## Einstein spaces in warped geometries in five dimensions

M. Arık,\* A. Baykal,<sup>†</sup> M. C. Çalık,<sup>‡</sup> D. Çiftçi,<sup>§</sup> and Ö. Delice<sup>||</sup> Department of Physics, Boğaziçi University, Bebek, Istanbul, Turkey (Received 9 July 2003; published 8 December 2003)

We investigate five-dimensional Einstein spaces in warped geometries from the point of view of the fourdimensional physically relevant Robertson-Walker-Friedman cosmological metric and the Schwarzschild metric. We show that a four-dimensional cosmology with a closed spacelike section and a cosmological constant can be embedded into five-dimensional flat space-time.

DOI: 10.1103/PhysRevD.68.123503

PACS number(s): 98.80.Cq, 98.70.Vc

The general theory of relativity is an experimentally welltested theory. Among these tests, the Schwarzschild solution has played a central role. For cosmological solutions, however, the situation is beginning to become clarified with the accumulation of relevant astrophysical data. On the one hand, a simple, consistent, logical cosmology requires a spatially maximally symmetric Robertson-Walker-Friedman cosmology with closed spacelike sections (k=1). Recent observational evidence shows that we live in an expanding closed universe with a positive cosmological constant [1]. The maximally symmetric Einstein–de Sitter solutions are good prototypes of such space-times since they include the cosmological constant. However, the existence of the cosmological constant is one of the deep mysteries in cosmology.

Since the Kaluza-Klein idea [2], there have been many theories suggesting that the Universe may have more than four dimensions. Nowadays, the idea that our Universe may be a three-brane embedded in five-dimensional universe is very popular [3-5]. For a recent review see [6].

The recent interest in the Randall-Sundrum [4,5] and related scenarios has brought into consideration warped geometries such that the four-dimensional spacetime metric is multiplied by a warp factor which only depends on the coordinate of the extra dimension: namely,

$$ds_{(5)}^2 = dw \otimes dw + b^2(w) \eta_{\mu\nu} dx^{\mu} \otimes dx^{\nu}, \qquad (1)$$

where  $b(w) = e^{-k|w|}$  is the warp factor, *k* is a constant and  $\eta_{\mu\nu} = \text{diag}(-1,1,1,1)$ . In their second scenario [5], where the range of the extra dimensions *w* is  $-\infty < w < +\infty$ , we live on a four-dimensional infinitely thin shell (three-brane). Notice that the five-dimensional Einstein tensor outside the brane satisfies the Einstein equation with a cosmological constant:

$$^{(5)}G_{MN} + g_{MN}\Lambda_5 = 0, \quad M, N = 0, 1, 2, 3, 5$$
 (2)

and on w = const hypersurfaces 4-dimensional Einstein tensor of this metric satisfies

late all possible solutions we find in Table I. We then consider the four-dimensional metric to be given by spherically symmetric static Schwarzschild solution. For this metric we also find all possible solutions b(w) when

$$^{(4)}G_{\mu\nu} + g_{\mu\nu}\Lambda_4 = 0, \quad \mu, \nu = 0, 1, 2, 3, \tag{3}$$

where  $\Lambda_5 = -6k^2$  and  $\Lambda_4 = 0$ . The full Einstein tensor of the 5-dimensional space-time of the metric (1) is given by

$$^{(5)}G_{MN} = -\eta_{MN}\Lambda_5 - 6k\,\delta^{\mu}_M\delta^{\nu}_N\eta_{\mu\nu}\delta(w). \tag{4}$$

Motivated by these considerations, in this work we will calculate five-dimensional Einstein equations of the metric (1) for arbitrary b(w) in terms of the four-dimensional quantities originating from the four-dimensional metric

$$ds_{(4)}^2 = g_{\mu\nu} dx^{\mu} \otimes dx^{\nu}, \tag{5}$$

and b(w). As in the Randall-Sundrum scenario we do not wish any matter sources to survive on five-dimensional space-time except a possible five-dimensional cosmological constant. Our most important conclusion will be that a fourdimensional cosmological constant can be induced even when the five-dimensional cosmological constant is zero. We require that only gravity can propagate in extra dimensions. Thus the five-dimensional space-time is an Einstein space where the original Randall-Sundrum metric will be one of the cases of our solutions. Then, as in the Randall-Sundrum scenario we impose reflection  $(Z_2)$  symmetry on the extra dimension w. This symmetry will make the derivatives of the metric discontinuous with respect to w at the point of symmetry and we know from the thin shell formalism of general relativity [7] that this discontinuity will give rise to a surface layer (thin shell - brane). The resulting five-dimensional Einstein tensor will be of the form (4). Since in our solutions four-dimensional part of the metric is same for every w, the brane tension [the term proportional to  $\delta(w)$ ] is caused only by the jump of b'(w) on the brane.

