## Cation disorder and size effects in magnetoresistive manganese oxide perovskites

Lide M. Rodriguez-Martinez and J. Paul Attfield\*

Department of Chemistry, University of Cambridge, Lensfield Road, Cambridge CB2 1EW, United Kingdom and Interdisciplinary Research Centre in Superconductivity, University of Cambridge, Madingley Road,

Cambridge CB3 OHE, United Kingdom

(Received 19 September 1996)

Large disorder effects due to size differences between A-site  $R^{3+}$  (R=La,Pr,Nd,Sm) and  $M^{2+}$ (M=Ca,Sr,Ba) cations have been found in magnetoresistive ( $R_{0.7}M_{0.3}$ )MnO<sub>3</sub> perovskites. The ferromagneticmetal-paramagnetic-insulator transition temperature  $T_m$  varies as  $T_m = T_m(0) - pQ^2$  due to strain fields resulting from ordered or disordered oxygen displacements Q that are parametrized by the statistical mean and variance of the A cation radius, respectively. The value of p is related to the Mn-O force constant showing that Mn<sup>3+</sup> Jahn-Teller distortions assist electron localization at  $T_m$ . The maximum possible  $T_m$  is estimated to be ~530 K although experimentally observable values are  $\leq 360$  K. A large suppression of magnetoresistance due to cation disorder is also evidenced. [S0163-1829(96)51046-5]

The transition between ferromagnetic metallic and paramagnetic insulating states in  $(R_{1-x}M_x)$ MnO<sub>3</sub> perovskites is characterized by a maximum in the electrical resistivity  $\rho_m$  at the transition temperature  $T_m$ .  $\rho_m$  decreases greatly in an applied magnetic field *B*, and this giant negative magnetoresistance (MR) effect<sup>1</sup> may be quantified by the ratio of resistivities in zero and applied fields,  $\rho(0)/\rho(B)$ , which has a maximum value  $R_B$  at a temperature close to  $T_m$ . The magnitude of  $R_B$  increases greatly as  $T_m$  is shifted to lower temperatures, from values of 1–2 at room temperature up to, e.g.,  $R_{5T}$ =250 000 in Pr<sub>0.7</sub>Sr<sub>0.05</sub>Ca<sub>0.25</sub>MnO<sub>3</sub> at 85 K.<sup>2</sup>

The hole-doping x (giving an Mn oxidation state of (3+x) and the average A-site cation radius  $\langle r_A \rangle$  are found to be key chemical variables that control  $T_m$ ,  $^{3-7}$  giving a maximum  $T_m = 360$  K for x = 0.3 and  $\langle r_A \rangle = 1.23$  Å<sup>4</sup> Hole doping in the range  $x \approx 0.2 - 0.5$  is needed to stabilize the lowtemperature ferromagnetic metallic phase in which a ferromagnetic "double exchange" interaction between the localized  $t_{2g}^3$  electron configurations on adjacent Mn ions is mediated by the itinerant, spin-polarized  $e_g$  electrons.<sup>8</sup> The strong dependence of  $T_m$  on  $\langle r_A \rangle$  is shown in Fig. 1(a) using experimental values for  $(R_{0.7}M_{0.3})$ MnO<sub>3</sub> samples from the literature<sup>2,4-6,9-11</sup> and this study (Table I). This evidences a very strong coupling of electronic motion to lattice effects in  $(R_{1-x}M_x)$ MnO<sub>3</sub> perovskites. Supporting observations include the switching of a lattice distortion in (La<sub>0.83</sub>Sr<sub>0.17</sub>)MnO<sub>3</sub> by an applied magnetic field,<sup>12</sup> strictioncoupled MR in the (Nd,Sm)<sub>0.5</sub>Sr<sub>0.5</sub>MnO<sub>3</sub> system,<sup>13</sup> and a large oxygen isotope effect on the transition temperature in  $(La_{0.7}Ca_{0.3})MnO_3$ .<sup>14</sup> A further lattice effect whose influence has not been studied in detail, although it is inherent to almost all  $(R_{1-x}M_x)$  MnO<sub>3</sub> compositions, is the random disorder of  $R^{3+}$  and  $M^{2+}$  cations with different sizes distributed over the A sites in the perovskite structure. To quantify this effect, we use the variance (second moment) of the A-cation radius distribution,  $\sigma^2$ . For two or more A-site species with fractional occupancies  $y_i$  ( $\Sigma y_i = 1$ ), the variance of the ionic radii  $r_i$  about the mean  $\langle r_A \rangle$  is  $\sigma^2$  $=\Sigma y_i r_i^2 - \langle r_A \rangle^2$ . Standard ionic radii<sup>15</sup> with values 1.216–

1.132 Å for  $R^{3+}$  = La-Sm and 1.18, 1.31, and 1.47 Å for  $M^{2+}$  = Ca, Sr, and Ba, respectively, were used to calculate  $\langle r_A \rangle$  and  $\sigma^2$ .

