# Metal-insulator transitions in epitaxial rocksalt-structure $Cr_{1-x/2}N_{1-x}O_x(001)$

Mary E. McGahay,<sup>1</sup> Sanjay V. Khare<sup>0</sup>,<sup>2</sup> and Daniel Gall<sup>0</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Department of Materials Science and Engineering, Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute, Troy, New York 12180, USA <sup>2</sup>Department of Physics and Astronomy, The University of Toledo, Toledo, Ohio 43606, USA

(Received 7 July 2020; revised 12 November 2020; accepted 16 November 2020; published 1 December 2020)

Substitutional replacement of N with O in epitaxial CrN(001) layers is achieved by reactive sputter deposition in a mixed  $N_2$  and  $Ar + O_2$  atmosphere. O incorporation facilitates Cr vacancies, yielding a rocksalt-structure solid solution  $Cr_{1-x/2}N_{1-x}O_x$  with a single compositional parameter x and a measured lattice constant that decreases from a = 0.4175 to 0.4116 nm for x = 0 to 0.59. First-principles calculations predict da/dx = +0.0200, -0.0018, and -0.0087 nm for CrN<sub>1-x</sub>O<sub>x</sub>, Cr<sub>1-x/3</sub>N<sub>1-x</sub>O<sub>x</sub>, and Cr<sub>1-x/2</sub>N<sub>1-x</sub>O<sub>x</sub>, respectively, and confirm, in combination with ion-beam compositional analyses and x-ray diffraction results, a vacancy concentration of x/2 per cation site. The room-temperature resistivity decreases by over two orders of magnitudes from  $\rho = 1.5 \times 10^{-3}$  to  $7.7 \times 10^{-6} \Omega$  m for x = 0–0.26. This is accompanied by a transition from a negative to a positive temperature coefficient of resistivity, an increase in the Hall mobility from  $\mu_{\rm H} = 0.37$  to  $1.7 \,{\rm cm}^2/{\rm Vs}$ , an increase in the carrier concentration  $n = 1.1 \times 10^{20}$  to  $4.9 \times 10^{21}$  cm<sup>-3</sup>, and a decrease in the calculated band gap from 0.54 to 0 eV. However,  $\rho$  increases again to  $6.9 \times 10^{-5} \Omega$  m for x = 0.34 and to > 10  $\Omega$  m for  $x \ge 0.59$ , with a corresponding drop in  $\mu_{\rm H}$  and the opening of a gap. The maximum in the measured carrier density and conductivity at x = 0.26 is attributed to a maximum in the density of states near the Fermi level, in perfect agreement with calculations using supercells with randomly distributed O substitutions and Cr vacancies that predict a maximum at  $x = 0.25 \pm 0.05$ . The measurements indicate insulator-to-metal and subsequent metal-to-insulator transitions at  $x = 0.04 \pm 0.03$  and  $0.30 \pm 0.03$ , respectively. The transition to metallic conduction is attributed to substitutional O on anion sites acting as donors, while the measured nfor x = 0.01-0.26 quantitatively indicates charge compensation by cation vacancies that act as acceptors. The insulating properties at large x are likely caused by increased electron correlation effects.

DOI: 10.1103/PhysRevB.102.235102

## I. INTRODUCTION

Chromium nitride has gained considerable interest because of its magnetic ordering and possible band gap [1-4] that make it a promising material for dilute magnetic semiconductors, especially when combined with other nitride semiconductors [5–7]. Additionally, it is widely used as an oxidation- and wear-resistant layer in protective [8-10] and self-lubricious [11–13] hard coatings. CrN also shows promising thermoelectric properties [14-16], which are enhanced through doping with Sc [16,17], Al [18], and V [19]. Alloying CrN with CrO to form  $CrN_{1-x}O_x$  has gained some interest due to its high oxidation resistance [20-22] and as a hard coating material [23,24] that combines the hardness of  $Cr_2O_3$  with the toughness of CrN. Oxygen in rocksalt-structure  $CrN_{1-x}O_x$ has a maximum solubility of x = 0.46-0.70 [20,24,25], while higher oxygen content yields corundum  $Cr_2O_3$  [20,25–28]. Rocksalt CrO is not stable due to electron occupation of antibonding orbitals [26] but may be stabilized through vacancies [29,30]. It has been deposited on MgO(001) as an epitaxial layer through pulsed laser deposition [31]. However, most reports on CrO thin films are on layers that are just a few monolayers thick [29,32-34], as a larger thickness facilitates transformation to  $Cr_2O_3$ , the most stable chromium oxide [26].

Our recent work on the controlled oxygen exposure of CrN(001) surfaces demonstrates the formation of a conductive *n*-type surface oxide [35], suggesting that O may be used to form metallic Cr-N-O. These results are consistent with reports which indicate that small concentrations of oxygen impurities in CrN may increase its conductivity [36,37], while larger concentrations lead to insulating films with resistivities that are several orders of magnitude above those of stoichiometric CrN films [26,28,37,38], and also exhibit an increasing optical band gap [27,39].

In this paper we report on the growth and electronic properties of epitaxial cubic  $\operatorname{Cr}_{1-x/2}\operatorname{N}_{1-x}\operatorname{O}_x(001)$  layers deposited on MgO(001) by reactive sputtering using N<sub>2</sub> and a 90% Ar-10% O<sub>2</sub> gas mixture. X-ray diffraction  $\theta$ -2 $\theta$  scans and  $\omega$  rocking curves indicate that the layers are epitaxial and exhibit a single-phase solid-solution rocksalt structure without any detected secondary phases or misoriented grains for  $x \leq 0.59$ . Temperature-dependent electronic transport measurements show a drop in the room-temperature resistivity with increasing x that is attributed to an insulator-to-metal transition between x = 0.01 and 0.08. This trend is reversed between x = 0.26 and 0.34, indicating a second transition back to insulating compounds for  $x \geq 0.34$ . Hall measurements confirm these results which demonstrate that oxygen in CrN causes both n-type

doping and carrier localization at low and high concentrations, respectively.

