## Charge fluctuations in a cluster Mott state: Hard x-ray photoemission study on a breathing kagome magnet Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub>

R. Nakamura,<sup>1</sup> D. Takegami<sup>(0)</sup>,<sup>2,1</sup> K. Fujinuma<sup>(0)</sup>,<sup>1</sup> M. Nakamura,<sup>1</sup> M. Ferreira-Carvalho<sup>(0)</sup>,<sup>2,3</sup> A. Melendez-Sans,<sup>2</sup>

M. Yoshimura<sup>0</sup>,<sup>4</sup> K.-D. Tsuei,<sup>4</sup> Y. Haraguchi<sup>0</sup>,<sup>5</sup> H. Aruga Katori<sup>0</sup>,<sup>5</sup> L. H. Tjeng<sup>0</sup>,<sup>2</sup> and T. Mizokawa<sup>1</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Department of Applied Physics, Waseda University, Shinjuku, Tokyo 169-8555, Japan

<sup>2</sup>Max Planck Institute for Chemical Physics of Solids, 01187 Dresden, Germany

<sup>3</sup>Institute of Physics II, University of Cologne, 50937 Cologne, Germany

<sup>4</sup>National Synchrotron Radiation Research Center, 30076 Hsinchu, Taiwan

<sup>5</sup>Department of Applied Physics and Chemical Engineering, Tokyo University of Agriculture and Technology, Tokyo 184-8588, Japan

(Received 23 February 2024; revised 10 May 2024; accepted 23 July 2024; published 14 August 2024)

We report on our hard x-ray photoemission study of Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub>, wherein the breathing Kagome lattice of Nb provides interesting magnetic properties with spin 1/2 per Nb trimer. The Nb  $3d_{5/2}$  and  $3d_{3/2}$  core level peaks are accompanied by satellite peaks, suggesting the importance of Nb 4*d* charge degrees of freedom. The Cl 1*s* and 2*p* core level spectra have high binding energy peaks which can be assigned to the Cl site with Cl 3*p* ligand holes near the center of the Nb trimer. The core level spectra indicate that the Nb-Nb and Nb-Cl charge fluctuations play crucial roles in the magnetic interaction between the trimers.

DOI: 10.1103/PhysRevB.110.L081109

Introduction. Transition-metal compounds with partially filled  $t_{2g}$  orbitals often exhibit dimerization or trimerization of transition-metal ions due to the molecular orbital formation of the  $t_{2g}$  orbitals [1]. Examples include dimers formed in VO<sub>2</sub> [2,3] and MgTi<sub>2</sub>O<sub>4</sub> [4,5]; trimers in LiVO<sub>2</sub> [6,7], BaV<sub>10</sub>O<sub>15</sub> [8,9], and CsW<sub>2</sub>O<sub>6</sub> [10,11]; and even octamers in CuIr<sub>2</sub>S<sub>4</sub> [12,13]. The formation of such multimers in the partially filled  $t_{2g}$  level can be described by the orbitally induced Peierls mechanism [14,15]. In contrast to the multimer formation in the aforementioned transition-metal compounds, pairs along the c axis are already built in corundum-type  $Ti_2O_3$ where Ti-Ti bond length is shortened below 450 K due to the molecular orbital formation by  $t_{2g}$  orbitals [2,16–18]. Very recently, Ti<sup>3+</sup>/Ti<sup>4+</sup> charge fluctuation of the Ti-Ti pair in Mg substituted Ti<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> has been revealed by photoemission spectroscopy [19].

Mo trimers are naturally incorporated in the breathing Kagome layer of LiZn<sub>2</sub>Mo<sub>3</sub>O<sub>8</sub> and Zn<sub>2</sub>Mo<sub>3</sub>O<sub>8</sub> [20,21]. While the Mo valence is +4 with the  $t_{2g}^2$  configuration in Zn<sub>2</sub>Mo<sub>3</sub>O<sub>8</sub>, the average Mo valence in  $LiZn_2Mo_3O_8$  is +3.67 with seven  $t_{2g}$  electrons per Mo trimer. The Mo trimers in  $Zn_2Mo_3O_8$ are nonmagnetic since the six  $t_{2g}$  electrons fully occupy the three bonding molecular orbitals of the trimer. However, in  $LiZn_2Mo_3O_8$ , where the seven Mo 4d electrons are confined in the Mo trimer, each trimer can have localized spin 1/2. This situation can be viewed as a cluster Mott insulating state [22]. In  $LiZn_2Mo_3O_8$ , the localized spins of the Mo trimer form a geometrically frustrated triangular lattice providing the exotic spin liquid behavior [20,21]. Recently, Nikolaev, Solovyev, and Streltsov theoretically demonstrated that charge degrees of freedom allow a plaquette spin singlet state on the breathing Kagome lattice [23].

Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> is another striking Kagome system with Nb trimers as illustrated in Fig. 1(a) [24]. Such trimerization in the Kagome lattice with  $d^2$  ions (such as Ti<sup>2+</sup>, V<sup>3+</sup>, and Nb<sup>3+</sup>)