the four-dimensional metric, we first consider the fourdimensional cosmological solutions of Einstein equations where the four-dimensional space-time is an Einstein space and the four-dimensional hypersurface is devoid of matter except a four-dimensional cosmological constant. We tabulate all possible solutions we find in Table I.

After calculating the five-dimensional metric in terms of

<sup>\*</sup>Electronic address: arikm@boun.edu.tr

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>†</sup>Electronic address: baykala@boun.edu.tr

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>‡</sup>Electronic address: cem.calik@boun.edu.tr

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>§</sup>Electronic address: dciftci@boun.edu.tr

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>®</sup>Electronic address: odelice@boun.edu.tr

TABLE I. $b(w), a(t), c(\chi)$ and other quantities for 5D Einstein space when 4D part is of the form (6).										
k	$c(\chi)$	a(t)	b(w)	$R_{NPQ}^{M(5)}$	<b>R</b> <sup>(5)</sup>	$\Lambda_5$	$R^{\mu(4)}_{\nu\lambda\kappa}$	<b>R</b> <sup>(4)</sup>	$\Lambda_4$	R <sup>(3)</sup>
0	X	1	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	
			e <sup>bow</sup>	$-b_{0}^{2}$	$-20b_{0}^{2}$	$-6b_{0}^{2}$	0			
		$e^{a_0t}$	<i>a</i> <sub>0</sub> <i>w</i>	0	0	0	$a_0^2$	$12a_0^2$	3 <i>a</i> <sub>0</sub> <sup>2</sup>	0
			$\frac{a_0}{b_0}\sinh(b_0w)$	$-b_{0}^{2}$	$-20b_0^2$	$-6b_{0}^{2}$	$a_0^2$			
			$\frac{a_0}{b_0}\sin(b_0w)$	$b_{0}^{2}$	20b <sub>0</sub> <sup>2</sup>	$6b_0^2$	$a_{0}^{2}$			
1	$\frac{1}{c_0}\sin(c_0\chi)$	$\frac{c_0}{a_0} \cosh(a_0 t)$	a <sub>0</sub> w	0	0	0	$a_0^2$			
			$\frac{a_0}{b_0}\sinh(b_0w)$	$-b_{0}^{2}$	$-20b_{0}^{2}$	$-6b_{0}^{2}$	$a_0^2$	$12a_0^2$	$3a_0^2$	6 <i>c</i> <sub>0</sub> <sup>2</sup>
			$\frac{a_0}{b_0}\sin(b_0w)$	$b_{0}^{2}$	$20b_0^2$	$6b_0^2$	$a_0^2$			
	$\frac{1}{c_0}\sinh(c_0\chi)$	c <sub>0</sub> t	1	0	0	0	0	0	0	
			$e^{b_0 w}$	$-b_{0}^{2}$	$-20b_0^2$	$-6b_0^2$	0			
-1		$\frac{c_0}{a_0}\sinh(a_0t)$	a <sub>0</sub> w	0	0	0	$a_{0}^{2}$	$12a_0^2$		$-6c_0^2$
			$\frac{a_0}{b_0}\sinh(b_0w)$	$-b_{0}^{2}$	$-20b_0^2$	$-6b_0^2$	$a_{0}^{2}$		$3a_0^2$	
			$\frac{a_0}{b_0}\sin(b_0w)$	$b_{0}^{2}$	$20b_0^2$	$6b_0^2$	$a_0^2$			
		$\frac{c_0}{a_0}\sin(a_0t)$	$\frac{a_0}{b_0}\cosh(b_0w)$	$-b_{0}^{2}$	$-20b_{0}^{2}$	$-6b_{0}^{2}$	$-a_{0}^{2}$	$-12a_{0}^{2}$	$-3a_{0}^{2}$	

TABLE I.  $b(w), a(t), c(\chi)$  and other quantities for 5D Einstein space when 4D part is of the form (6).

five-dimensional metric is an Einstein space and collect them in Table II. Then we will also make some comments on these solutions.