#### **II. PROCEDURE**

 $Cr_{1-x/2}N_{1-x}O_x(001)$  layers were deposited in a threechamber ultrahigh vacuum DC magnetron sputtering system with a base pressure of  $10^{-9}$  Torr. Single-side polished  $10 \times$  $10 \times 0.5 \,\mathrm{mm^3}$  MgO(001) wafers were cleaned with successive rinses in ultrasonic baths of trichloroethylene, acetone, isopropyl alcohol, and deionized water, inserted into the deposition system and thermally degassed in vacuum at 1000 °C for 1 h. Subsequently, the substrate temperature was lowered to the deposition temperature of 750 °C. A 5-cm-diameter 99.95% pure Cr target at a distance of 10.5 cm from the substrate and at an angle of 45° was sputter cleaned with closed shutters prior to deposition. A constant flux of 99.999% pure N2 that was further purified with a MicroTorr purifier was leaked into the chamber to reach a pressure of 10 mTorr. To achieve different compositions, a 90% Ar - 10% O<sub>2</sub> mixture was additionally leaked into the chamber with a partial pressure  $p_{Ar+O2}$  ranging from 0 to 3 mTorr, yielding an oxygen partial pressure  $p_{O2} = 0-0.3$  mTorr and a total processing gas pressure of 10-13 mTorr. A constant power of 350 W was applied to the magnetron for 45 min, yielding a growth rate of 15-27 nm/min and a resulting layer thickness of 680-1200 nm, as measured by cross-sectional scanning electron microscopy (SEM) in a FEI Versa 3D field-emission scanning electron microscope using a 20-keV primary electron beam. The thickness from the micrographs was determined by contrast analysis using the software IMAGEJ.

The composition of the  $Cr_{1-x/2}N_{1-x}O_x(001)$  layers was determined by Rutherford (elastic) backscattering spectroscopy (RBS/EBS) using 2 and 3.05 MeV <sup>4</sup>He<sup>+</sup> ions incident at an angle of 6° relative to the sample surface normal and a total scattering angle of 166.2° between incident beam and detector. The latter energy is high enough such that Rutherford's approximation of a point charge is no longer correct, and there is a resonance in the O scattering cross section which increases the measurement's sensitivity for O. The acquired spectra were analyzed using the SIMNRA software.

X-ray diffraction (XRD)  $\theta$ -2 $\theta$  scans and  $\omega$  rocking curves were obtained with a PANanalytical X'Pert Pro diffractometer with a Cu  $K\alpha$  source. Symmetric  $\theta$ -2 $\theta$  scans were collected over a 2 $\theta$  range of 20°–90° using a parallel-beam configuration with an x-ray mirror and a PixCEL solid-state line detector operated in receiving mode with an active length of 0.165 mm.  $\omega$  rocking curves were obtained using the same source and the solid-state detector set at a constant 2 $\theta$  angle corresponding to the Cr<sub>1-x/2</sub>N<sub>1-x</sub>O<sub>x</sub> 002 reflection, similar to what we have reported in Ref. [40].

Electron transport measurements were performed in vacuum in a Cryomagnetics, Inc., <sup>4</sup>He cryostat with a variable temperature T = 5-295 K and a superconducting magnet with a maximum 4.45-T field. 0.5-mm-wide Au-Pd contacts were sputter deposited in a van der Pauw arrangement at the corners of  $5 \times 5$  mm<sup>2</sup> samples. Electric contacts were completed by attaching copper wires to each of the sputter-deposited contacts using indium droplets. Continuous resistivity measurements were performed during sample warmup with 0.5 K/min from 5 to 295 K. A Keithley 2400 source meter was used as both a voltmeter and a current source, with the current adjusted depending on the sample resistance to I = 0.001, 1, or 10 mA. Hall effect measurements at 295 K were performed in the same equipment. The Hall resistance was determined from a linear fit of the measured Hall voltage as a function of the current of -40 to +40 A in the superconducting coil, yielding a continuously varying magnetic field from -4.14 to 4.14 T.

First-principles calculations were performed using the Vienna ab initio simulation package (VASP), employing periodic boundary conditions, a plane-wave basis set, the Perdew-Burke-Ernzerhof generalized gradient approximation exchange correlation functional [41], and the projectoraugmented wave method [42]. A 550-eV cut-off energy for the plane-wave basis set and a  $6 \times 6 \times 6$   $\Gamma$ -centered k-point grid for 64-atom supercells yield energy convergence of <1 meV/atom. Cr 3s, 3p, 3d, and 4s electrons are explicitly calculated using the Cr\_sv pseudopotential provided with the VASP package. All calculations are done using a Hubbard Coulomb term  $U = 3 \,\mathrm{eV}$ , which has previously been successfully applied [2,3] to describe the low-temperature antiferromagnetic CrN ground state that exhibits a 1.7° distortion from cubic symmetry [43]. Here we choose the same lowest-energy antiferromagnetic ordering with pairs of ferromagnetic Cr planes that are stacked along the [110] direction, which is typically referred to as AFM [011]<sub>2</sub>, but keep the structure cubic, consistent with the experimental roomtemperature observation. More specifically, rocksalt-structure supercells with 64 atomic sites are formed by randomly populating anion sites with N and O atoms to achieve a desired composition x. In addition, cation vacancies are introduced by removing Cr atoms at random sites but with the constraint to keep the overall magnetization minimal (i.e., antiferromagnetic) by removing the same number (or  $\pm 1$ ) of Cr atoms with up and down magnetic moments. Each such supercell is relaxed by iteratively relaxing the atomic positions and relaxing the lattice constant a by adjusting the length of the three unit-cell vectors while keeping their lengths equal to each other and the angles between them at 90°. The simulated compositions include  $n_0 = 0, 6, 12$ , or 18 oxygen atoms and  $n_{\rm V} = 0$ ,  $n_{\rm O}/3$ , or  $n_{\rm O}/2$  Cr vacancies, yielding the compounds  $CrN_{1-x}O_x$ ,  $Cr_{1-x/3}N_{1-x}O_x$ , and  $Cr_{1-x/2}N_{1-x}O_x$ , with x = 0, 0.1875, 0.375, and 0.5625. For each combination of  $n_0$  and  $n_{\rm V}$ , three supercells with different atomic arrangements are individually relaxed, corresponding to a total of 28 simulations. The lattice constant is determined from the average of the three supercells. This approach was chosen instead of the Special Quasirandom Structures approach [44], because the variation in a from the three simulations provides an indication of the uncertainty in the determined lattice constant associated with the distribution of N and O atoms on anion sites and Cr atoms or vacancies on cation sites. We note that the random distribution of Cr vacancies also affects the arrangement of local magnetic moments such that the sampling from three independent simulations provides an indication of possible effects of the magnetic exchange on the average bond length. Such exchange striction effects have been reported to be important for CrN [45]. The same calculations were also used to determine the total density of states (DOS). However,



FIG. 1. Layer composition measured by RBS/EBS and plotted as atomic fractions of Cr, N, and O vs  $O_2$  partial pressure  $p_{O2}$  during layer deposition.

only supercells with an even number of Cr atoms were considered in order to minimize net magnetization. Correspondingly, to achieve sufficient composition resolution, additional calculations were performed for  $\operatorname{Cr}_{1-x/2} \operatorname{N}_{1-x} O_x$  with x = 0.125, 0.25, and 0.5 and for  $\operatorname{Cr}_{N_{1-x}} O_x$  with x = 0.03125 and 0.0625.