To determine how the properties of  $(R_{1-x}M_x)$ MnO<sub>3</sub> perovskites change with the A-site variance  $\sigma^2$ , we have prepared a series of eight samples (Table I) with fixed doping (x=0.3) and mean A-cation radius  $(\langle r_A \rangle = 1.23 \text{ Å})$ , but in which  $\sigma^2$  is varied by use of different R and M combinations. The samples were prepared under identical conditions by solid-state reaction in air at 1350 °C. Powder x-ray diffraction showed all the samples to consist of a single perovskite phase with the orthorhombic  $\sqrt{2}a_p \times 2a_p \times \sqrt{2}a_p$ *Pnma* superstructure, where  $a_p$  is the cubic perovskite cell dimension.<sup>12</sup> The cell parameters *a*, *b*, and *c* were refined by the Rietveld method.<sup>16</sup> Resistivities [Fig. 2(a)] of sintered polycrystalline bars (approximate dimensions  $1.5 \times 4 \times 8$ mm<sup>3</sup>) were measured between 80 and 400 K using a standard four-probe technique and magnetizations M [shown as B/M in Fig. 2(b)] were recorded using a Quantum Design superconducting quantum interference device magnetometer with an applied field B = 50 mT. The peak resistivity temperatures  $T_m$  are in good agreement with characteristic magnetic transition temperatures  $T_C$  defined by minima in dM/dT.<sup>5</sup>

The parameters in Table I all show a strong dependence on  $\sigma^2$ . The differences between the unit-cell parameters decrease smoothly with increasing  $\sigma^2$  and the combined effects of disorder and inhomogeneity (discussed below) necessitated tetragonal or cubic cell parameter constraints at high values of  $\sigma^2$ .  $T_m$  shows a strong linear dependence upon  $\sigma^2$  up to ~0.015 Å<sup>2</sup> (Fig. 3) and then varies around an average value of ~100 K above this limit. The latter behavior is due to segregation of the A cations as a result of the large disparities in size, so that the samples are no longer microscopically homogeneous, although they appear to be single phases by powder x-ray diffraction. There is a corresponding change in the low-temperature behavior of the inverse magnetizations [Fig. 2(b)] which, for the three samples with  $\sigma^2 > 0.015$  Å<sup>2</sup>, lie substantially above the Curie-Weiss



FIG. 1. Plots of (a) experimental  $T_m$  values, and (b)  $T_m(\sigma^2=0)$  corrected for cation-size disorder using the procedure described in the text, against average *A*-cation radius for  $\ln_{0.7}M_{0.3}$ MnO<sub>3</sub> compositions. (b) shows the fit of Eq. (2).

limit as  $T_c$  is approached from high temperatures, possibly reflecting a coexistence of antiferromagnetic and ferromagnetic regions.<sup>17</sup> Inhomogeneity is also evidenced by the presence of a second resistive transition in the  $\sigma^2 = 0.0207$ Å<sup>2</sup> sample [Fig. 2(a)], and by the disparity between  $T_m$  and



FIG. 2. Plots of (a) normalized resistivity, and (b) inverse magnetization as B/M, with the  $\sigma^2$  (×10<sup>4</sup> Å<sup>2</sup>) values labeled. The high-temperature Curie-Weiss limits are shown as full lines in (b). Data for the  $\sigma^2$ =0.0036 Å<sup>2</sup> sample have been omitted from (b) for clarity as they largely overlap the  $\sigma^2$ =0.0029 Å<sup>2</sup> data.

 $T_C$  for the  $\sigma^2 = 0.0240$  Å<sup>2</sup> material (Table I). The nature of the phase segregation will depend upon the sizes of the individual *A* cations so that  $T_m$  is no longer a simple function of  $\sigma^2$ .