would be explained by the orbitally induced Peierls mechanism. As shown in Fig. 1(b), one of the  $t_{2g}$  orbitals with yz, zx, or xy symmetry can form a quasi-one-dimensional band along one of the chain directions of the Kagome lattice. Since the one-dimensional band is half filled, each chain undergoes dimerization similar to VO<sub>2</sub>. The dimers indicated by the thick lines in Fig. 1(b) can form the trimer with six  $t_{2g}$  electrons providing the nonmagnetic ground state. Indeed, Na<sub>2</sub>Ti<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> with Ti<sup>2+</sup> undergoes Ti trimerization with suppression of magnetic susceptibility [26-30]. In Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub>, the Nb trimer accommodates one extra  $t_{2g}$  electron relative to the Ti trimer of Na<sub>2</sub>Ti<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> and hosts localized spin 1/2 [24,31,32]. When the transfer integrals between the neighboring Nb 4dorbitals in the trimer are much larger than those between the trimers, Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> can be viewed as a cluster Mott insulator and the Nb trimers form a triangular lattice, as proposed by Haraguchi et al. [32] and confirmed by Sun et al. and Gao et al. using angle-resolved photoemission spectroscopy (ARPES) [33,34]. The spin 1/2 triangular lattice of the cluster Mott insulating state is a new playground to study spin liquid states and exotic superconductivity [35,36]. Interestingly, Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> exhibits a further magnetic-nonmagnetic transition around 90 K, although degeneracy of orbital channel is already lifted. Haraguchi et al. proposed charge disproportionation between the trimers as an origin of the magnetic-nonmagnetic phase transition [32]. On the other hand, the recent ARPES work on Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>6</sub>Br<sub>2</sub> reported bonding-antibonding splitting of the lower Hubbard band [34], suggesting importance of hybridization between the trimers which can be mediated by the ligand orbitals.

Despite the highly interesting magnetic properties, fundamental electronic structure of  $Nb_3Cl_8$  including the effect of ligand orbitals has not been clarified yet through bulk-sensitive core-level spectroscopy measurements. In this study, hard x-ray photoelectron spectroscopy (HAXPES) was



FIG. 1. (a) Crystal structure of Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> illustrated by VESTA [25]. (b) Possible orbital ordering for trimers formed by local  $d^2$  ions.

performed on Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> to elucidate its unique electronic properties. The Nb 3*d* core-level HAXPES spectra indicate the importance of Nb 4*d* charge degrees of freedom. In addition, the Cl 1*s* and 2*p* core-level HAXPES spectra show that the Cl site just above/below the Nb trimer deviates from Cl<sup>-</sup>, suggesting the Cl 3*p* state is involved in the charge excitation between the trimers.

Methods. HAXPES measurements were conducted at the Max-Planck-NSRRC HAXPES endstation [37], Taiwan undulator beam line BL12XU of SPring-8, with 6.5 keV photon energy. The probing depth is determined by the inelastic mean free path of the photoelectrons (with the kinetic energy of 5.5-6.5 keV) which is estimated to be about 4-5 nm in the universal curve [38] and is calculated to be about 10 nm for various inorganic compounds [39]. The x-ray incidence angle was 15 degrees with respect to the sample surface, and the photoelectron detection angle was 15 degrees off from the surface normal of the sample and parallel to the E vector of the x-ray. Single crystals were cleaved under ultrahigh vacuum of 10<sup>-6</sup> Pa at 300 K to obtain clean sample surfaces as confirmed by survey scans (Fig. S1 in the Supplemental Material [40]). Since the sample was moderately charged up, the binding energy was corrected to set the lowest energy Nb4d peak at  $\sim 0.75$  eV as reported in the ARPES studies [33,34]. After the correction, the Nb  $3d_{5/2}$  peak is located at 204.8 eV which is close to the value report by Yoon et al. [41]. The measurements were performed at 300 K. The total energy resolution was about 300 meV. Generalized gradient approximation (GGA)-based band structure calculations were carried



FIG. 2. (a) Cl 1s and (b) Cl 2p HAXPES spectra and the fitted results by using four Voigt functions and eight Gaussian functions, respectively, with the relative energy positions for Cl No. 1, No. 2, No. 3, and No. 4 obtained from the GGA calculation and the intensity ratio of 1:1:3:3. (c) Cl 3s partial density of states (PDOS) calculated by GGA. The PDOS is decomposed into contributions from the Cl No. 1, No. 2, No. 3, and No. 4 sites in Fig. 1(a). The center of gravity for each energy distribution is indicated by the vertical dashed bars for Cl No. 1, No. 2, No. 3, and No. 4.

out using QUANTUM ESPRESSO 6.8 and 7.2 [42]. We employed pseudopotentials of Nb.pbe-spn-kjpaw\_psl.1.0.0.UPF and Cl.pbe-n-kjpaw\_psl.1.0.0.UPF, with the kinetic energy cutoff of 30 Ry and the charge density cutoff of 150 Ry.

*Results.* Figure 2(a) shows the experimental Cl 1*s* spectra (solid curve), revealing a prominent sharp peak accompanied by a second peak or shoulder approximately 1 eV higher in binding energy, constituting roughly one-eighth of the overall intensity. Figure 2(b) exhibits the experimental Cl 2*p* spectra (solid curve), where two primary peaks are observed, as expected from the  $2p_{3/2}$  and  $2p_{1/2}$  splitting. Additionally, a third smaller peak, roughly 1 eV higher in binding energy than the second peak, is evident. Notably, the main peaks for  $2p_{3/2}$  and  $2p_{1/2}$  show some finer structure. The presence of these extra peaks and the complex structure that the experimental Cl

core levels display can be explained from the presence of four different Cl sites with significantly different environments. Figure 2(c) shows a close-up of the Cl 3*s* partial density of states (PDOS) obtained through *ab initio* GGA calculations, revealing significant differences in the PDOSs of the four Cl sites. The weights of the PDOS for each of the sites No. 1–No. 4 correspond to the ratio given by the multiplicity of each site (1:1:3:3). The PDOSs of sites No. 1, No. 3, and No. 4 located at higher energies (lower binding energy) exhibit broader features due to Cl-Cl band formations. In contrast, Cl No. 2, situated at the center of the trimers, has a significantly lower energy (higher binding energy) due to its stronger Nb-Cl hybridization with the trimer.