### **III. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

Figure 1 is a plot of the measured atomic fractions of Cr, N, and O in the deposited layers as a function of the  $O_2$ partial pressure  $p_{O2}$ , as determined from RBS/EBS analyses. In the absence of oxygen  $(p_{O2} = 0)$ , the measured Cr and N content of 49  $\pm$  3% and 51  $\pm$  3% indicate stoichiometric CrN. In contrast, increasing  $p_{02}$  to 0.3 mTorr leads to an approximately linear increase in the oxygen content from 0 to  $45 \pm 3\%$  and a simultaneous decrease in both the N and the Cr content. This results in a decreasing cation-to-anion ratio y =[Cr]/([O]+[N]), suggesting an increasing concentration of Cr vacancies. The layer composition can in general be described as  $Cr_v N_{1-x}O_x$ . However, because of the approximately linear composition relationships, we can plot the measured y vs x(not shown) and use a linear function y = a - bx for data fitting and find a = 0.97 and b = 0.51. These values are close to 1.0 and 0.5 so that the cation-to-anion ratio can be approximated as y = 1 - x/2, and throughout this paper we refer to our layers as  $Cr_{1-x/2}N_{1-x}O_x$ . Thus our compositional analysis indicates that the substitutional replacement of two N by two O atoms results in the formation of one Cr vacancy. The presence of cation vacancies has previously been reported for both rocksalt CrO [25,29,32] and CrON [20,26] films and is attributed to the destabilizing effects of a high valence electron concentration [46,47], that is, cation vacancies reduce the occupation of antibonding d orbitals and stabilize the rocksalt structure [26], similar to what has been reported for other column-6 nitrides like MoN [48] and WN [49,50] as well as monoxides including TiO and VO [51-53]. We note that the RBS/EBS analyses also provide quantitative information on the area atomic density which, together with thickness measurements by SEM, shows that the occupation of anion sites by nitrogen



FIG. 2. (a) X-ray diffraction  $\theta$ -2 $\theta$  scans from epitaxial  $Cr_{1-x/2}N_{1-x}O_x(001)$  layers grown on MgO(001) with  $p_{O2} = 0$ -0.3 mTorr. (b) Lattice constant *a* vs *x* as measured by XRD from  $Cr_{1-x/2}N_{1-x}O_x(001)$  layers (red squares) and determined from first-principles calculations for  $CrN_{1-x}O_x$  (green circles),  $Cr_{1-x/3}N_{1-x}O_x$  (maroon triangles), and  $Cr_{1-x/2}N_{1-x}O_x$  (gray diamonds).

plus oxygen atoms is  $1.00 \pm 0.02$  for all samples, indicating a negligible vacancy concentration on anion sites.

Figure 2(a) shows sections of x-ray diffraction  $\theta$ -2 $\theta$  patterns from seven  $Cr_{1-x/2}N_{1-x}O_x$  layers grown with different  $p_{02} = 0-0.3$  mTorr, as labeled. The measured intensities are plotted on a logarithmic scale, and patterns from the different samples are shifted by an order of magnitude for clarity purposes. For all samples, the only peaks that can be detected in the measured  $2\theta$  range from  $20^{\circ}$  to  $90^{\circ}$  are within the plotted  $2\theta = 42^{\circ} - 45^{\circ}$ , indicating an 001 orientation for all layers. The double-peak feature at  $42.91^{\circ}$  and  $43.02^{\circ}$  is evident in all patterns and is from the substrate MgO 002 reflections of the  $Cu_{K\alpha 1}$  and  $Cu_{K\alpha 2}$  x rays with wavelengths of 0.15406 and 0.15444 nm, respectively. The pattern from the pure CrN layer (x = 0) exhibits in addition a similar but 7-times-less-intense double peak at  $2\theta = 43.31^{\circ}$  and  $43.43^{\circ}$ which is from the CrN 002 reflections and indicates a CrN lattice constant a = 0.4175 nm. This is in excellent agreement with previously published values of 0.4176 and 0.4179 nm from epitaxial CrN(001) deposited by reactive sputtering on MgO(001) [1,54]. We note that all these values represent the lattice constant in the growth direction and may therefore be slightly larger than the true relaxed lattice constant because of a possible compressive strain caused by differential thermal contraction during cooling from the deposition temperature that can lead to an expanded out-of-plane lattice constant. In fact, we have recently used x-ray diffraction reciprocal space maps [55] to measure a -0.31% in-plane compressive strain in a 300-nm-thick CrN(001) layer with an out-of-plane a = 0.4186 nm but a relaxed lattice constant of 0.4175 nm. This latter value perfectly matches our current measured a, suggesting that the CrN layer in this report has a negligible strain which may be attributed to the more than two-times larger thickness, facilitating relaxation through misfit dislocations. The patterns in Fig. 2 show that increasing  $p_{O2}$  causes the  $Cr_{1-x/2}N_{1-x}O_x$  002 reflections to shift to larger 2 $\theta$  values, corresponding to a decreasing lattice constant with increasing oxygen content, as discussed below. In addition, peaks for alloys with  $p_{O2} = 0.01-0.1$  mTorr are 3-5 times less intense than for pure CrN and 70 times smaller for  $p_{O2} = 0.2 \text{ mTorr}$ , indicating a decreasing crystalline quality. This suggests that the oxygen substitution degrades the crystalline quality, as also indicated by the rocking-curve results discussed below. The decreasing crystalline quality is also reflected by the fact that the double-peak feature can no longer be resolved for the layer with x = 0.59 deposited with  $p_{O2} = 0.2$  mTorr. The  $\theta$ -2 $\theta$  scan for  $p_{O2} = 0.3$  mTorr exhibits no detectable peaks from the alloy film with x = 0.75 over the entire measured  $2\theta = 20^{\circ} - 90^{\circ}$  range, indicating a continued decrease in crystalline quality and suggesting a transition to an amorphous or nanocrystalline corundum structure that cannot be detected by our XRD measurements, consistent with the reported limit of x = 0.46-0.75 for the rocksalt-phase CrN<sub>1-x</sub>O<sub>x</sub> solid solution [20,24,25]. We note that the pattern for  $p_{O2} = 0.1$  mTorr exhibits a shoulder to the right of the layer peak with  $2\theta = 43.9^{\circ}$ that also matches the peak position for  $p_{O2} = 0.2 \text{ mTorr.}$  We do not interpret this as the emergence of an oxide phase at large x, because (i) the peak position is inconsistent with both possible Cr<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> and CrO<sub>2</sub> phases, (ii) the rocking-curve width remains narrow ( $<1^\circ$ ), as discussed below, and (iii) no other reflections can be detected over the entire measured  $2\theta$  range from  $20^{\circ}$  to  $90^{\circ}$ . Correspondingly, we attribute the shoulder and peak at  $p_{O2} = 0.1$  and 0.2 mTorr to a rocksalt-structure oxynitride with some possible ordering that may lead to a slight suppression of the lattice constant.