Our five-dimensional metric ansatz can be written in an orthonormal basis as

$$ds_{(5)}^{2} = dw \otimes dw + b(w)^{2} \times \{g_{\mu\nu}(x^{\rho})dx^{\mu} \otimes dx^{\nu}\}, \quad (6)$$

$$=\eta_{AB}E^{A}\otimes E^{B},\tag{7}$$

where the four-dimensional metric is also written in an orthonormal basis:

$$ds_{(4)}^2 = g_{ij}dx^i \otimes dx^j = \eta_{ij}e^i \otimes e^j.$$
(8)

The orthonormal basis one forms are chosen as

$$E^{i} = b(w)e^{i}, \quad E^{4} = ibe^{4} = ibdt, \quad E^{5} = dw.$$
 (9)

Note that for the sake of computational simplicity, we chose the timelike one form imaginary so that we can take  $\eta_{AB}$  as  $\delta_{AB}$  and  $\eta_{ij}$  as  $\delta_{ij}$ . The indices run as  $A, B, \ldots = 1, 2, 3, 4, 5$  and i, j = 1, 2, 3, 4.

Employing Cartan structure equations, we find the non-zero components of the Riemann tensor as follows:

$\Lambda_4$	b(w)	<b>R</b> <sup>(5)</sup>	$\Lambda_5$	<b>R</b> <sup>(4)</sup>	
	1	0	0		
0	e <sup>b0w</sup>	$-20b_0^2$	$-6b_{0}^{2}$	0	
	w	0	0		
3 <i>d</i> <sub>0</sub>	$\frac{d_0}{b_0}\sinh(b_0w)$	$-20b_{0}^{2}$	$-6b_{0}^{2}$	$12d_0^2$	
	$\frac{d_0}{b_0}\sin(b_0w)$	$20b_0^2$	$6b_0^2$		
$-3d_0$	$\frac{d_0}{b_0} \cosh(b_0 w)$	$-20b_{0}^{2}$	$-6b_{0}^{2}$	$-12d_{0}^{2}$	

TABLE II. b(w) for different signs of  $b_0$ .

$${}^{(5)}R^{ij}_{\ kl} = \frac{{}^{(4)}R^{ij}_{\ kl}}{b^2} - \delta^{ij}_{kl}\frac{b'^2}{b^2}, \quad {}^{(4)}R^{i5}_{\ i5} = -\frac{b''}{b}, \quad (10)$$

where the ' on the functions denote derivatives of the functions with respect to their arguments, and  $\delta_{kl}^{ij}$  is generalized Kronecker delta. The Ricci curvature scalar is found as

$${}^{(5)}R = \frac{{}^{(4)}R}{b^2} - 8\frac{b''}{b} - 12\frac{b'^2}{b^2},$$
(11)

Using these one can easily calculate the nonzero components of the Einstein tensor  $G_{AB}^{(5)}$  of the metric (6) as

$$^{(5)}G_{ij} = \frac{{}^{(4)}G_{ij}}{b^2} + \delta_{ij} \left\{ 3\frac{b''}{b} + 3\frac{b'^2}{b^2} \right\},$$
(12)

$$^{(5)}G_{55} = -\frac{R^{(4)}}{2b^2} + \frac{6b'^2}{b^2}.$$
 (13)

We have calculated the nonzero components of the fivedimensional Einstein tensor for the metric (6) in terms of b(w) and the four-dimensional Einstein tensor of the metric (8). Since we want to first investigate the cosmological solutions we chose four-dimensional metric ansatz as follows:

$$ds_{(4)}^2 = -dt^2 + a(t)^2 ds_3^2, (14)$$

where

$$ds_{(3)}^{2} = d\chi^{2} + c(\chi)^{2} d\Omega_{2}^{2}, \quad d\Omega_{2}^{2} = d\theta^{2} + \sin^{2}\theta d\phi^{2}.$$
(15)

Here we will find admissible values of  $b(w), a(t), c(\chi)$  when the Einstein equations satisfy Eqs. (2) and (3). We can read off the orthonormal basis one forms  $e^i$  from Eqs. (14) and (15):

$$e^{i} = \{e^{4}, a(t)e^{a}\}, \quad e^{4} = idt,$$
$$e^{a} = \{d\chi, c(\chi)d\theta, c(\chi)\sin\theta d\phi\}, \quad a, b \dots = 1, 2, 3$$