From these calculations, we use the center of masses of the PDOS of each of the Cl sites as an estimate of their on-site energy. To model the Cl 1s spectrum, we employ four Voigt functions (with common Gaussian and Lorentzian widths to account for experimental resolution and core-hole lifetime) with their energy separations obtained from the calculation for each Cl site and their intensity ratio of 1:1:3:3 corresponding to the site multiplicities. The simulation, depicted in Fig. 2(a), aligns well with the experimental data, demonstrating that the higher binding energy peak corresponds to the contributions of Cl No. 2. A similar approach is taken for the Cl 2p spectrum, utilizing four functions for the  $2p_{3/2}$  and four more for the  $2p_{1/2}$ , split by the spin-orbit coupling and with the intensity ratio of 2:1. For the Cl 2p, the Lorentzian broadening was set to zero due to the longer core-hole lifetime. The results of the fit, shown in Fig. 2(b), agree closely with the experiments, revealing that the third peak originates from the  $Cl_{2p_{1/2}}$  of site No. 2, and that the fine structure observed in the main two peaks are due to the energy differences in site No. 3 and No. 4. The occupations of Cl 3p at Cl No. 1, No. 2, No. 3, and No. 4 are calculated to be 5.19, 4.96, 5.23, and 5.14. The number of Cl 3p holes of Cl No. 2 (at the center of the Nb trimer) is by 0.2–0.3 larger than the other Cl sites. Without trimerization, Cl No. 1 and No. 2 (No. 3 and No. 4) are equivalent, and the calculated Cl 2p spectra in an undistorted lattice fail to reproduce the experimental spectra as shown in Fig. S2 in the Supplemental Material [40]. In the literature, the Cl  $2p_{3/2}$  peak is located around 199 eV for Cl<sup>-</sup>, 206 eV for  $ClO_{2}^{-}$ , and 208 eV for  $ClO_{4}^{-}$  [43]. The Coulomb potential for the core level becomes deeper with less Cl 3p electrons due to stronger Cl3p-Nb4d hybridization or larger charge transfer from Cl 3p to Nb 4d. The Cl  $2p_{3/2}$  peak for Cl No. 3 is located around 199.2 eV which is close to that of Cl<sup>-</sup>, consistent with the weakest hybridization and the smallest charge transfer between Nb and Cl. On the other hand, the  $Cl_{2p_{3/2}}$ peak for Cl No. 2 is about 200.7 eV, indicating that number of Cl3p electrons is considerably reduced due to the strong hybridization between Nb and Cl. Here, it should be noted that the surface-sensitive  $Cl_{2p}$  spectra with 240 eV photon energy reported in the Supplemental Material by Gao et al. [34] is largely different from those in the present HAXPES. This may indicate that the electronic structure of the surface layer is different from the bulk.

As depicted in Fig. 3, the Nb 3*d* HAXPES peaks of the 5/2 and 3/2 branches are respectively accompanied by shoulders at the higher energy side. In various 4*d* 



FIG. 3. Nb 3*d* HAXPES spectra with  $h\nu = 6500 \text{ eV}$  for Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub>. The Nb 3*d*<sub>5/2</sub> and 3*d*<sub>3/2</sub> main peaks are accompanied by satellite features.

and 5d transition-metal oxides (including  $Ca_{2-x}Sr_{x}RuO_{4}$ [44-47], CaCu<sub>3</sub>Ru<sub>4</sub>O<sub>12</sub> [48-50], Ba<sub>3-x</sub>Sr<sub>x</sub>Nb<sub>5</sub>O<sub>15</sub> [51,52], and  $C_{s}W_{2}O_{6}$  [53]), such shoulder peaks and the main peaks are often observed and are attributed to the well and poorly screened final states. This screening arises from moderately correlated 4d or 5d electrons with relatively large band width. On the other hand, such screening effect is not available in Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> which is a good insulator with a relatively large band gap. As shown in Fig. S3 in the Supplemental Material [40], the Nb3d spectra of Nb3Cl8 can be fitted by four Gaussians assuming main and satellite peaks for the 5/2 and 3/2branches, and the area ratio of the satellite peak to the main peak is thus estimated to be about 1.0. It is tempting to assign the main and satellite peaks to the  $Nb^{2+}$  and  $Nb^{3+}$  states in the ground state since the formal valence of Nb is +2.67in Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub>. Since Nb<sup>2+</sup> : Nb<sup>3+</sup> = 1 : 2, as expected from the composition, and the core level binding energy of  $Nb^{3+}$  is higher than that of  $Nb^{2+}$ , the area ratio of the lower binding energy peak to the higher one should be 0.5. However, it can clearly be seen that the ratio significantly deviates from 0.5. In this context, the trimer in Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> is different from the octamer of  $CuIr_2S_4$  [54] and the dimer of  $LiRh_2O_4$  [55] where the main and satellite peaks are assigned to different valence states.