XRD  $\omega$  rocking curves (shown in the Supplemental Material [56]) from the 002 reflection of the  $Cr_{1-x/2}N_{1-x}O_x$  layers are obtained using a constant  $2\theta$  value for each sample corresponding to its K $\alpha_1$  peak position. The FWHM is 0.14° for pure CrN, indicating strong crystalline alignment of the (001) planes with the substrate surface. The width of the rocking curve increases with the addition of O to  $0.26^{\circ}$ ,  $0.34^{\circ}$ ,  $0.32^{\circ}$ ,  $0.50^{\circ}$ , and  $0.89^{\circ}$  for x = 0.02, 0.08, 0.26, 0.32, and 0.59, respectively, indicating good alignment for all layers with  $x \leq 0.59$  but a decreasing crystalline quality with increasing x. This confirms that the oxygen substitution degrades the crystalline quality, consistent with the decreasing peak intensity shown in Fig. 2. We note that the rocking curve of the x = 0.59 layer indicates a slight  $0.8^{\circ}$  tilt of the lattice planes of the layer with respect to the substrate orientation which may be caused by a strain-relaxation mechanism or may suggest a lattice distortion similar to what has been reported for the low-temperature phase of CrN [43]. Such a 0.8° deviation from the cubic 90° results in a 0.01% reduction of the unitcell volume, which is negligible and is not considered in the following analysis.

Figure 2(b) is a plot of the lattice constant *a* as a function of composition x, as determined from XRD measurements on epitaxial  $Cr_{1-x/2}N_{1-x}O_x(001)$  layers shown in Fig. 2(a). In addition, the plot includes calculated lattice constants from our first-principles simulations. The measured values plotted as red squares decrease from 0.4175 nm for CrN to 0.4116 nm for  $Cr_{0.71}N_{0.41}O_{0.59}$ . In contrast, the calculated values for  $CrN_{1-x}O_x$  increase from 0.4184 nm for CrN to 0.4215, 0.4256, and 0.4302 nm for x = 0.1875, 0.375, and x = 0.1875, 0.375, 0.375, and x = 0.1875, 0.375,0.5625. The plotted line is the result from linear curve fitting, which is done by forcing the line to intercept the x = 0 data point such that the only fitting parameter is the slope da/dx =0.0200 nm and is determined from the three x > 0 data points, including x = 0.5625, which is outside of the plotted *a* range. The positive calculated slope indicates that substitutional replacement of N with O leads to an increasing lattice parameter. As a consequence, we attribute the negative slope from the experiment to the presence of Cr vacancies. This explanation is quantitatively explored by calculating the lattice constants of  $Cr_{1-x/3}N_{1-x}O_x$  and  $Cr_{1-x/2}N_{1-x}O_x$  compounds, as also shown in Fig. 2(b). The plotted error bars correspond to the standard deviation of lattice constants from multiple simulations with different anion and cation site occupations, as described in Sec. II. The error bars are relatively small in comparison to the absolute changes in lattice parameters, suggesting that effects from anion and cation site occupations, including the related distribution of magnetic moments, are negligible in comparison to compositional effects.

The calculated *a* for  $Cr_{1-x/3}N_{1-x}O_x$  decreases very slightly, with da/dx = -0.0018 nm. In contrast, the predicted slope for  $Cr_{1-x/2}N_{1-x}O_x$  of da/dx = -0.0087 nm is much more substantial. This is attributed to the 50% higher Cr vacancy concentration for  $Cr_{1-x/2}N_{1-x}O_x$  than for  $Cr_{1-x/3}N_{1-x}O_x$ . The experimental lattice constants are best described by the  $Cr_{1-x/2}N_{1-x}O_x$  line, confirming the compositional analyses by RBS/EBS. The negative slope is also consistent with previous studies [20,25] and has been attributed to the presence of Cr vacancies that stabilize the effects of antibonding orbital occupation with increasing x[20,26], similar to the reported increasing bond strength due to cation vacancies in transition-metal monoxides [51–53]. The lattice constant of the last datapoint at x = 0.59 is even slightly below the linear trend for  $Cr_{1-x/2}N_{1-x}O_x$ , suggesting a possible bond-length reduction associated with an ordered cubic oxynitride phase, as discussed above.

We note that assigning charges of -3, -2, and +3 to N, O, and Cr ions suggests that charge neutrality would be achieved for a composition of  $Cr_{1-x/3}N_{1-x}O_x$ , with an extrapolated (x = 1) oxide of  $Cr_2O_3$ . In contrast, the experimental measured composition of  $Cr_{1-x/2}N_{1-x}O_x$  with an extrapolated Cr  $O_2$  suggests a charge of +4 for the Cr ions in the oxide. Conversely, charge neutrality in the  $Cr_{1-x/2}N_{1-x}O_x$  compound is achieved if Cr retains the nominal +3 charge and vacant cation sites have a +1 charge. In that case, the Cr vacancies have a -2 charge relative to the +3 charge of the cations. However, the transport results presented in the following do not confirm charge neutrality but instead indicate *n*-type charge carriers,



FIG. 3. (a) Electrical resistivity  $\rho$  vs temperature *T* and (b) roomtemperature carrier concentration *n* (purple) and Hall mobility  $\mu_{\rm H}$ (pink) vs *x* of epitaxial Cr<sub>1-x/2</sub>N<sub>1-x</sub>O<sub>x</sub>(001)/MgO(001) layers.

suggesting partial charge compensation and an approximate -1 charge (instead of the -2 required for charge neutrality) for the Cr vacancies. That is, Cr vacancies act as acceptors and O substitutions as donors, which results in a net *n*-type semiconductor as there are twice as many O atoms than Cr vacancies in Cr<sub>1-x/2</sub>N<sub>1-x</sub>O<sub>x</sub>.