For Eq. (10) the nonzero components of the fourdimensional Riemann tensor are found as

$${}^{(4)}R^{ab}_{\ cd} = \frac{{}^{(3)}R^{ab}_{\ cd}}{a^2} + \delta^{ab}_{\ cd}\frac{\dot{a}^2}{a^2}, \quad {}^{(4)}R^{a4}_{\ a4} = \frac{\ddot{a}}{a}, \quad (16)$$

and

$${}^{(3)}R^{12}_{12} = {}^{(3)}R^{13}_{13} = -\frac{\check{c}}{c}, \quad {}^{(3)}R^{23}_{23} = \frac{1-\check{c}^2}{c}. \quad (17)$$

For the Ricci curvature scalar (11), we have

$${}^{(4)}R = \frac{{}^{(3)}R}{a^2} + 6\left\{\frac{\ddot{a}}{a} + \frac{\dot{a}^2}{a^2}\right\}, \quad {}^{(3)}R = -4\frac{\ddot{c}}{c} + 2\frac{1 - \ddot{c}^2}{c^2}.$$
(18)

The Einstein tensor for this metric (14) is

$$^{(4)}G_{ab} = \frac{{}^{(3)}G_{ab}}{a^2} - \delta_{ab} \left\{ \frac{2\ddot{a}}{a} + \frac{\dot{a}^2}{a^2} \right\},\tag{19}$$

$$^{(4)}G_{44} = -\frac{R^{(3)}}{2a^2} - 3\frac{\dot{a}^2}{a^2},$$
(20)

where

$${}^{(3)}G_{11} = \frac{\check{c}^2 - 1}{c^2}, \quad {}^{(3)}G_{22} = {}^{(3)}G_{33} = \frac{\check{c}}{c}.$$
 (21)

Let us combine all these, then  ${}^{(5)}G_{AB}$  becomes

$$^{(5)}G_{11} = \left\{ \frac{\check{c}^2 - 1}{a^2 c^2} - \left( 2\frac{\ddot{a}}{a} + \frac{\dot{a}^2}{a^2} \right) \right\} \frac{1}{b^2} + \frac{3b''}{b} + \frac{3b'^2}{b^2},$$
(22)

$$^{(5)}G_{22} = \left\{ \frac{\overset{\circ}{c}}{a^2c} - \left( 2\frac{\ddot{a}}{a} + \frac{\dot{a}^2}{a^2} \right) \right\} \frac{1}{b^2} + \frac{3b''}{b} + \frac{3b'^2}{b^2} = {}^{(5)}G_{33}, \qquad (23)$$

$$^{(5)}G_{44} = \left\{ \frac{2\ddot{c}}{a^2c} + \frac{\ddot{c}^2 - 1}{a^2c^2} - 3\frac{\dot{a}^2}{a^2} \right\} \frac{1}{b^2} + \frac{3b''}{b} + \frac{3b'^2}{b^2},$$
(24)

$$^{(5)}G_{55} = \left\{ \frac{2\ddot{c}}{a^2c} + \frac{\check{c}^2 - 1}{a^2c^2} - 3\left(\frac{\ddot{a}}{a} + \frac{\dot{a}^2}{a^2}\right) \right\} \frac{1}{b^2} + \frac{6b'^2}{b^2}.$$
(25)

As we said before, we want to solve these for *a* and *b* from<sup>(5)</sup> $G_{AB} + \delta_{AB}\Lambda_5 = 0$ . For<sup>(5)</sup> $G_{11} = {}^{(5)}G_{22}$  we get the following differential equation:

$$\frac{\check{c}}{c} = \frac{\check{c}^2 - 1}{c^2} \tag{26}$$

whose set of solutions is

$$c(\chi) = \left\{ \chi, \frac{1}{c_0} \sin(c_0 \chi), \frac{1}{c_0} \sinh(c_0 \chi) \right\}, \qquad (27)$$

which correspond respectively to the cases k = 0, 1, -1.