Figure 4(a) shows the total DOS and PDOSs calculated by GGA for virtual structure with an undistorted Kagome lattice of Nb. The  $t_{2g}$  band represented by the  $3Z^2 - R^2$  $((xy + yz + zx)/\sqrt{3})$  component mixed with XY and  $X^2 - Y^2$ is distributed from -1.5 eV to 1.5 eV [The X and Y axes are indicated in Fig. 1(a)]. The  $t_{2g}$  band exhibits a finite energy gap around 0.2 eV due to the xy-yz, yz-zx, and zx-xy transfer integrals between the three Nb sites in the unit cell of the undistorted Kagome lattice. In this context, if all the Nb sites were 3+, the undistorted  $d^2$  Kagome system would be a band insulator. Figure 4(b) displays the total DOS and PDOSs for real structures with a breathing Kagome lattice of Nb. The Nb 4d bands around 1 and 2 eV below the Fermi level have the character of bonding molecular orbitals in the Nb trimer. The 2 eV peak corresponds to the  $1a_1$ 



FIG. 4. Calculated density of states (DOS) and Nb 4*d* PDOS (a) for virtual structure with a regular Kagome lattice of Nb and (b) for real structure with a breathing Kagome lattice of Nb. The Nb 4*d* PDOS is decomposed into  $3Z^2 - R^2$ , ZX, YZ,  $X^2 - Y^2$ , and XY orbitals. (c) Valence-band HAXPES spectra with hv = 6500 eVof the Nb 4*d* and Cl 3*p* bands. The HAXPES spectra are compared with the simulated spectra which are obtained from the PDOS (below the Fermi level) for the real structure and the photoionization cross section of each subshell. The calculated density of states is broadened considering the energy resolution of 300 meV and shifted by 0.76 eV toward the lower energy (higher binding energy) side considering the Mott gap.

molecular orbital in the Nb trimer, accommodating two electrons per trimer. The 1 eV peak is derived from the 1*e* molecular orbitals which are doubly degenerate and accommodate four electrons per trimer. Since Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> has seven electrons per trimer in the Nb 4*d* states, the Fermi level is located at the Nb 4*d* band derived from the  $2a_1$  molecular orbital. The Nb 4*d*  $t_{2g}$  orbital component is redistributed by the trimerization, and the peak at the Fermi level is dominated by the  $3Z^2 - R^2$  or  $a_{1g}$  orbital mixed with the  $e_{\sigma}^{\pi}$  orbital.

In Fig. 4(c), the valence band spectra of  $Nb_3Cl_8$  display the Cl 3*p* and Nb 4*d* states in the energy range from 4 to 9 eV and that from 1 to 4 eV, respectively. The Nb 4*d* states consist of the three peaks around 2.7, 1.9, and 0.7 eV. The 0.7 eV peak can be assigned to the  $2a_1$  molecular orbital of the trimer which is expected to be half-filled in the cluster Mott insulator state of Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub>. The half-filled  $2a_1$  states is split into the lower and upper Hubbard bands as theoretically demonstrated in the previous studies [34,56,57] as well as the GGA+U calculation shown in Fig. S6 of the Supplemental Material [40]. The simulated spectra obtained from the PDOSs calculated by GGA and the photoionization cross section [58,59] are compared with the experimental results. Here, we assume that the highest occupied band ( $2a_1$ ) is half-filled and the entire spectrum is shifted to the lower energy (higher binding energy) due to the Mott gap. Except for the underestimation of the Cl 3*p* binding energy, the overall structure of the valence band HAXPES spectra is consistent with the calculated DOS.

Discussion. Considering the small band width of the halffilled band  $(2a_1)$  in the calculation shown in Fig. 4(b), it is plausible that relatively weak electron-electron interaction in the  $2a_1$  band may lead to opening of a Mott gap [35,36]. This aligns with the scenario of the cluster Mott insulator. If the Nb 4*d* electrons in the  $2a_1$  band are itinerant (namely, if the system is close to a metal-insulator transition), the Nb 3d core level spectra should exhibit well- and poorly screed features as seen in the undoped cases including CaVO<sub>3</sub> and Ca<sub>2</sub>RuO<sub>4</sub> [60-63], and the doped cases including Ba<sub>3</sub>Nb<sub>5</sub>O<sub>15</sub> [51,52]. The absence of the well- and poorly-screed features in the Nb 3d core level spectra of Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> indicates that the Nb 4d electrons in the  $2a_1$  band are highly localized. In the ground state, the  $2a_1$  electron is evenly distributed among the three Nb sites, and it is trapped by the core-hole potential in the final states, giving rise to the main and satellite peaks in the Nb 3*d* core level spectra.

Examining the valence band spectra, the spectral weight ratio of the 1.9 eV peak (1e) to the 2.7 eV peak (1 $a_1$ ) is expected to be two according to their degeneracy. However, in the experimental result, the 1.9 eV and 2.7 eV peaks are much wider than the simulation and exhibit comparable height, suggesting electronic correlation effect. When an electron is removed from the fully occupied  $1a_1$  or 1e orbitals, the remaining  $1a_1$ or 1*e* electrons can couple with the unpaired  $2a_1$  electron providing energy splitting. Since the energy splitting for 1eis larger than for  $1a_1$  due to its orbital degeneracy, the 1.9 eV peak can be much more strongly broadened. In addition, it is anticipated that the electron in the 0.7 eV peak  $(2a_1)$  is also correlated with the other Nb 4d electrons participating in the  $1a_1$  and 1e orbitals at each Nb site. Such correlation effect may drive the system toward a  $Nb^{2+}/Nb^{3+}$  mixed valence state if the Nb-Nb transfer integral is smaller than the multiplet coupling between the Nb 4d electrons. Moreover, the analysis of the Cl1s and 2p spectra suggests importance of charge transfer from Cl to Nb. The Cl 3p PDOS in the valence band is plotted in Fig. S5 in the Supplemental Material [40]. The Cl3p orbitals at the Cl No. 2 site are strongly hybridized into the unoccupied part of the Nb 4d band corresponding to  $1a_2$  and 3e. When the electron in  $2a_1$  is excited, the Cl 3pweight is redistributed and mixed into the final state with  $2a_1$  symmetry. The Nb-Nb and Nb-Cl fluctuations cause the plaquette-type magnetic coupling between the trimers [23], potentially leading to the magnetic-nonmagnetic transition at 90 K. Indeed, the bonding-antibonding splitting of the  $2a_1$ 

band reported by Gao *et al.* [34] is consistent with the singlet bond formation via the Nb-Cl charge transfer channel.