Figure 3(a) is a plot of the measured resistivity  $\rho$  versus temperature *T* for  $\operatorname{Cr}_{1-x/2}\operatorname{N}_{1-x}\operatorname{O}_x$  films with x = 0-0.34. The CrN (x = 0) layer has a room-temperature  $\rho = 1.5 \times 10^{-3} \Omega$  m, which is within the previously reported range 8.2  $\times 10^{-5}-1.7 \times 10^{-3} \Omega$  m for epitaxial CrN films [1,2,5,54,57– 60]. The resistivity increases with decreasing *T* by over two orders of magnitude to 0.37  $\Omega$  m at 5 K. This negative temperature coefficient of resistivity (TCR) is consistent with previous studies on CrN [1,5,54,57,61] and is attributed to electron transport by variable range hopping [1,59]. We note that our CrN does not exhibit a discontinuity at the 280-K phase transition temperature, which we attribute to epitaxial constraints as we have previously reported [57]. The layer with x = 0.01 has a resistivity of 1.0 and  $6.9 \times 10^{-3} \Omega$  m at 295 and 5 K, respectively. These values are 1.5 and 54 times smaller than for CrN, indicating an increase in the conductivity and a reduction in the negative TCR with the addition of oxygen. This trend is continued with increasing x. More specifically, x = 0.08 and 0.26 results in metallic conduction with a positive TCR and a room-temperature  $\rho = 1.4 \times 10^{-5}$  and  $7.7 \times 10^{-6} \Omega$  m that is two and three orders of magnitude below that of CrN. The resistivity increases linearly with T > 90 K, with a measured TCR of  $1.7 \times 10^{-8}$  and  $7.7 \times 10^{-9} \Omega$  m K<sup>-1</sup> for x = 0.08 and 0.26, respectively, as determined from the slope of a linear fit between 100 and 295 K.

Increasing the O content further to x = 0.34 leads to an increase in the resistivity by over an order of magnitude, to  $6.9 \times 10^{-5} \Omega \text{ m}$  at 295 K and  $1.1 \times 10^{-4} \Omega \text{ m}$  at 5 K. Thus this sample exhibits a negative TCR, indicating a transition back towards insulating compositions. The resistivity of samples with x = 0.59 and 0.75 are too high to be measured with our experimental setup. Thus they are much more resistive, with an estimated lower bound for the resistivity:  $\rho > 10 \Omega \text{ m}$  for  $x \ge 0.59$ .

Figure 3(b) is a plot of the carrier concentration *n* and Hall mobility  $\mu_{\rm H}$  vs *x*, as determined from Hall effect measurements which indicate a linear dependency of the Hall voltage with applied magnetic field. The carrier concentration increases by nearly two orders of magnitude from 1.1 ×  $10^{20}$  cm<sup>-3</sup> for x = 0 to  $1.7 \times 10^{20}$ ,  $1.8 \times 10^{21}$ , and  $4.9 \times 10^{21}$  cm<sup>-3</sup> for x = 0.01, 0.08, and 0.26, respectively, followed by a slight decrease to  $4.0 \times 10^{21}$  cm<sup>-3</sup> for x = 0.34. The large plotted uncertainty for the last (x = 0.34) sample is due to unreliable electric contacts to this oxygen-rich sample, which resulted in a large thermal drift in the measured Hall voltage and also missing data points between 70 and 125 K in Fig. 3(a). The Hall mobility is 0.37 and 0.35 cm<sup>2</sup>/Vs for x = 0 and 0.01, increases to  $\mu_{\rm H} = 2.4$  cm<sup>2</sup>/Vs for x = 0.08, but then decreases again to  $\mu_{\rm H} = 1.7$  and 0.28 cm<sup>2</sup>/Vs for x = 0.26 and 0.34.

The relatively low  $\mu_{\rm H} = 0.37 \, {\rm cm}^2/{\rm Vs}$  for pure CrN is in reasonable agreement with previously reported [1] values of 0.16 and  $0.19 \,\mathrm{cm}^2/\mathrm{Vs}$  and is attributed to carrier localization [1,57] caused by the Mott-Hubbard interaction, which splits the filled and empty  $d_{t2g}$  bands below the valence band maximum and above the conduction band minimum, respectively, resulting in a *p*-to-*d* charge transfer band gap [2]. We note that the cause for carrier localization here is distinctly different from what has been reported for other transitionmetal nitrides where localization has been attributed to (1) complete charge depletion in the d bands causing a gap between hybridized p and d bands like for ScN [62],  $Sc_{1-x}Al_xN$ [63], and Ti<sub>1-x</sub>Mg<sub>x</sub>N [64], and (2) weak Anderson localization due to random arrangement of nitrogen vacancies in  $TaN_x$  [65,66], NbN<sub>x</sub> [67], and HfN<sub>x</sub> [68], or random cation site occupation in  $Sc_{1-x}Ti_xN$  [69] and  $Ti_{1-x}W_xN$  [70]. Our  $Cr_{1-x/2}N_{1-x}O_x(001)$  layer with x = 0.01 has a comparable room-temperature carrier concentration and mobility as the pure CrN layer, but the resistivity at 5 K is nearly two orders of magnitude lower, suggesting a decrease in localization. Increasing the O concentration further to reach x = 0.08and 0.26 results in a dramatic increase in both n and  $\mu_{\rm H}$ , suggesting a transition to metallic conduction in a highly degenerate semiconductor, as also evidenced by the positive TCR for x = 0.08 and 0.26. This is consistent with previous studies reporting increasing conduction with the substitutional replacement of N with O in CrN [36,37]. Simple electron counting suggests that substitutional O on an anion site in CrN provides an extra electron and therefore is expected to act as an *n*-type dopant. However, our samples also contain an increasing number of Cr vacancies with increasing x. Cr vacancies have been reported to cause *p*-type conduction in CrN [18] and are therefore expected to counteract the *n*-type doping by O. For example, the x = 0.01 sample contains  $5.5 \times$  $10^{20}$  cm<sup>-3</sup> O atoms and  $2.8 \times 10^{20}$  cm<sup>-3</sup> Cr vacancies which are expected to act as donors and acceptors, respectively. The difference of  $2.7 \times 10^{20}$  cm<sup>-3</sup> between the donor and acceptor density corresponds to the expected carrier concentration, which is in reasonable agreement with the measured n = $1.7 \times 10^{20}$  cm<sup>3</sup>. Similarly, x = 0.08 and 0.26 yield expected carrier concentrations of  $2.2 \times 10^{21}$  and  $7.2 \times 10^{21}$  cm<sup>-3</sup>, in good agreement with the measured  $n = 1.8 \times 10^{21}$  and  $4.9 \times$  $10^{21}$  cm<sup>-3</sup>. Thus the measured *n* in our samples with low O content (x = 0.01-0.26) is well explained by substitutional oxygen and Cr vacancies acting as compensating donors and acceptors, respectively. However, increasing x further to 0.34 results in a reduction in both n and  $\mu_{\rm H}$ , as well as an increase in  $\rho$  and a transition to a negative TCR, indicating a metal-insulator transition. This is consistent with a reported increase in resistivity with increasing O content [26,28,37,38] and is attributed to the increasing localization from O 2porbitals and potential fluctuations due to the random anion site occupation resulting in increasing electron correlation. Samples with x > 0.34 become increasingly more resistive with increasing x. We note that this cannot be explained by simple extrapolation of our chemical formula  $Cr_{1-x/2}N_{1-x}O_x$ to x = 1, which yields CrO<sub>2</sub> that is half-metallic with a relatively low room-temperature resistivity of  $2.5 \times 10^{-6} \,\Omega$  m [71]. In contrast, our XRD analyses for x = 0.59 indicate a single-phase epitaxial layer with a rocksalt-derived structure with some possible ordering on cation or anion sites, as discussed above. Thus the data indicates a transition to insulating properties without a structural phase transition with increasing  $x \leq 0.59$ . Nevertheless, increasing the oxygen content further to x = 0.75 results in a structure without a detectable XRD peak, suggesting an amorphous or nanocrystalline corundumlike structure, consistent with previous studies on  $CrN_{1-x}O_x$ films that report a transition to a  $Cr_2O_3$  structure at large x [20,21,26–28].