TABLE I. Variation of cell parameters a, b, and c, the resistivity maximum  $\rho_m$ , and the metal-insulator transition temperature measured from resistivity  $(T_m)$  and magnetization  $(T_c)$  data with cation-size variance  $\sigma^2$  for a series of  $(R_{0.7}M_{0.3})$ MnO<sub>3</sub> perovskites with constant  $\langle r_A \rangle = 1.23$  Å.

A-site composition	$\sigma^2$ (Å <sup>2</sup> )	a (Å)	<i>b</i> (Å)	c (Å)	$\rho_m \ (\Omega \ { m cm})$	$T_m$ (K)	$T_C$ (K)
La <sub>0.70</sub> Ca <sub>0.11</sub> Sr <sub>0.19</sub>	0.0016	5.5045(6)	7.7542(9)	5.4482(6)	$1.22 \times 10^{-2}$	363	350
La <sub>0.32</sub> Pr <sub>0.38</sub> Sr <sub>0.30</sub>	0.0029	5.5046(4)	7.7175(5)	5.4538(3)	$1.58 \times 10^{-2}$	336	332
$La_{0.53}Sm_{0.17}Sr_{0.30}$	0.0036	5.5089(4)	7.7177(5)	5.4582(3)	$1.84 \times 10^{-2}$	326	325
$Pr_{0.70}Sr_{0.23}Ba_{0.07}$	0.0074	5.4968(3)	7.7307(4)	5.4700(3)	$1.13 \times 10^{-1}$	247	248
$Nd_{0.70}Sr_{0.16}Ba_{0.14}$	0.0123	5.4927(3)	7.7345(4)	5.4740(3)	$7.96 \times 10^{0}$	146	148
Nd <sub>0.41</sub> Sm <sub>0.29</sub> Ba <sub>0.20</sub> Sr <sub>0.10</sub>	0.0169	5.4943(3)	7.7328(4)	5.4760(3)	$9.94 \times 10^{1}$	87	98
Nd <sub>0.15</sub> Sm <sub>0.55</sub> Ba <sub>0.25</sub> Sr <sub>0.05</sub>	0.0207	5.4844(4)	7.7484(10)	5.4844 <sup>a</sup>	$2.32 \times 10^{2}$	76	72
Sm <sub>0.70</sub> Ba <sub>0.30</sub>	0.0240	5.4879(1)	7.7611 <sup>b</sup>	5.4879 <sup>b</sup>	$6.67 \times 10^{2}$	113	60

 $a_a = c$  constrained to give stable refinement.

 $ba=b/\sqrt{2}=c$  constrained to give stable refinement.



FIG. 3. Variation of  $T_m$  with A-cation size variance  $\sigma^2$ , showing the fit of Eq. (1) to data with  $\sigma^2 < 0.015 \text{ Å}^2$ .

A fit to the linear region in Fig. 3,

$$T_m(\langle r_A \rangle, \sigma^2) = T_m(\langle r_A \rangle, 0) - p_1 \sigma^2, \qquad (1)$$

gives  $T_m(\langle r_A \rangle, 0) = 400$  K and  $p_1 = 20\ 600$  K Å<sup>-2</sup> for our series of samples in which  $\langle r_A \rangle = 1.23$  Å.  $T_m(\langle r_A \rangle, 0)$  is an estimate of the ideal metal-insulator transition temperature that would be observed if cation-size disorder were not present.<sup>18</sup> Equation (1) has been used to estimate the variation of  $T_m$  with  $\langle r_A \rangle$  in the absence of cation-size disorder, shown in Fig. 1(b), by extrapolating  $T_m(\langle r_A \rangle, 0)$  from  $T_m$  for all the reported compositions with  $\sigma^2 < 0.015$  Å<sup>2</sup> in Fig. 1(a), assuming the slope  $p_1$  to be independent of  $\langle r_A \rangle$ . For the small number of samples with  $\sigma^2 > 0.015$  Å<sup>2</sup> the cruder approximation  $T_m(\langle r_A \rangle, 0) \approx T_m + 300$  based on the inhomogeneous region of Fig. 3 has been used.