In summary, our investigation employed hard x-ray photoemission spectroscopy to explore the electronic structure of the breathing Kagome magnet Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub>. The Nb 3*d* core level spectra revealed main and satellite peaks, highlighting the significance of Nb 4*d* charge degrees of freedom and electronic correlation. Analysis of the Cl 1*s* and 2*p* core level spectra indicated the presence of a Cl 3*p* ligand hole at the Cl site just above/below the Nb trimer. These findings collectively suggest that the magnetic interaction between the spin 1/2 trimers is influenced by Nb-Nb and Nb-Cl charge fluctuations.

- D. I. Khomskii, *Transition Metal Compounds* (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, 2014).
- [2] F. J. Morin, Oxides which show a metal-to-insulator transition at the Neel temperature, Phys. Rev. Lett. 3, 34 (1959).
- [3] M. W. Haverkort, Z. Hu, A. Tanaka, W. Reichelt, S. V. Streltsov, M. A. Korotin, V. I. Anisimov, H. H. Hsieh, H.-J. Lin, C. T. Chen, D. I. Khomskii, and L. H. Tjeng, Orbital-assisted metal-insulator transition in VO<sub>2</sub>, Phys. Rev. Lett. **95**, 196404 (2005).
- [4] M. Isobe and Y. Ueda, Observation of phase transition from metal to spin-singlet insulator in  $MgTi_2O_4$  with S = 1/2 pyrochlore lattice, J. Phys. Soc. Jpn. **71**, 1848 (2002).
- [5] M. Schmidt, W. Ratcliff, P. G. Radaelli, K. Refson, N. M. Harrison, and S. W. Cheong, Spin singlet formation in MgTi<sub>2</sub>O<sub>4</sub>: Evidence of a helical dimerization pattern, Phys. Rev. Lett. **92**, 056402 (2004).
- [6] H. F. Pen, J. van den Brink, D. I. Khomskii, and G. A. Sawatzky, Orbital ordering in a two-dimensional triangular lattice, Phys. Rev. Lett. 78, 1323 (1997).
- [7] H. F. Pen, L. H. Tjeng, E. Pellegrin, F. M. F. de Groot, G. A. Sawatzky, M. A. van Veenendaal, and C. T. Chen, Phase transition in LiVO<sub>2</sub> studied by near-edge x-ray-absorption spectroscopy, Phys. Rev. B 55, 15500 (1997).
- [8] T. Kajita, T. Kanzaki, T. Suzuki, J. E. Kim, K. Kato, M. Takata, and T. Katsufuji, Opening of a charge gap with V trimerization in BaV<sub>10</sub>O<sub>15</sub>, Phys. Rev. B **81**, 060405(R) (2010).
- [9] K. Takubo, T. Kanzaki, Y. Yamasaki, H. Nakao, Y. Murakami, T. Oguchi, and T. Katsufuji, Orbital states of V trimers in  $BaV_{10}O_{15}$  detected by resonant x-ray scattering, Phys. Rev. B **86**, 085141 (2012).
- [10] D. Hirai, M. Bremholm, J. M. Allred, J. Krizan, L. M. Schoop, Q. Huang, J. Tao, and R. J. Cava, Spontaneous formation of zigzag chains at the metal-insulator transition in the βpyrochlore CsW<sub>2</sub>O<sub>6</sub>, Phys. Rev. Lett. **110**, 166402 (2013).
- [11] Y. Okamoto, H. Amano, N. Katayama, H. Sawa, K. Niki, R. Mitoka, H. Harima, T. Hasegawa, N. Ogita, Y. Tanaka, M. Takigawa, Y. Yokoyama, K. Takehana, Y. Imanaka, Y. Nakamura, H. Kishida, and K. Takenaka, Regular-triangle trimer and charge order preserving the Anderson condition in the pyrochlore structure of CsW<sub>2</sub>O<sub>6</sub>, Nat. Commun. **11**, 3144 (2020).
- [12] S. Nagata, T. Hagino, Y. Seki, and T. Bitoh, Metal-insulator transition in thiospinel CuIr<sub>2</sub>S<sub>4</sub>, Physica B **194-196**, 1077 (1994).

Acknowledgments. The authors would like to thank Prof. S.V. Streltsov for enlightening discussions. D.T. acknowledges the support by the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft (DFG, German Research Foundation) under the Walter Benjamin Programme, Project No. 521584902. M.F.-C. greatly acknowledges funding from the German Research Foundation (DFG) Grant No. 387555779. The HAXPES measurements were facilitated by the Max Planck-POSTECH-Hsinchu Center for Complex Phase Materials. This work was supported by Grants-in-Aid from the Japan Society of the Promotion of Science (JSPS) (Grant No. JP22H01172).