Figure 4 shows the results from our density-of-states calculations which provide further quantitative insight into the insulator-to-metal-to-insulator transitions. The DOS in Fig. 4(a) for pure CrN shows a double-peak feature associated with the hybridized N2*p*-Cr3*d*<sub>12g</sub> valence band between E = -8.0 and -0.5 eV and a band gap of 0.54 eV. The Fermi level  $E_f = 0$  eV is set to the bottom of the conduction band, and the *y* axis is the total DOS of the 64-atom unit cell including both spins, such that the integral of the plotted DOS for  $E < E_f$  is  $32 \times (6+3) = 288$ , corresponding to 32 N and 32 Cr atoms with six and three valence electrons, respectively. The plotted DOS as well as the band-gap value are in good agreement with previous studies [2], but we note



FIG. 4. Calculated density of states DOS vs energy *E* for (a) CrN, (b)–(d)  $Cr_{1-x/2}N_{1-x}O_x$  with x = 0.125, 0.25, and 0.5, respectively, and (e) the DOS near the Fermi level  $E_f (\pm 0.3 \text{ eV})$  vs *x* in  $CrN_{1-x}O_x$ ,  $Cr_{1-x/3}N_{1-x}O_x$ , and  $Cr_{1-x/2}N_{1-x}O_x$ . The three colors in (b)–(d) are from three separate calculations with different random cation and anion site occupations.

that particularly the band gap is a strong function of the chosen  $U = 3 \,\text{eV}$  and is also a function of the simulated phase, which is here the cubic AFM [011]<sub>2</sub> structure as discussed in Sec. II. Figures 4(b)-4(d) show the calculated DOS for  $Cr_{1-x/2}N_{1-x}O_x$  with x = 0.125, 0.25, and 0.5, respectively. The three differently colored symbols in each plot are from three simulated unit cells with different random placement of oxygen atoms on anion sites and Cr vacancies on cation sites, as described in Sec. II. Thus the three colors provide a quantitative measure of the variation in the DOS associated with the random site occupation. The DOS for x = 0.125 in Fig. 4(b) exhibits a double-peak feature from the conduction band and a drop to zero near  $E_f$ , similar to the DOS for CrN. However, the band gap is smaller, 0.16, 0.19, and 0.28 eV for the three configurations, yielding an average  $E_g = 0.21 \pm$ 0.05 eV. Increasing the oxygen content to x = 0.25 results in states near  $E_f$  such that the DOS remains finite for all three simulated supercells, as shown in Fig. 4(c), yielding a zero gap  $E_g = 0 \text{ eV}$ . However, increasing the oxygen content further to x = 0.5 opens again a gap of  $E_g = 0.39 \pm 0.06$  eV. In summary, the plotted DOS in Figs. 4(a)-4(d) show that

the calculated band gap of  $\operatorname{Cr}_{1-x/2}\operatorname{N}_{1-x}O_x$  decreases with increasing x < 0.25 but increases again for x > 0.25, in direct agreement with the measured insulator-to-metal and subsequent metal-to-insulator transitions.

Figure 4(e) is a plot of the DOS near  $E_f$  vs x in CrN<sub>1-x</sub>O<sub>x</sub>,  $Cr_{1-x/3}N_{1-x}O_x$ , and  $Cr_{1-x/2}N_{1-x}O_x$ . The values are obtained by averaging over the calculated DOS at  $E = E_f \pm 0.3 \,\text{eV}$ , where the  $\pm 0.3$ -eV interval was chosen sufficiently large to average over the strong DOS oscillations shown in Figs. 4(a)-4(d), which are characteristic of specific cation and anion site occupations. The plotted error bars in Fig. 4(e) correspond to the standard deviation from three different configurations, as shown as three colors in, e.g., Fig. 4(b). No error bar is given for x = 0, 0.03125, and 0.0625, because only one configuration was calculated for zero, one, or two oxygen atoms per supercell each. The three data sets each show a maximum in the  $DOS(E_f)$  at an intermediate oxygen content. The data most relevant to the experimental samples is for  $Cr_{1-x/2}N_{1-x}O_x$ , plotted as gray diamonds in Fig. 4(e). It exhibits a maximum at  $x = 0.25 \pm 0.05$ . This almost perfectly matches the composition x = 0.26 of the sample with the highest measured  $n = 4.9 \times 10^{21} \text{ cm}^{-3}$  and the lowest measured resistivity. Thus the calculated  $DOS(E_f)$  provides a semiquantitative explanation for the increase and subsequent decrease in the measured carrier concentration with increasing  $x \text{ in } Cr_{1-x/2}N_{1-x}O_x.$ 