A-site cation disorder results mainly in random displacements of oxide ions from their average crystallographic positions. In a close-packed, hard-sphere ionic model of the structure, the mean random displacement is  $Q_r \approx \sigma$  ( $\sigma = \sqrt{\sigma^2}$  is the standard deviation in the distribution). Changing the mean A-cation radius  $\langle r_A \rangle$  results in analogous, ordered oxide displacements for which the mean value is  $Q_0 \approx r_A^0 - \langle r_A \rangle$ , where the ideal radius for an undistorted cubic perovskite is  $r_A^0 = 1.30$  Å for  $(R_{0.7}M_{0.3})$ MnO<sub>3</sub> compositions.<sup>19</sup> Hence, following Eq. (1), the disorder-corrected variation of  $T_m$  with  $\langle r_A \rangle$  should be of the form

$$T_m(\langle r_A \rangle, 0) = T_m(r_A^0, 0) - p_2(r_A^0 - \langle r_A \rangle)^2, \qquad (2)$$

with  $p_2 \sim p_1$ . This expression is found to give a good fit to the extrapolated data in Fig. 1(b) with refined parameters  $T_m(r_A^0, 0) = 530 \pm 20$  K and  $p_2 = 29\ 000 \pm 1000$  K Å<sup>-2</sup>.  $T_m(r_A^0, 0)$  is an experimental estimate of the metal-insulator transition temperature for an ideal, disorder-free  $(R_{0,7}M_{0,3})$ MnO<sub>3</sub> perovskite.

These results show that both the average radius  $\langle r_A \rangle$  [Fig. 1(b)] and the size variance  $\sigma^2$  of the *A*-site cations (Fig. 3) are key chemical parameters that can be used to tune the metal-insulator transition in  $(R_{1-x}M_x)$ MnO<sub>3</sub> perovskites at a constant doping *x*. In homogeneous samples, the dependence of  $T_m$  upon both parameters is described to a good

approximation by equations  $T_m = T_m(0) - pQ^2$ , where the oxide ion displacements Q in the strain term are random due to A-site disorder  $[Q_r \approx \sigma \text{ in Eq. (1)}]$  or ordered due to the changing average A-cation radius  $[Q_o \approx r_A^0 - \langle r_A \rangle$  in Eq. (2)]. The experimental  $T_m$  values for x = 0.3 [Fig. 1(a)] fall into two regions. For  $\langle r_A \rangle < 1.22$  Å, the cation-size variance is small and the true variation of  $T_m$  with  $\langle r_A \rangle$  is observed. As  $\langle r_A \rangle$  increases above 1.22 Å, the disparity in R and M (=Sr and Ba) radii gives rise to an increasing  $\sigma^2$  effect which offsets the increase in  $T_m(0)$ , resulting in approximately constant  $T_m$  values. La<sub>0.7</sub>Ba<sub>0.3</sub>MnO<sub>3</sub> has the maximum observable  $\langle r_A \rangle$  of 1.29 Å but also a large value of  $\sigma^2 = 0.0135$  Å<sup>2</sup> so that  $T_m$  is only 320 K although the extrapolated value for an ideal  $(R_{0.7}M_{0.3})$ MnO<sub>3</sub> perovskite is  $T_m \approx 530$  K.

Our results are in agreement with recent mean-field treatments of the metal-insulator transition in  $(R_{1-x}M_x)MnO_3$ perovskites.<sup>20</sup> Calculations based upon the double exchange interaction alone give unrealistically high values of  $T_m \approx 2500-5000$  K,<sup>21</sup> but including electron-localizing (polaron) effects due to Jahn-Teller distortions of Mn<sup>3+</sup>O<sub>6</sub> octahedra gives estimates of  $T_m \sim 500$  K for small  $e_g$  electron hopping energies  $\sim 0.2$  eV,<sup>20</sup> in agreement with our extrapolated  $T_m(r_A^0, 0)$  of 530 K. The Jahn-Teller part of the Hamiltonian contains the lattice strain term  $(K/2)\Sigma Q_b^2$  summed over changes in Mn-O bond lengths  $Q_b$  where K is the harmonic force constant for these bonds. Assuming the changes in the  $T_m$  to be due principally to this strain energy, then an approximate expression for  $T_m$  is

$$T_m(\langle r_A \rangle, \sigma^2) = T_m(r_A^0, 0) - \frac{K}{2\Delta S_m} \sum Q_b^2, \qquad (3)$$

where  $\Delta S_m$  is the entropy change at the transition. If the mean-squared displacements  $Q^2 (=Q_r^2 \text{ or } Q_o^2)$  due to changes in the cation variance or average size are assumed to be isotropic then  $Q_b^2 = Q^2/3$  and for six Mn-O bonds per cation, Eq. (3) becomes

$$T_m(\langle r_A \rangle, \sigma^2) = T_m(r_A^0, 0) - \frac{KQ^2}{\Delta S_m}$$
(4)