- [13] P. G. Radaelli, Y. Horibe, M. J. Gutmann, H. Ishibashi, C. H. Chen, R. M. Ibberson, Y. Koyama, Y. S. Hor, V. Kirykhin, and S. W. Cheong, Formation of isomorphic Ir<sup>3+</sup> and Ir<sup>4+</sup> octamers and spin dimerization in the spinel CuIr<sub>2</sub>S<sub>4</sub>, Nature (London) **416**, 155 (2002).
- [14] D. I. Khomskii and T. Mizokawa, Orbitally induced Peierls state in spinels, Phys. Rev. Lett. 94, 156402 (2005).
- [15] D. I. Khomskii and S. V. Streltsov, Orbital effects in solids: Basics, recent progress, and opportunities, Chem. Rev. 121, 2992 (2021).
- [16] L. L. Van Zandt, J. M. Honig, and J. B. Goodenough, Resistivity and magnetic order in Ti<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub>, J. Appl. Phys. **39**, 594 (1968).
- [17] H. Sato, A. Tanaka, M. Sawada, F. Iga, K. Tsuji, M. Tsubota, M. Takemura, K. Yaji, M. Nagira, A. Kimura, T. Takabatake, H. Namatame, and M. Taniguchi, Ti 3*d* orbital change across metal–insulator transition in Ti<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub>: Polarization-dependent soft X-ray absorption spectroscopy at Ti 2*p* Edge, J. Phys. Soc. Jpn. 75, 053702 (2006).
- [18] C. F. Chang, T. C. Koethe, Z. Hu, J. Weinen, S. Agrestini, L. Zhao, J. Gegner, H. Ott, G. Panaccione, Hua Wu, M. W. Haverkort, H. Roth, A. C. Komarek, F. Offi, G. Monaco, Y.-F. Liao, K.-D. Tsuei, H.-J. Lin, C. T. Chen, A. Tanaka *et al.*, *c*-axis dimer and its electronic breakup: The insulator-to-metal transition in Ti<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub>, Phys. Rev. X 8, 021004 (2018).
- [19] T. Miyoshino, D. Takegami, A. Meléndez-Sans, R. Nakamura, M. Yoshimura, K.-D. Tsuei, K. Takasu, T. Okuda, L. H. Tjeng, and T. Mizokawa, Intra *c*-axis dimer hybridization and mixed valency in Mg-doped Ti<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub>, Phys. Rev. B **107**, 115145 (2023).
- [20] J. P. Sheckelton, J. R. Neilson, D. G. Soltan, and T. M. McQueen, Possible valence-bond condensation in the frustrated cluster magnet LiZn<sub>2</sub>Mo<sub>3</sub>O<sub>8</sub>, Nat. Mater. **11**, 493 (2012).
- [21] M. Mourigal, W. T. Fuhrman, J. P. Sheckelton, A. Wartelle, J. A. Rodriguez-Rivera, D. L. Abernathy, T. M. McQueen, and C. L. Broholm, Molecular quantum magnetism in LiZn<sub>2</sub>Mo<sub>3</sub>O<sub>8</sub>, Phys. Rev. Lett. **112**, 027202 (2014).
- [22] G. Chen, H.-Y. Kee, and Y. B. Kim, Cluster Mott insulators and two Curie-Weiss regimes on an anisotropic kagome lattice, Phys. Rev. B 93, 245134 (2016).
- [23] S. A. Nikolaev, I. V. Solovyev, and S. V. Streltsov, Quantum spin liquid and cluster Mott insulator phases in the Mo<sub>3</sub>O<sub>8</sub> magnets, npj Quantum Mater. 6, 25 (2021).
- [24] F. A. Cotton, M. P. Diebold, and W. J. Roth, Discrete trinuclear complexes of niobium and tantalum related to the local structure

in niobium chloride, Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub>, J. Am. Chem. Soc. **109**, 2833 (1987).

- [25] K. Momma and F. Izumi, VESTA 3 for three-dimensional visualization of crystal, volumetric and morphology data, J. Appl. Crystallogr. 44, 1272 (2011).
- [26] D. J. Hinz, G. Meyer, T. Dedecke, and W. Urland, Na<sub>2</sub>Ti<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub>: From isolated Ti<sup>2+</sup> ions to [Ti<sub>3</sub>]<sup>6+</sup> clusters, Angew. Chem. Int. Ed. Engl. 34, 71 (1995).
- [27] N. Hänni, M. D. Frontzek, J. Hauser, D. Cheptiakov, and K. Kramer, Low temperature phases of Na<sub>2</sub>Ti<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub> revisited, Z. Anorg. Allg. Chem. **643**, 2063 (2017).
- [28] Z. A. Kelly, T. T. Tran, and T. M. McQueen, Nonpolar-topolar trimerization transitions in the S = 1 kagome magnet Na<sub>2</sub>Ti<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub>, Inorg. Chem. **58**, 11941 (2019).
- [29] A. Paul, C. M. Chung, T. Birol, and H. J. Changlani, Spin-lattice coupling and the emergence of the trimerized phase in the *S* = 1 kagome antiferromagnet Na<sub>2</sub>Ti<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub>, Phys. Rev. Lett. **124**, 167203 (2020).
- [30] D. I. Khomskii, T. Mizokawa, and S. V. Streltsov, Comment on "spin-lattice coupling and the emergence of the trimerized phase in the S = 1 kagome antiferromagnet Na<sub>2</sub>Ti<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub>", Phys. Rev. Lett. **127**, 049701 (2021).
- [31] M. Ströbele, J. Glaser, A. Lachgar, and H.-J. Meyer, Struktur und elektrochemische untersuchung von Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub>, Z. Anorg. Allg. Chem. **627**, 2002 (2001).
- [32] Y. Haraguchi, C. Michioka, M. Ishikawa, Y. Nakano, H. Yamochi, H. Ueda, and K. Yoshimura, Magnetic-nonmagnetic phase transition with interlayer charge disproportionation of Nb<sub>3</sub> trimers in the cluster compound Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub>, Inorg. Chem. 56, 3483 (2017).
- [33] Z. Sun, H. Zhou, C. Wang, S. Kumar, D. Geng, S. Yue, X. Han, Y. Haraguchi, K. Shimada, P. Cheng, L. Chen, Y. Shi, K. Wu, S. Meng, and B. Feng, Observation of topological flat bands in the kagome semiconductor Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub>, Nano Lett. 22, 4596 (2022).
- [34] S. Gao, S. Zhang, C. Wang, S. Yan, X. Han, X. Ji, W. Tao, J. Liu, T. Wang, S. Yuan, G. Qu, Z. Chen, Y. Zhang, J. Huang, M. Pan, S. Peng, Y. Hu, H. Li, Y. Huang, H. Zhou *et al.*, Discovery of a single-band Mott insulator in a van der Waals flat-band compound, Phys. Rev. X 13, 041049 (2023).
- [35] Y. Zhang, Y. Gu, H. Weng, K. Jiang, and J. Hu, Mottness in two-dimensional van der Waals Nb<sub>3</sub>X<sub>8</sub> monolayers (*X*=Cl, Br, and I), Phys. Rev. B **107**, 035126 (2023).
- [36] J. Hu, X. Zhang, C. Hu, J. Sun, X. Wang, H.-Q. Lin, and G. Li, Correlated flat bands and quantum spin liquid state in a cluster Mott insulator, Commun. Phys. 6, 172 (2023).
- [37] J. Weinen, T. C. Koethe, C. F. Chang, S. Agrestini, D. Kasinathan, Y. F. Liao, H. Fujiwara, C. Schler-Langeheine, F. Strigari, T. Haupricht, G. Panaccione, F. Offi, G. Monaco, S. Huotari, K.-D. Tsuei, and L. H. Tjeng, Polarization dependent hard X-ray photoemission experiments for solids: Efficiency and limits for unraveling the orbital character of the valence band, J. Electron Spectrosc. Relat. Phenom. **198**, 6 (2015).
- [38] M. P. Seah and W. A. Dench, Quantitative electron spectroscopy of surfaces: A standard data base for electron inelastic mean free paths in solids, Surf. Interface Anal. 1, 2 (1979).
- [39] H. Shinotsuka, S. Tanuma, C. J. Powell, and D. R. Penn, Calculations of electron inelastic mean free paths. XII. Data for 42 inorganic compounds over the 50 eV to 200 keV range