For k=0,  ${}^{(5)}G_{ii}={}^{(5)}G_{44}$  gives the following differential equation:

$$\frac{\ddot{a}}{a} = \frac{\dot{a}^2}{a^2},\tag{28}$$

whose set of solutions is

$$a(t) = \{1; e^{a_0 t}\}.$$
(29)

For the a=1 case,  ${}^{(5)}G_{ii}={}^{(5)}G_{55}$  gives the equation

$$\frac{b''}{b} = \frac{b'^2}{h^2},$$

whose set of solutions is

$$b(w) = \{1; e^{b_0 w}\}.$$

Finally, for the  $a = e^{a_0 t}$  case, we have

$$\frac{b''}{b} = \frac{b'^2 - a_0^2}{b^2},$$

whose set of solutions is

$$b(w) = \left\{ a_0 w; \frac{a_0}{b_0} \sinh(b_0 w); \frac{a_0}{b_0} \sin(b_0 w) \right\}$$

In the same way, we can easily find the solutions for  $k = \pm 1$ . All solutions are shown in Table I. As in the Randall-Sundrum case, to have a brane embedded in five dimensions for these solutions we have to impose  $Z_2$  symmetry on b(w). Then our four-dimensional universe will be an infinitely thin shell at w=0 and the total five-dimensional Einstein tensor will have of the form:

$$^{(5)}_{(T)}G_{AB} = {}^{(5)}G_{AB} + 6\frac{b'}{b}\delta(w)$$
$$= -\Lambda_5\delta_{AB} - \sigma\delta_{AB}\delta^A_\mu\delta^B_\nu\delta(w). \tag{30}$$

The k=1 case corresponds to closed expanding universe with positive cosmological constant, which is in accordance with recent observations [1]. For this case, Table I shows that b(w) can take three different values: {w;sinh w;sin w}. The first of these is very interesting since in this case the fivedimensional Riemann tensor and the five-dimensional cosmological constant are zero.

To have a k=1 solution with  ${}^{(5)}R^{MN}_{PQ}=0$  for this geometry, it is necessary to have nonzero  $\Lambda_4$ . So, flat and empty five-dimensional Minkowski universe in warped geometry (6) can give rise to a four-dimensional closed expanding universe with positive cosmological constant. Imposing  $Z_2$  symmetry, the metric for this case becomes

$$ds_{(5)}^{2} = dw^{2} + (a_{0}|w|)^{2} \left\{ -dt^{2} + \frac{c_{0}^{2}}{a_{0}^{2}} \cosh^{2}(a_{0}t) \times \left\{ d\chi^{2} + \frac{1}{c_{0}^{2}} \sin^{2}(c_{0}\chi) d\Omega_{2}^{2} \right\} \right\},$$
(31)

with

$$^{(5)}G_{\mu\nu} = -6b'/b\,\delta_{\mu\nu}\delta(w),$$

$$^{(5)}G_{55} = {}^{(5)}G_{5\mu} = 0, \quad {}^{(4)}G_{\mu\nu} = -\Lambda_4\delta_{\mu\nu}. \quad (32)$$

For this case the matter content of the four-dimensional universe is only the four-dimensional cosmological constant. In fact, observations show that, the cosmological constant dominates the matter content of the Universe. According to the recent review [8], the composition of the content of the Universe is as follows:

$$\Omega_B \approx (0.01 - 0.2), \quad \Omega_R \approx 2 \times 10^{-5},$$
$$\Omega_{DM} \approx 0.3, \quad \Omega_\Lambda \approx 0.7, \tag{33}$$

where  $\Omega_B$  is the density parameter of the visible, nonrelativistic, baryonic matter;  $\Omega_R$  is the density parameter of the radiation;  $\Omega_{DM}$  is the density parameter of the pressureless nonbaryonic dark matter; and  $\Omega_{\Lambda}$  is the density parameter of the cosmological constant. According to the observations which use several independent techniques, the density parameter of the nonrelativistic matter is  $\Omega_{NR} = (\Omega_B + \Omega_{(DM)})$  $\approx$  (0.2–0.4). This raises the possibility whether with just a four-dimensional cosmological constant the five-dimensional space-time is flat except on the brane. Other kinds of matter in four dimensions require the five-dimensional space-time to fluctuate from flat. Thus the presence of five dimensions differentiates between "dark energy" satisfying equation of state  $p = -\rho$  and other forms of matter-energy. Although four-dimensional de Sitter space with positive cosmological constant is consistent with five-dimensional flat space-time, other types of matter-energy in four dimensions require the five-dimensional space-time to fluctuate from flatness.