so that the experimental coefficients  $p_1$  and  $p_2$  in Eqs. (1) and (2) are  $\approx K/\Delta S_m$ . Estimating  $\Delta S_m \approx k \ln(2\langle S \rangle + 1)$  with  $\langle S \rangle = 1.85$  and taking the range of  $p \approx 21\,000-29\,000$  K Å<sup>-2</sup> from the experimental fits of Eqs. (1) and (2) gives  $K \approx 45-65$  N m<sup>-1</sup>. This is of the correct magnitude for the Mn-O force constant, given the approximate nature of the calculation, and lies within the range 30–300 N m<sup>-1</sup> estimated for K in LaMnO<sub>3</sub>.<sup>22</sup> Hence, the local deformations of the MnO<sub>6</sub> octahedra due to A-cation disorder and size effects act as "preformed Jahn-Teller distortions" that promote the localization of  $e_g$  electrons thereby lowering  $T_m$ .

Consideration of A-cation size disorder through the variance  $\sigma^2$  also accounts for variations in MR properties of  $(R_{1-x}M_x)$ MnO<sub>3</sub> perovskites with similar  $T_m$  values. Negligible disorder ( $\sigma^2 < 10^{-6}$  Å<sup>2</sup>) can be realized in the Pr<sub>1-x</sub>Ca<sub>x</sub>MnO<sub>3</sub> system due to the exact size matching of Pr<sup>3+</sup> and Ca<sup>2+</sup>, which enables a variety of charge and spin ordered states to be observed.<sup>23</sup> These phases are nonmetallic due to the small  $\langle r_A \rangle$  of 1.18 Å, although a transition to the ferromagnetic metallic state of  $Pr_{0.7}Ca_{0.3}MnO_3$  can be induced by applied pressure,<sup>6</sup> magnetic fields (resulting in very large MR),<sup>6,23</sup> or chemical substitutions with La or Sr which increase  $\langle r_A \rangle$ .<sup>2,5,24</sup> The latter materials have very high magnetoresistance peaks, up to  $R_{5T}=250\ 000$  at 85 K in  $Pr_{0.7}Sr_{0.05}Ca_{0.25}MnO_3$ .<sup>2</sup> Phases with comparable  $\langle r_A \rangle$  and  $T_m$  values, but significant *A*-cation size disorder, have much smaller MR peaks, e.g.,  $La_{0.6}Y_{0.1}Ca_{0.3}MnO_3$  with  $\sigma^2=0.0022\ \text{Å}^2$  has  $R_{5T}$  of only 40 at 120 K,<sup>11</sup> showing that *A*-cation disorder strongly reduces the magnitude of the magnetoresistive effect. Smaller reductions due to disorder are observed at higher temperatures, e.g.,  $La_{0.525}Pr_{0.175}Ca_{0.3}MnO_3$  ( $\sigma^2=0.0003\ \text{Å}^2$ ) has  $R_{5T}=10$  at 210 K,<sup>5</sup> whereas  $Nd_{0.7}Sr_{0.3}MnO_3$  ( $\sigma^2=0.0044\ \text{Å}^2$ ) has  $R_{6T}=1.5$  at 195 K.<sup>4</sup>

In summary, the metal-insulator transition temperature

- \*Author for correspondence. Fax: +44 1223 336362. Electronic address: jpal4@cam.ac.uk
- <sup>1</sup>R. M. Kusters, J. Singleton, D. A. Keen, R. L. McGreevy, and W. Hayes, Physica B **155**, 362 (1989); R. von Helmolt, J. Wecker, B. Holzapfel, L. Schultz, and K. Samwer, Phys. Rev. Lett. **71**, 2331 (1993).
- <sup>2</sup>B. Raveau, A. Maignan, and V. Caignaert, J. Solid State Chem. **117**, 424 (1995).
- <sup>3</sup>A. Urushibara *et al.*, Phys. Rev. B **51**, 14103 (1995).
- <sup>4</sup>R. Mahesh, R. Mahendiran, A. K. Raychaudhuri, and C. N. R. Rao, J. Solid State Chem. **120**, 204 (1995).
- <sup>5</sup>H. Y. Hwang, S.-W. Cheong, P. G. Radaelli, M. Marezio, and B. Batlogg, Phys. Rev. Lett. **74**, 914 (1995).
- <sup>6</sup>H. Y. Hwang, T. T. M. Palstra, S.-W. Cheong, and B. Batlogg, Phys. Rev. B **52**, 15046 (1995).
- <sup>7</sup>P. G. Radaelli, M. Marezio, H. Y. Hwang, and S.-W. Cheong, J. Solid State Chem. **122**, 444 (1996).
- <sup>8</sup>C. Zener, Phys. Rev. 82, 403 (1951); P.-G. de Gennes, *ibid.* 118, 141 (1960).
- <sup>9</sup>R. Mahesh, R. Mahendiran, A. K. Raychaudhuri, and C. N. R. Rao, J. Solid State Chem. **114**, 297 (1995).
- <sup>10</sup>S. Jin, H. M. O'Bryan, T. M. Tiefel, M. McCormack, and W. W. Rhodes, Appl. Phys. Lett. **66**, 382 (1995).
- <sup>11</sup>A. Maignan, Ch. Simon, V. Caignaert, and B. Raveau, J. Appl. Phys. **79**, 7891 (1996).
- <sup>12</sup>A. Asamitsu, Y. Moritomo, Y. Tomioka, T. Arima, and Y. Tokura, Nature (London) **373**, 407 (1995).