with the full Penn algorithm, Surf. Interface Anal. **51**, 427 (2019).

- [40] See Supplemental Material at http://link.aps.org/supplemental/ 10.1103/PhysRevB.110.L081109 for survey scan, Cl 2p simulation for virtual structure, Nb 3d fitting analysis, Nb 3p and Cl 2s spectra, GGA and GGA+U partial density of states.
- [41] J. Yoon, E. Lesne, K. Sklarek, J. Sheckelton, C. Pasco, S. S. P. Parkin, T. M. McQueen, and M. N. Ali, Anomalous thicknessdependent electrical conductivity in van der Waals layered transition metal halide Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub>, J. Phys.: Condens. Matter 32, 304004 (2020).
- [42] P. Giannozzi, O. Andreussi, T. Brumme, O. Bunau, M. Buongiorno Nardelli, M. Calandra, R. Car, C. Cavazzoni, D. Ceresoli, M. Cococcioni, N. Colonna, I. Carnimeo, A. Dal Corso, S. de Gironcoli, P. Delugas, R. A. DiStasio Jr., A. Ferretti, A. Floris, G. Fratesi, G. Fugallo, R. Gebauer, U. Gerstmann, F. Giustino *et al.*, Advanced capabilities for materials modelling with Quantum ESPRESSO, J. Phys.: Condens. Matter **29**, 465901 (2017).
- [43] S. Civiš, A. Knížek, P. B. Rimmer, M. Ferus, P. Kubelík, M. Zukalová, L. Kavan, and E. Chatzitheodoridis, Formation of methane and (per)chlorates on mars, ACS Earth Space Chem. 3, 221 (2019).
- [44] H.-D. Kim, H.-J. Noh, K. H. Kim, and S.-J. Oh, Core-level photoemission revealing the Mott transition, Phys. B: Condens. Matter 359-361, 1267 (2005).
- [45] Z. V. Pchelkina, I. A. Nekrasov, Th. Pruschke, A. Sekiyama, S. Suga, V. I. Anisimov, and D. Vollhardt, Evidence for strong electronic correlations in the spectra of Sr<sub>2</sub>RuO<sub>4</sub>, Phys. Rev. B 75, 035122 (2007).
- [46] G. Zhang and E. Pavarini, Mott transition, spin-orbit effects, and magnetism in Ca<sub>2</sub>RuO<sub>4</sub>, Phys. Rev. B 95, 075145 (2017).
- [47] A. Chikamatsu, Y. Kurauchi, K. Kawahara, T. Onozuka, M. Minohara, H. Kumigashira, E. Ikenaga, and T. Hasegawa, Spectroscopic and theoretical investigation of the electronic states of layered perovskite oxyfluoride Sr<sub>2</sub>RuO<sub>3</sub>F<sub>2</sub> thin films, Phys. Rev. B **97**, 235101 (2018).
- [48] T. T. Tran, K. Takubo, T. Mizokawa, W. Kobayashi, and I. Terasaki, Electronic structure of CaCu<sub>3</sub>Ru<sub>4</sub>O<sub>12</sub> studied by x-ray photoemission spectroscopy, Phys. Rev. B 73, 193105 (2006).
- [49] T. Sudayama, Y. Wakisaka, K. Takubo, T. Mizokawa, W. Kobayashi, I. Terasaki, S. Tanaka, Y. Maeno, M. Arita, H. Namatame, and M. Taniguchi, Bulk-sensitive photoemission study of ACu<sub>3</sub>Ru<sub>4</sub>O<sub>12</sub> (A=Ca, Na, and La) with heavy-fermion behavior, Phys. Rev. B 80, 075113 (2009).
- [50] D. Takegami, C.-Y. Kuo, K. Kasebayashi, J.-G. Kim, C. F. Chang, C. E. Liu, C. N. Wu, D. Kasinathan, S. G. Altendorf, K. Hoefer, F. Meneghin, A. Marino, Y. F. Liao, K. D. Tsuei, C. T. Chen, K.-T. Ko, A. Günther, S. G. Ebbinghaus, J. W. Seo, D. H. Lee, G. Ryu *et al.*, CaCu<sub>3</sub>Ru<sub>4</sub>O<sub>12</sub>: A high-Kondo-temperature transition-metal oxide, Phys. Rev. X **12**, 011017 (2022).
- [51] T. Yasuda, Y. Kondo, T. Kajita, K. Murota, D. Ootsuki, Y. Takagi, A. Yasui, N. L. Saini, T. Katsufuji, and T. Mizokawa, Interplay between electronic correlation and atomic disorder in a low carrier density 4*d* transition-metal oxide, Phys. Rev. B 102, 205133 (2020).
- [52] R. Nakamura, T. Miyoshino, T. Kajita, T. Katsufuji, N. L. Saini, and T. Mizokawa, Electronic structure of Ba<sub>3</sub>Nb<sub>5</sub>O<sub>15</sub> and Ba<sub>2</sub>SrNb<sub>5</sub>O<sub>15</sub> studied by band calculation and photoemission spectroscopy, J. Phys. Soc. Jpn. **91**, 064711 (2022).