### **IV. CONCLUSIONS**

Epitaxial  $Cr_{1-x/2}N_{1-x}O_x(001)$  layers were grown on MgO(001) substrates by reactive magnetron sputtering at 750 °C in a N<sub>2</sub> and Ar + O<sub>2</sub> atmosphere. Increasing  $p_{O2}$  from 0 to 0.3 mTorr results in films with O content x = 0-0.75 as determined by RBS and EBS. X-ray diffraction analyses indicate a rocksalt solid solution for  $x \le 0.59$  and

a decreasing lattice constant a = 0.4175 nm for pure CrN to a = 0.4116 nm for x = 0.59. This decrease is attributed to the presence of Cr vacancies, also detected by RBS/EBS measurements, and agrees well with the predicted lattice constants from density functional theory calculations. The decrease in the room-temperature resistivity from  $1.5 \times 10^{-3} \Omega m$  for x = 0 to  $1.4 \times 10^{-5} \Omega$  m for x = 0.08 and the change from a negative to a positive TCR indicate an insulator-to-metal transition at  $x = 0.04 \pm 0.03$ . This transition is accompanied by a substantial increase in *n* from  $1.1 \times 10^{20}$  cm<sup>-3</sup> for x = 0to  $1.8 \times 10^{21}$  cm<sup>-3</sup> for x = 0.08 and a sharp increase in  $\mu_{\rm H}$ from 0.37 to 2.4 cm<sup>2</sup>/Vs. These results suggest that substituting N with O on anion sites of CrN results in *n*-type doping which, however, is partially compensated by Cr vacancies that have a -1 charge and act as acceptors. This interpretation is consistent with density-of-states calculations which show that the band gap decreases and then vanishes with increasing x = 0.0-0.25. Increasing the oxygen content further to x =0.34 and beyond reverses the trend, resulting in an increase in  $\rho$ , a decrease in *n* and  $\mu_{\rm H}$ , a negative TCR, a decrease in the calculated DOS near  $E_f$ , and the opening of a band gap. This suggests a transition to insulating properties which are attributed to carrier localization and electron correlation effects that dominate at x = 0.34 and become much more pronounced as x is increased to 0.59. An even higher oxygen content causes a transition to a nanocrystalline or amorphous structure at x = 0.75.

#### ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The authors acknowledge financial support by the National Science Foundation under Grants No. 1712752, No. 1629230, and No. 1629239 and by the Sandia National Laboratories PO2022616. Computational resources were provided by the Center for Computational Innovations at RPI.

- [1] X. Y. Zhang, J. S. Chawla, B. M. Howe, and D. Gall, Phys. Rev. B 83, 165205 (2011).
- [2] A. Herwadkar and W. R. L. Lambrecht, Phys. Rev. B 79, 035125 (2009).
- [3] B. Alling, T. Marten, and I. A. Abrikosov, Phys. Rev. B 82, 184430 (2010).
- [4] I. Stockem, A. Bergman, A. Glensk, T. Hickel, F. Körmann, B. Grabowski, J. Neugebauer, and B. Alling, Phys. Rev. Lett. 121, 125902 (2018).
- [5] P. A. Anderson, R. J. Kinsey, S. M. Durbin, A. Markwitz, V. J. Kennedy, A. Asadov, W. Gao, and R. J. Reeves, J. Appl. Phys. 98, 043903 (2005).
- [6] A. Ney, R. Rajaram, S. S. P. Parkin, T. Kammermeier, and S. Dhar, Appl. Phys. Lett. 89, 112504 (2006).
- [7] A. Ney, R. Rajaram, S. S. P. Parkin, T. Kammermeier, and S. Dhar, Phys. Rev. B 76, 035205 (2007).
- [8] P. Panjan, B. Navinšek, A. Cvelbar, A. Zalar, and I. Milošev, Thin Solid Films 281–282, 298 (1996).
- [9] P. Hones, C. Zakri, P. E. Schmid, F. Lévy, and O. R. Shojaei, Appl. Phys. Lett. **76**, 3194 (2000).

- [10] I. Milošev, J. M. Abels, H.-H. Strehblow, B. Navinšek, and M. Metikoš-Hukovič, J. Vac. Sci. Technol. A, 14, 2527 (1996).
- [11] C. P. Mulligan and D. Gall, Surf. Coat. Technol. 200, 1495 (2005).
- [12] C. P. Mulligan, T. A. Blanchet, and D. Gall, Surf. Coat. Technol. 203, 584 (2008).
- [13] C. P. Mulligan, T. A. Blanchet, and D. Gall, Surf. Coat. Technol. 204, 1388 (2010).
- [14] C. X. Quintela, J. P. Podkaminer, M. N. Luckyanova, T. R. Paudel, E. L. Thies, D. A. Hillsberry, D. A. Tenne, E. Y. Tsymbal, G. Chen, C. B. Eom, and F. Rivadulla, Adv. Mater. 27, 3032 (2015).
- [15] C. X. Quintela, F. Rivadulla, and J. Rivas, Appl. Phys. Lett. 94, 152103 (2009).
- [16] P. Eklund, S. Kerdsongpanya, and B. Alling, J. Mater. Chem. C 4, 3905 (2016).
- [17] S. Kerdsongpanya, B. Sun, F. Eriksson, J. Jensen, J. Lu, Y. K. Koh, N. Van Nong, B. Balke, B. Alling, and P. Eklund, J. Appl. Phys. **120**, 215103 (2016).