Now we turn to discuss the four-dimensional Schwarzschild solution from the five-dimensional point of view. Let us choose  $ds_{(4)}^2$  as Schwarzschild–de Sitter metric which satisfies Eq. (3) and is given by

$$ds_{(4)}^{2} = -\left\{1 - \frac{2m}{r} - d_{0}r^{2}\right\}dt^{2} + \left\{1 - \frac{2m}{r} - d_{0}r^{2}\right\}^{-1}dr^{2} + r^{2}d\Omega_{2}^{2}.$$
(34)

We find b(w) for  $d_0 < 0, d_0 > 0, d_0 = 0$  when the metric (6) satisfies Eq. (2) and presented in the Table II. Note that for m=0 and for  $d_0 > 0$ , the Schwarzschild-de Sitter metric becomes a maximally symmetric metric and this metric can be written in a form where spacelike sections are closed. The metric (34) can be transformed into

$$ds_{(4)}^2 = -dt'^2 + \cosh^2(t') \{ d\chi^2 + \sin^2\chi d\Omega_2^2 \}$$
(35)

with the following transformation:

$$r = \cosh(t')\sin(\chi),$$
  
$$t = \ln\left\{\frac{\sinh(t') + \cosh(t')\cos(\chi)}{\{1 - \cosh^{2}(t')\sin^{2}(\chi)\}^{1/2}}\right\}.$$
 (36)

For this Schwarzschild–de Sitter case, for  $b(w) \sim w$  and  $m \neq 0$ , five-dimensional Riemann tensor is not zero or con-

- S.J. Perlmutter *et al.*, Nature (London) **391**, 51 (1998); A.G. Riess *et al.*, Astron. J. **116**, 1009 (1998); S.J. Perlmutter *et al.*, Astrophys. J. **517**, 565 (1999); R. Cen, *ibid.* **509**, 16 (1998); L.A. Kofman, N.Y. Gnedin, and N.A. Bahcall, *ibid.* **413**, 1 (1993); J.P. Ostriker and P.J. Steinhardt, Nature (London) **377**, 600 (1995).
- [2] T. Kaluza, Sitzungsber. Preuss. Akad. Wiss., Phys. Math. Kl.
   K1, 966 (1921); O. Klein, Z. Phys. 37, 895 (1926).
- [3] N. Arkani-Hamed, S. Dimopoulos, and G. Dvali, Phys. Lett. B 429, 263 (1998); I. Antoniadis, N. Arkani-Hamed, S. Dimopoulos, and G. Dvali, *ibid.* 436, 257 (1998).

stant but involves terms proportional to  $m/r^3$ . If m=0, the solution reduces to Eq. (31). Thus, if we impose  $Z_2$  symmetry, there will be a brane at w=0. Having matter sources on the brane will change the five-dimensional metric from flat to curved. Five-dimensional Ricci flat but curved metric in warped geometry can give rise to a four-dimensional universe with positive cosmological constant and matter. This is a special case of space-time matter (or induced matter) theorem [9] which states that the matter content of the universe is induced from higher-dimensional geometry. The relevance of this theorem has been emphasized from the RS point of view by Wesson and Seahra [10].

In conclusion, we have shown that if in a Randall-Sundrum like scenario one imposes the condition that (4+1)-dimensional space-time is flat, the only (3+1)-dimensional brane which admits a closed spacelike section cosmology requires a four-dimensional cosmological constant. It is clear from Table I that in fact all flat five-dimensional space-time manifolds in warped geometries (6) imply a nonzero and positive cosmological constant for the four-dimensional cosmology. This fact may be important as far as the measured [1] cosmological constant is positive.

- [4] L. Randall and R. Sundrum, Phys. Rev. Lett. 83, 3370 (1999).
- [5] L. Randall and R. Sundrum, Phys. Rev. Lett. 83, 4690 (1999).
- [6] P. Brax and C. van de Bruck, Class. Quantum Grav. 20, R201 (2003).
- [7] W. Israel, Nuovo Cimento B 44, 1 (1966); 48, 463(E) (1967).
- [8] T. Padmanabhan, Phys. Rep. 380, 235 (2003).
- [9] P.S. Wesson, Space-Time-Matter (World Scientific, Singapore, 1999).
- [10] S.S. Seahra and P.S. Wesson, Class. Quantum Grav. 20, 1321 (2003).