] T. Kosztołowicz and A. Dutkiewicz, Subdiffusion equation with Caputo fractional derivative with respect to another function, Phys. Rev. E **104**[, 014118 \(2021\).](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevE.104.014118)
- [35] I. M. Sokolov, Thermodynamics and fractional Fokker-Planck equations, Phys. Rev. E **63**[, 056111 \(2001\).](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevE.63.056111)
- [36] W. Feller, *An Introduction to Probability Theory and Its Applications* (Wiley, New York, 1968), Vol. 2.
- [37] A. V. Chechkin, F. Seno, R. Metzler, and I. M. Sokolov, Brownian yet Non-Gaussian Diffusion: From Superstatistics [to Subordination of Diffusing Diffusivities,](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevX.7.021002) Phys. Rev. X **7**, 021002 (2017).
- [38] B. Dybiec and E. Gudowska–Nowak, Subordinated diffusion [and continuous time random walk asymptotics,](https://doi.org/10.1063/1.3522761) Chaos **20**, 043129 (2010).
- [39] A. Stanislavsky and A. Weron, Accelerating and retarding [anomalous diffusion: A Bernstein function approach,](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevE.101.052119) Phys Rev. E **101**, 052119 (2020).
- [40] A. Stanislavsky and A. Weron, Control of the transient subd[iffusion exponent at short and long times,](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevResearch.1.023006) Phys. Rev. Res. **1**, 023006 (2019).
- [41] E. J. Carr, Characteristic time scales for diffusion processes [through layers and across interfaces,](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevE.97.042115) Phys. Rev. E **97**, 042115 (2018).
- [42] F. Le Vot, E. Abad, and S. B. Yuste, Continuous-time random[walk model for anomalous diffusion in expanding media,](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevE.96.013004) Phys. Rev. E **96**, 013004 (2017).
- <span id="page-5-0"></span>[43] A. V. Chechkin, R. Gorenflo, and I. M. Sokolov, Retarding subdiffusion and accelerating superdiffusion governed by [distributed-order fractional diffusion equations,](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevE.66.046129) Phys. Rev. E **66**, 046129 (2002).
- [44] A. V. Chechkin, V. Yu. Gonchar, R. Gorenflo, N. Korabel, and I. M. Sokolov, Generalized fractional diffusion equations for [accelerating subdiffusion and truncated Levy flights,](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevE.78.021111) Phys. Rev. E **78**, 021111 (2008).
- [45] S. Orzeł, W. Mydlarczyk, and A. Jurlewicz, Accelerating subdiffusions governed by multiple-order time-fractional diffusion equations: Stochastic representation by a subordinated Brown[ian motion and computer simulations,](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevE.87.032110) Phys. Rev. E **87**, 032110 (2013).
- [46] C. H. Eab and S. C. Lim, Fractional Langevin equations of distributed order, Phys. Rev. E **83**[, 031136 \(2011\).](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevE.83.031136)
- [47] C. H. Eab and S. C. Lim, Accelerating and retarding anomalous diffusion, [J. Phys. A: Math. Theor.](https://doi.org/10.1088/1751-8113/45/14/145001) **45**, 145001 (2012).
- [48] T. Kosztołowicz and A. Dutkiewicz, Stochastic interpretation of *g*-subdiffusion process, Phys. Rev. E **104**[, L042101 \(2021\).](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevE.104.L042101)
- [49] T. Kosztołowicz, First passage time for the *g*-subdiffusion process of vanishing particles, Phys. Rev. E **106**[, L022104 \(2022\).](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevE.106.L022104)
- [50] R. Almeida, A Caputo fractional derivative of a function with respect to another function, [Commun. Nonlinear Sci. Numer.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cnsns.2016.09.006) Simulat. **44**, 460 (2017).
- [51] R. Garra, A. Giusti, and F. Mainardi, The fractional Dodson [diffusion equation: A new approach,](https://doi.org/10.1007/s11587-018-0354-3) Ricerche mat. **67**, 899 (2018).
- [52] R. Garra, F. Falcini, V. R. Voller, and G. Pagnini, A generalized Stefan model accounting for system memory and

non-locality, [Int. Commun. Heat Mass Transf.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.icheatmasstransfer.2020.104584) **114**, 104584 (2020).

- [53] F. Jarad and T. Abdeljawad, Generalized fractional derivatives and Laplace transform, [Discrete Contin. Dyn. Syst., Ser. S](https://doi.org/10.3934/dcdss.2020039) **13**, 709 (2020).
- [54] G. Pagnini, The M–Wright function as a generalization of the [Gaussian density for fractional diffusion processes,](https://doi.org/10.2478/s13540-013-0027-6) Frac. Calc. Appl. Anal. **16**, 436 (2013).
- [55] R. Metzler, J.-H. Jeon, A. G. Cherstvy, and E. Barkai, Anomalous diffusion models and their properties: Non-stationarity, non-ergodicity, and ageing at the centenary of single particle tracking, [Phys. Chem. Chem. Phys.](https://doi.org/10.1039/C4CP03465A) **16**, 24128 (2014).
- [56] A. G. Cherstvy, H. Safdari, and R. Metzler, Anomalous diffusion, nonergodicity, and ageing for exponentially and logarithmically time-dependent diffusivity: Striking differences for [massive versus massless particles,](https://doi.org/10.1088/1361-6463/abdff0) J. Phys. D: Appl. Phys. **54**, 195401 (2021).
- [57] H. G. Sun, W. Chen, H. Sheng, and Y. Chen, On mean square displacement behaviors of anomalous diffusions with variable and random orders, [Phys. Lett. A](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.physleta.2009.12.021) **374**, 906 (2010).
- [58] H. G. Sun, W. Chen, and Y. Chen, Variable-order fractional [differential operators in anomalous diffusion modeling,](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.physa.2009.07.024) Physica A **388**, 4586 (2009).
- [59] H. G. Sun, W. Chen, C. Li, and Y. Chen, Finite difference schemes for variable-order time fractional diffusion equation, [Int. J. Bifurcat. Chaos](https://doi.org/10.1142/S021812741250085X) **22**, 1250085 (2012).
- [60] B. Dybiec and E. Gudowska–Nowak, Discriminating between [normal and anomalous random walks,](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevE.80.061122) Phys. Rev. E **80**, 061122 (2009).