- [18] A. le Febvrier, N. Van Nong, G. Abadias, and P. Eklund, Appl. Phys. Express 11, 051003 (2018).
- [19] C. X. Quintela, B. Rodríguez-González, and F. Rivadulla, Appl. Phys. Lett. 104, 022103 (2014).
- [20] L. Castaldi, D. Kurapov, A. Reiter, V. Shklover, P. Schwaller, and J. Patscheider, Surf. Coat. Technol. 203, 545 (2008).
- [21] K. Suzuki, T. Endo, A. Sato, T. Suzuki, T. Nakayama, H. Suematsu, and K. Niihara, Mater. Trans. 54, 1957 (2013).
- [22] J. Inoue, H. Asami, M. Hirai, T. Suzuki, H. Suematsu, W. Jiang, and K. Yatsui, IEEJ Trans. Fundamentals Materials 124, 496 (2004).
- [23] T. Suzuki, J. Inoue, H. Saito, M. Hirai, H. Suematsu, W. Jiang, and K. Yatsui, Thin Solid Films 515, 2161 (2006).
- [24] M. Urgen, V. Ezirmik, E. Senel, Z. Kahraman, and K. Kazmanli, Surf. Coat. Technol. 203, 2272 (2009).
- [25] K. Suzuki, T. Endo, T. Fukushima, A. Sato, T. Suzuki, T. Nakayama, H. Suematsu, and K. Niihara, Mater. Trans. 54, 1140 (2013).
- [26] L. Castaldi, D. Kurapov, A. Reiter, V. Shklover, and J. Patscheider, J. Appl. Phys. 109, 53720 (2011).
- [27] S. K. Rawal, A. K. Chawla, V. Chawla, R. Jayaganthan, and R. Chandra, Thin Solid Films 519, 7686 (2011).
- [28] R. Mientus, R. Grötschel, and K. Ellmer, Surf. Coat. Technol. 200, 341 (2005).
- [29] M. Schmid, G. Leonardelli, M. Sporn, E. Platzgummer, W. Hebenstreit, M. Pinczolits, and P. Varga, Phys. Rev. Lett. 82, 355 (1999).
- [30] A. Eichler and J. Hafner, Phys. Rev. B 62, 5163 (2000).
- [31] K. Suzuki, T. Suzuki, Y. Nakajima, Y. Matsui, H. Suematsu, T. Nakayama, and K. Niihara, APL Mater. 3, 96105 (2015).
- [32] X. S. Du, S. Hak, T. Hibma, O. C. Rogojanu, and B. Struth, J. Cryst. Growth 293, 228 (2006).
- [33] A. Maetaki and K. Kishi, Surf. Sci. 411, 35 (1998).
- [34] A. Maetaki, M. Yamamoto, H. Matsumoto, and K. Kishi, Surf. Sci. 445, 80 (2000).
- [35] M. E. McGahay and D. Gall, Appl. Phys. Lett. 114, 131602 (2019).
- [36] P. Tomeš, D. Logvinovich, J. Hejtmánek, M. H. Aguirre, and A. Weidenkaff, Acta Mater. 59, 1134 (2011).
- [37] S. Nagasawa, K. Suzuki, A. Sato, T. Suzuki, T. Nakayama, H. Suematsu, and K. Niihara, Jpn. J. Appl. Phys. 55, 02BC18 (2016).
- [38] R. Arvinte, J. Borges, R. E. Sousa, D. Munteanu, N. P. Barradas, E. Alves, F. Vaz, and L. Marques, Appl. Surf. Sci. 257, 9120 (2011).
- [39] R. Mientus and K. Ellmer, Surf. Coat. Technol. 116–119, 1093 (1999).
- [40] B. Wang, K. Aryana, J. T. Gaskins, P. E. Hopkins, S. V. Khare, and D. Gall, Adv. Funct. Mater. 30, 2001915 (2020).
- [41] J. P. Perdew, K. Burke, and M. Ernzerhof, Phys. Rev. Lett. 77, 3865 (1996).
- [42] G. Kresse and D. Joubert, Phys. Rev. B 59, 1758 (1999).
- [43] L. M. Corliss, N. Elliott, and J. M. Hastings, Phys. Rev. 117, 929 (1960).
- [44] A. Zunger, S. H. Wei, L. G. Ferreira, and J. E. Bernard, Phys. Rev. Lett. 65, 353 (1990).

- [45] F. Rivadulla, M. Bañobre-López, C. X. Quintela, A. Piñeiro, V. Pardo, D. Baldomir, M. A. López-Quintela, J. Rivas, C. A. Ramos, H. Salva, J.-S. Zhou, and J. B. Goodenough, Nat. Mater. 8, 947 (2009).
- [46] K. Balasubramanian, S. V. Khare, and D. Gall, Acta Mater. 152, 175 (2018).
- [47] K. Balasubramanian, S. V. Khare, and D. Gall, Acta Mater. 159, 77 (2018).
- [48] B. D. Ozsdolay, K. Balasubramanian, and D. Gall, J. Alloys Compd. 705, 631 (2017).
- [49] K. Balasubramanian, S. Khare, and D. Gall, Phys. Rev. B 94, 174111 (2016).
- [50] B. D. Ozsdolay, C. P. Mulligan, K. Balasubramanian, L. Huang, S. V. Khare, and D. Gall, Surf. Coat. Technol. **304**, 98 (2016).
- [51] J. B. Goodenough, Phys. Rev. B 5, 2764 (1972).
- [52] M. D. Banus, T. B. Reed, and A. J. Strauss, Phys. Rev. B 5, 2775 (1972).
- [53] F. Rivadulla, J. Fernández-Rossier, M. García-Hernández, M. A. López-Quintela, J. Rivas, and J. B. Goodenough, Phys. Rev. B 76, 205110 (2007).
- [54] D. Gall, C.-S. Shin, T. Spila, M. Odén, M. J. H. Senna, J. E. Greene, and I. Petrov, J. Appl. Phys. 91, 3589 (2002).
- [55] M. E. McGahay, B. Wang, J. Shi, and D. Gall, Phys. Rev. B 101, 205206 (2020).
- [56] See Supplemental Material at http://link.aps.org/supplemental/ 10.1103/PhysRevB.102.235102 for the 002 rocking curve plots.
- [57] X. Y. Zhang, J. S. Chawla, R. P. Deng, and D. Gall, Phys. Rev. B 84, 073101 (2011).
- [58] X. Y. Zhang and D. Gall, Phys. Rev. B 82, 045116 (2010).
- [59] D. Gall, C.-S. Shin, R. T. Haasch, I. Petrov, and J. E. Greene, J. Appl. Phys. 91, 5882 (2002).
- [60] K. Inumaru, K. Koyama, N. Imo-oka, and S. Yamanaka, Phys. Rev. B 75, 054416 (2007).
- [61] R. Sanjinés, O. Banakh, C. Rojas, P. E. Schmid, and F. Lévy, Thin Solid Films 420–421, 312 (2002).
- [62] R. Deng, B. D. Ozsdolay, P. Y. Zheng, S. V. Khare, and D. Gall, Phys. Rev. B 91, 045104 (2015).
- [63] R. Deng, P. Y. Zheng, and D. Gall, J. Appl. Phys. 118, 015706 (2015).
- [64] B. Wang, S. Kerdsongpanya, M. E. McGahay, E. Milosevic, P. Patsalas, and D. Gall, J. Vac. Sci. Technol. A 36, 061501 (2018).
- [65] C.-S. Shin, D. Gall, P. Desjardins, A. Vailionis, H. Kim, I. Petrov, J. E. Greene, and M. Odén, Appl. Phys. Lett. 75, 3808 (1999).
- [66] C.-S. Shin, D. Gall, Y.-W. Kim, P. Desjardins, I. Petrov, J. E. Greene, M. Odén, and L. Hultman, J. Appl. Phys. 90, 2879 (2001).
- [67] K. Zhang, K. Balasubramanian, B. D. Ozsdolay, C. P. Mulligan, S. V. Khare, W. T. Zheng, and D. Gall, Surf. Coat. Technol. 288, 105 (2016).
- [68] H.-S. Seo, T.-Y. Lee, I. Petrov, J. E. Greene, and D. Gall, J. Appl. Phys. 97, 083521 (2005).
- [69] D. Gall, I. Petrov, and J. E. Greene, J. Appl. Phys. 89, 401 (2001).
- [70] F. Tian, J. D'Arcy-Gall, T.-Y. Lee, M. Sardela, D. Gall, I. Petrov, and J. E. Greene, J. Vac. Sci. Technol. A 21, 140 (2003).
- [71] D. S. Rodbell, J. M. Lommel, and R. C. Devries, J. Phys. Soc. Jpn. 21, 2430 (1966).