and the magnitude of the MR in  $(R_{1-x}M_x)$ MnO<sub>3</sub> perovskites are dependent upon the hole-doping x, the mean A-cation radius  $\langle r_A \rangle$ , and the A-site disorder quantified by the size variance  $\sigma^2$ . The latter two effects are both described by equations  $T_m = T_m(0) - pQ^2$  in which Q is the mean ordered and random oxide ion displacement, respectively, and p is related to the Mn-O force constant. These strain fields reduce  $T_m$  considerably from an estimated maximum value of  $530 \pm 20$  K for x = 0.3 which is in good agreement with recent theoretical estimates. Maximum MR effects are found in materials having a low value of  $\langle r_A \rangle$ , and hence a low  $T_m$ , and a small  $\sigma^2$ , such as  $\Pr_{1-x}Ca_xMnO_3$ -based compositions.

The authors acknowledge Dr. S. R. Elliott and Professor E. K. H. Salje for helpful discussions. L.M.R.M. thanks the Basque Government for financial support.

<sup>13</sup>H. Kuwahara *et al.*, Science **272**, 80 (1996).

- <sup>14</sup>G. Zhao, K. Conder, H. Keller, and K. A. Muller, Nature (London) **381**, 676 (1996).
- <sup>15</sup>Ionic radii for ninefold coordination in oxides were taken from R. D. Shannon, Acta Crystallogr. Sec. A **32**, 751 (1976).
- <sup>16</sup>H. M. Rietveld, J. Appl. Crystallogr. 2, 65 (1969).
- <sup>17</sup>R. Mahendiran *et al.*, Phys. Rev. B **53**, 3348 (1996).
- <sup>18</sup>This extrapolation overestimates  $T_m(0)$  slightly as a nonlinear variation of  $T_m$  is expected as  $\sigma^2 \rightarrow 0$ . This "plateau" effect cannot easily be estimated, as a linear variation is observed down to  $\sigma^2 = 0.0016$  Å<sup>2</sup> and compositions with smaller variances do not exist in this system. The error due to linear extrapolation is likely to be no more than ~10 K. See E. K. H. Salje, Eur. J. Mineral. 7, 791 (1995).
- <sup>19</sup>  $r_A^0$  is defined as giving a tolerance factor of t=1 for  $\langle r_A \rangle = r_A^0$ where  $t = (\langle r_A \rangle + r_O) / \sqrt{2} (r_{Mn} + r_O)$ , and  $r_O$  and  $r_{Mn}$  are the radii of the oxide and manganese ions.
- <sup>20</sup>H. Roder, J. Zang, and A. R. Bishop, Phys. Rev. Lett. **76**, 1356 (1996); J. Zang, A. R. Bishop, and H. Roder, Phys. Rev. B **53**, R8840 (1996).
- <sup>21</sup>A. J. Millis, P. B. Littlewood, and B. I. Shraiman, Phys. Rev. Lett. **74**, 5144 (1995).
- <sup>22</sup>A. J. Millis, Phys. Rev. B 53, 8434 (1996).
- <sup>23</sup>Y. Tomioka, A. Asamitsu, H. Kuwahara, Y. Moritomo, and Y. Tokura, Phys. Rev. B 53, R1689 (1996).
- <sup>24</sup>A. Maignan, Ch. Simon, V. Caignaert, and B. Raveau, Solid State Commun. 96, 623 (1995).