- [53] R. Nakamura, D. Takegami, A. Melendez-Sans, L. H. Tjeng, M. Okawa, T. Miyoshino, N. L. Saini, M. Kitamura, D. Shiga, H. Kumigashira, M. Yoshimura, K.-D. Tsuei, Y. Okamoto, and T. Mizokawa, Electronic structure reconstruction by trimer formation in CsW<sub>2</sub>O<sub>6</sub> studied by x-ray photoelectron spectroscopy, Phys. Rev. B **106**, 195104 (2022).
- [54] K. Takubo, S. Hirata, J.-Y. Son, J. W. Quilty, T. Mizokawa, N. Matsumoto, and S. Nagata, X-ray photoemission study of  $CuIr_2S_4$ :  $Ir^{3+}$ - $Ir^{4+}$  charge ordering and the effect of light illumination, Phys. Rev. Lett. **95**, 246401 (2005).
- [55] Y. Nakatsu, A. Sekiyama, S. Imada, Y. Okamoto, S. Niitaka, H. Takagi, A. Higashiya, M. Yabashi, K. Tamasaku, T. Ishikawa, and S. Suga, Hard x-ray photoelectron spectroscopy of the metal-insulator transition in LiRh<sub>2</sub>O<sub>4</sub>, Phys. Rev. B 83, 115120 (2011).
- [56] S. Grytsiuk, M. I. Katsnelson, E. G. C. P. van Loon, and M. Rösner, Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub>: A prototypical layered Mott-Hubbard insulator, npj Quantum Mater. 9, 8 (2024).
- [57] A. Bouhmouche, A. Jabar, I. Rhrissi, and R. Moubah, Highly optical anisotropy, electronic and thermodynamic properties of the topological flat bands Kagome Nb<sub>3</sub>Cl<sub>8</sub>, Mater. Sci. Semicond. Process. **175**, 108238 (2024).

- [58] J. J. Yeh and I. Lindau, Atomic subshell photoionization cross sections and asymmetry parameters: 1 ≤ Z ≤ 103, At. Data Nucl. Data Tables 32, 1 (1985).
- [59] M. B. Trzhaskovskaya and V. G. Yarzhemsky, Dirac–Fock photoionization parameters for HAXPES applications, At. Data Nucl. Data Tables 119, 99 (2018).
- [60] K. Maiti, P. Mahadevan, and D. Das Sarma, Evolution of spectral function in a doped Mott insulator: Surface vs bulk contributions, Phys. Rev. Lett. 80, 2885 (1998).
- [61] K. Maiti, D. D. Sarma, M. J. Rozenberg, I. H. Inoue, H. Makino, O. Goto, M. Pedio, and R. Cimino, Electronic structure of Ca<sub>1-x</sub>Sr<sub>x</sub>VO<sub>3</sub>: A tale of two energy scales, Europhys. Lett. 55, 246 (2001).
- [62] A. Sekiyama, H. Fujiwara, S. Imada, S. Suga, H. Eisaki, S. I. Uchida, K. Takegahara, H. Harima, Y. Saitoh, I. A. Nekrasov, G. Keller, D. E. Kondakov, A. V. Kozhevnikov, Th. Pruschke, K. Held, D. Vollhardt, and V. I. Anisimov, Mutual experimental and theoretical validation of bulk photoemission spectra of Sr<sub>1-x</sub>Ca<sub>x</sub>VO<sub>3</sub>, Phys. Rev. Lett. **93**, 156402 (2004).
- [63] R. J. O. Mossanek, M. Abbate, T. Yoshida, A. Fujimori, Y. Yoshida, N. Shirakawa, H. Eisaki, S. Kohno, P. T. Fonseca, and F. C. Vicentin, Electronic structure of the band-filling-controlled CaVO<sub>3</sub> and LaVO<sub>3</sub> compounds, J. Phys.: Condens. Matter 22, 095601 (2010).